CONTENTS

EDITORIAL
PACK, Sam: Editorial – From Visual Anthropology to the Anthropology of the Visual • 466

ARTICLES
SALVADOR-AMORES, Analyn: Marking Bodies, Tattooing Identities: Comparative Study on the Traditional Tattoos of the Kalinga, northern Luzon, Philippines and the Atayal of Taiwan • 473
PANÁKOVÁ, Jaroslava: The Grave Portraits and Ancestralization of the Dead (The Case of New Chaplino) • 505

ESSAY
PACK, Sam: K-popped: South Korean Media Exports in the Phillipines • 522

DISCUSSION
SOUKUP, Martin: Photography and Drawings in Anthropology • 534

INTERVIEW
BEŇUŠKOVÁ, Zuzana, JURISOVÁ, Daniela: Visions of Visual Ethnography (Interview with Prof. Dr. Naško Križnar) • 547

NEWS
BEŇUŠKOVÁ, Zuzana: Ethnology and social anthropology film festivals in Slovakia 2014: Etnofilm Čadca (14th–17th October 2014, Čadca), Film festival Folklore and Traditions (Hriňová 1st – 3rd May, 2014) • 562
VOLANSKÁ, Lubica: International conference Video documenting of the intangible cultural heritage and short videos for ICH research (25th – 26th September 2014, Slovene ethno graphic museum, Ljubljana) • 567

BOOK REVIEWS
MECHUROVÁ, Zdenka: Martin Soukup, Julie Hubeňáková: Nungon People of Uruwa. Drawings of Papua New Guinea • 572
Books published by the Institute of Ethnology of the Slovak Academy of Sciences (2013–2014) • 573

CONTENTS OF 62nd VOLUME • 577
Visual Anthropology is the area of anthropology that looks at the visual materials that cultures produce such as art, video and other visual objects as well as the documentation of culture through visual forms like film and photography. Because of this split of focus between visual representations of films, photographs, and visual productions by art, material culture, architecture, performance, etc., the definition of what visual anthropologists do has led to confusion within the field itself as it continues to struggle to find an identity that is defined by a single theory or method. Yet as visual signifiers become more prominent in media-saturated cultures, Visual Anthropology can provide the framework within which to explore cultural products and processes. Recent research in visual anthropology examines the idea that people learn how to “see” the world in specific ways. For example, people learn to understand that a map, which is not the world, is a scientific representation of space that they learn to understand as the world. This approach incorporates the ideas that seeing is cultural and that understanding images is actively constructive to an understanding of the world, and components within it such as reality, science and knowledge.

***

TRADITIONAL AREAS OF INQUIRY ART

Beginning with Boas’ *Primitive Art* (1927), formal elements in material culture and symbols were explored as central components to culture. Early studies such as Boas’ created a false dichotomy between the products of anthropological subjects (non-western, small-scale) that create artifacts, as opposed to western industrialized nations who created “art”. Incursions were made in the 1980s as attention was drawn to the construction of primitivism though both work in museology (for example the *Primitivism* exhibition at the Museum of Modern Art in 1984 and the *Art/Artifact* exhibition at the Museum for African Art in 1988, both in New York City) and anthropology. This led to a broader understanding of the role of art to socio-cultural identities, roles, hierarchies, communicative patterns, aesthetics and economics in the global world system. A move toward a critical analysis of art, technology and culture has revealed more nuanced approaches to recognizing artistic practices as an embodied act. More recently, the discussion has moved towards engaging the terrain between art history and anthropology to mine the possibilities of understanding cultural pro-
duction and reception through the co-construction of artistic works that engage anthropological content. Practitioners working between art and anthropology include Fiamma Montezemolo, Susan Hiller, John Wynne and Andrew Irving.

**PHOTOGRAPHY**

Photographs have occupied a central role in anthropological and ethnographic studies as evidence and are almost always provided as an illustrative technique to “show” aspects of the anthropological subject. They are one of the most pervasive examples of a visual media deployed in anthropological research. Margaret Mead’s *Balinese Character* (1942) marked an early attempt to implement photographs as primary text for conveying anthropological information. With the shift in the understanding of photography from positivist evidence, to subjective representation, early anthropological photographs were mined as products of ideological convention. Photo elicitation (using photographs as the means to get people to talk about culture and what they “see”) and home-mode photography (how everyday people used photography in their lives) were added to visual anthropology’s methods. These examples provided the earliest explorations into the use of photographs with anthropology. They set the stage for more investigative uses of the medium as a product of culture.

Laena Wilder, following social documentarian Jacob Riis, gives cameras to her subjects to generate an emic view (insider’s view) of the group, to draw attention to social problems and to transforms subjects into collaborators. These insider images, reflecting the home-mode, were extended to indigenous self-representations culminating in more contemporary explorations of photographic practice as seen in MacDougall’s 1991 film *Photo Wallahs*. This use of photography helped to provide a better understanding of the politics of representation (how people construct and how people expect to see particular cultural groups) including analyses of popular images of culture in media forms. These works represent a transformation in the use of photographs as cultural documents, objects that generate ideologies about culture, through their ability to present and represent cultural realities.

**ETHNOGRAPHIC FILM**

Ethnographic film has played a central role in the development and legitimization of Visual Anthropology as a subdiscipline. Yet the definition of ethnographic film has been debated and contested over the course of the last three decades. While film-makers such as Karl Heider contend that all films convey ethnographic information, others like Jay Ruby argue for the label to be restricted to only those films with anthropological intent and made by trained “card carrying” anthropologists. Largely ignored by both documentary filmmakers and cultural anthropologists, the nebulous terrain of ethnographic film has historically occupied a “no man’s land”. This is exacerbated by the fact that the best known ethnographic films are made by filmmakers with little or no anthropological training. For these reasons, Ruby has vociferously advocated the transition from ethnographic film (films about culture) to a filmic ethnography (films made with specific anthropological intent) (2000).

In spite of the continuing debate about the theoretical underpinnings and methods that constitute ethnographic film, a canon has emerged that focuses on documentary style films whose subjects include traditional anthropological subjects. This canon incorporated early documentary films of Robert Flaherty (*Nanook of the North*, 1922) and Edward Curtis (*In the Land of the War Canoes*, 1914). These examples led to a ca-
Nonfictional ethnographic film that established itself primarily through the vehicle of “observational cinema”. Ethnographic film here was assumed to be the objective and detached use of film as documentary evidence, and was implemented in “salvage ethnography”, the purported mission to visually capture and preserve tribal cultures before they disappeared forever.

The work of Jean Rouch and the influence of cinema vérité widened the dialogue to showcase ethno-fiction, in an attempt to draw attention to the highly constructed nature of film and the role of the camera and filmmaker in the production. Robert Gardener began to employ film as a research technique, emphasizing the importance of a filmic record to the ethnographic enterprise. Tim Asch’s legacy of pairing filmmakers with anthropologists to capture and create documents for conveying and studying culture influenced the corpus of recent ethnographic work. Asch’s work with John Marshall among the Dobe Ju’Hoansi, may be among the most frequently viewed ethnographic films.

Recent work in ethnographic film has become more reflexive, removing observational cinema techniques, voice-of-God narration in favor of more experimental filmmaking modes, often drawing from Jean Rouch and avant-garde cinema. Harvard University’s Sensory Ethnography Lab and the Granada Centre at Manchester University in the UK have produced many new works exploring a more phenomenological and reflexive approach to ethnographic film.

**INDIGENOUS MEDIA**

During the last three decades, a paradigmatic shift has occurred in the relationship between the filmer and the filmed. Popularly referred to as the “crisis of representation”, serious discussion has revolved around who has the responsibility and the legitimacy to represent others? In other words, *who has the right to represent whom?*

More specifically, who can represent whom, for what purposes, under what conditions, for which audiences, and, most importantly, in what ways do these representations matter to those who are being represented?

Ethnographic filmmakers had been grappling with these types of questions for years. Indeed, the “right to film” preceded the “right to write”. As a result, ethnographic film is no longer the sole domain of the white middle-class male. Other historically oppressed voices are striving for expression, and the opportunity now exists to learn from and engage with the ways in which “women/native/others” choose to represent themselves. Indeed, the emergence of indigenous media is inextricably bound to processes of decolonization and globalization.

As indigenous groups seize greater control of the visual media, they are invariably altering traditional anthropological representations of themselves and reconceptualizing the relationship between subject and object. One perspective advanced by Ruby, states that the development of indigenous media has meant that the era of the objectified film version of someone else’s reality has officially come to an end. He argues that indigenous media can be seen as evidence of the inadequacy of the dominant anthropological paradigm and as a challenge that must be met in the reformulation of ethnographic film. To survive, Ruby recommends that ethnographic filmmakers must find a new relationship to its subject, that may entail finding a new subject altogether (2000).

In contrast, Faye Ginsburg argues that indigenous media should not displace ethnographic film. She contends that the two can harmoniously co-exist as separate
and distinct entities. Ginsburg uses the metaphor of the “parallax effect” to describe the epistemologically positive impact that indigenous media can have on ethnographic film (1995). This parallax is created by the different perspectives in media practices that can potentially offer a clearer vision of the multiplicity of points of view through which culture is “produced, contested, mediated, and reimagined” (1995). Instead of displacing ethnographic film, indigenous media resituates it by calling attention to the presence of other perspectives.

The voices of indigenous peoples are a new and growing force in the collective imagination of anthropologists. Although Westerners may not expect such peoples to write anthropological monographs, they have done so and today also present us with visual texts made in film and video. This growing indigenous agency informs of various efforts by indigenous groups large and small, at self-portrayal and of the politics generated as a consequence.

These efforts born, in part, of collaboration between anthropologists and local societies as well as an independent effort of such activities in different societies, addresses the practice of producing videos for both internal and external consumption. By looking at this effort, we are forced to appreciate how different agendas for video production may arise in societies that have different world-views and social objectives. It also contributes to new alliances between indigenous societies separated by language, continental distances and differing nation state regimes. It also makes for new alliances between these Fourth World peoples and First World peoples, especially in domains of ecological and environmental concerns and the sharing of cultural products, primarily music.

NEW MEDIA

The advent of the Internet connects users from around the world by enabling instant communication with the click of a mouse. To be sure, technology has reduced the significance of physical distance. With millions of video producers and consumers, user generated web sites are re-shaping the way people engage with the media.

Thus far, anthropologists have been slow to seriously investigate what is perhaps one of the most pervasive cultural and technological practices of our time: Youtubification. Youtubification, a cultured technology spawned and sustained by the new media of the Web 2.0 revolution, refers to user-generated video content and its placement on the Internet site YouTube for communication and entertainment. With 2.5 billion videos viewed worldwide and hundreds of millions of hits per day, YouTube is more than just a technology for circulating images. It is an apparatus that is enabling users and groups to short-circuit the cultural and political categories that have been manufactured to contain and domesticate them, contest socio-economic marginalization, and provide alternate readings of historical and cultural narratives.

YouTube presents central ideas of selfhood, of identity, the recognition of social hierarchy, and of kinship structures, of statuses and power differentials in radically new ways. There are emerging translucent vocabularies of seeing, alongside didactic ways of seeing that are comprehensible to varied viewer consumer constituencies who are domesticators of this stimulus. It is important to understand how the web is used to mobilize, advertise, and congregate by these constituencies in the pursuit of common goals. Periscoping above national impenetrable walls of language and geography to engage in an exchange of ideas with outsiders, and engage in trade in products and services, the audio visual YouTube holds “power constituencies” account-
able in ways that are entirely unprecedented. Empowerment is not to be understood as being limited to access to political power and economic resources only, but must include the visibility garnered by formally invisible peoples. Indigenous authors and producers are increasingly offering their art, music, performances, and rituals to the public, and expecting that they will be appreciated as much as those produced by more mainstream media.

This exchange and communication occurs in novel ways. We must recognize the need for the acquisition of new technological skills, and develop new tools and methods for visual anthropologists who wish to study the various new societies and resources of the virtual worlds of the Internet and YouTube, especially the emergence of indigenous authors.

A second issue concerns already existing media. It is a matter of social justice that ethnographic recordings held in higher education institutions should be made available to the communities whose activities they preserve. With appropriate planning and care by researchers, digitization of research recordings in audiovisual media can facilitate access by remote communities to records of their own cultural heritage. Web 2.0 technology enables the opportunity to utilize digital representations of data to facilitate access by those recorded and their descendants in a way that was not previously possible with analog recordings. The hope is that such collaborations will serve as a model for others to follow, as more and more historically marginalized peoples are gaining the skills, technology, and need for a fuller understanding of their own past as well as a means to articulate their present and future.

***

This special issue of *Slovak Ethnology* offers a snapshot into current research practices in Visual Anthropology. What the contributions lack in breadth, they compensate for in depth. In particular, a common denominator underlying all of the articles is an emphasis on historically marginalized populations. Their voices – primarily from the periphery, from disadvantaged constituencies of power, and from the shadow of national and international spotlights – are now being heard more frequently and with greater clarity.

The first article by Analyn Salvador-Amores takes a comparative approach to traditional tattooing practices among indigenous groups in the Philippines and Taiwan. Although similarities abound between the two contexts in terms of motivations, tools, and designs, there are also significant differences particularly with regard to the resignification of tattoos. In the Philippines, there has been a recent appropriation of traditional tattoos by urban and diasporic Filipinos as a visible marker of ethnic and national identity. In Taiwan, however, tattoos continue to be socially stigmatized and it appears that this traditional art will become a relic of a forgotten past.

In her article, Jaroslava Panáková examines the phenomenon of ancestralization of the deceased through grave portraits in the Russian Beringia. She demonstrates how locals have invented their own modes of photography use and incorporated these into their traditional practices of mourning ceremonies. Significantly, both Panáková and Salvador-Amores reveal how visual forms can be adopted and adapted to existing as well as shifting cultural beliefs and practices. Both research articles are also based on long-term ethnographic fieldwork.

My own contribution to this special issue explores what has now been referred to
as the “Korean Wave” or “Hallyu” to describe the phenomenon by which South Korean media exports, such as cinematic films, television dramas, and popular music, are spreading throughout Asia and, increasingly, the world. After situating the Korean Wave in a historical context, I investigate sites of media reception in one particular Southeast Asian country, the Philippines, to determine how these messages are transmitted and interpreted by Filipino fans of K-Pop and Koreanovelas (as the soap operas are called there). There exists, however, a fundamental disconnect between the idealized images disseminated in the media and their everyday lived experiences. By examining how Filipino consumers negotiate these conflicting messages, my goal is to gain insights into the relationship between Koreans and Filipinos in the Philippines through the prism of Hallyu.

***

METHODS

Visual Anthropology’s methods were focused on media, employing film and photography in the service of illustrating ethnographic research. Sustained usage of images, such as Mead’s Balinese Character, explored the potential of meaning-making through images, focusing on an emerging use of photographs as primary-source data. Later critiques engaged documentary forms of filmmaking as constructivist rather than as positivist, opening up new areas of exploration in the subject of visual media as a cultural document. Using visual material as the source of cultural information, through an examination of visual forms, the methods of ethnographic research expanded, drawing from communication and cultural studies.

This issue concludes with a discussion by Martin Soukup on the methods of photography and drawing in anthropology. He employs a historical perspective to analyze the changes to these research tools used by anthropologists during fieldwork. Whereas the former has been accepted as an accurate record of ethnographic reality, the latter continues to be dismissed as subjective renderings. This discussion highlights the issue of verisimilitude—that is, as the representational quality increases, so does the appearance of “truth”. Not surprisingly, this representation is rooted in an unequal power relationship between the researcher and the researched.

In the interview with Slovenian filmmaker Naško Križnar the reader could find some really interesting thoughts and facts about the history of “visual ethnography” (this term indicates a difference between ethnographic film made by anthropologists and documentary film made by professional producers and filmmakers) and about some of the ethical problems which concerns making such kind of films. Križnar also points out some up-to-date problems of this field – the digital equipment and editing facilities are now accessible for almost everybody, so there is an enormous quantity of visual footage, documents and products of various quality, growing and needs some tools to use such databases systematically as a source of the deep anthropological knowledge.

***

The development of the discipline shifted the focus from the use of images and film as method, to understanding signs and pictures produced by cultures in order to understand how individuals and groups used visual objects as a means of communi-
cation, allowing for the broader analysis of the production and reception art, performance, architecture, photography, film and other forms of visual material culture as central to the subject of visual anthropology. This emphasis on the visual aspects of culture created an umbrella understanding of the experiential nature of culture and incorporated phenomenological approaches that created recognition of other ways culture is understood through the senses. Hopefully, the collection of articles in this special issue of Slovak Ethnology will instigate further research to continue the development of this burgeoning area of inquiry.

SAM PACK,
Kenyon College, Gambier,
Ohio, USA

REFERENCES

Curtis, E. (1914). In the Land of War Canoes. Seattle Film Company.
MARKING BODIES, TATTOOING IDENTITIES: COMPARATIVE STUDY ON THE TRADITIONAL TATTOOS OF THE KALINGA, NORTHERN LUZON, PHILIPPINES AND THE ATAYAL OF TAIWAN

ANALYN SALVADOR-AMORES

With combined methods of anthropological fieldwork and use of various sources (historical documents, archival photographs, and oral narratives), this exploratory paper is a comparative study of the practice of traditional tattooing between the indigenous groups in Kalinga, north Luzon Philippines, and the Atayal of Taiwan. Findings show that the two groups share the same cultural characteristics in terms of the rationale for getting tattoos, the methods, designs and others. But the difference in historical experiences between the two also determined the trajectories of tattooing practice in the contemporary context, the Kalinga with its revival and the Atayal on the decline.

Key words: Kalinga, northern Philippines; Atayal of Taiwan, traditional tattooing, facial tattoos, tattooing instruments

INTRODUCTION

Tattooing is a widespread practice in Southeast Asia and the Pacific, and has been one of the popular subjects of anthropological studies worldwide. Tattooing is also a pan-Austronesian and a Kuroshio tradition that has been widely practiced, but gradually lost through time. Only a few elders are left with these marks of identity. In this paper, I would like to address two interconnected questions: what are the similarities and differences of the traditional tattoos of the Kalinga in northern Luzon Philippines, and the Atayal indigenous group in Taiwan? Why do they tattoo? I will first discuss the linguistic and historical contexts of the Austronesian word for tattoo. Second, I will proceed on how these tattooing practices, based on a comparative analysis on the following frames of reference: (1) why they tattoo, or the rationale why these two indigenous groups tattoo their skin, (2) how they tattoo, or the technology, process and design of the tattoos, and, (3) how are the tattoos resignified in the contemporary context, including the current situation of tattooing practices among the Kalinga and the Atayal as a part of their ethnic identities. I will conclude
with the highlights of the comparisons, and recommend directions for research in the study of Kuroshio material culture in relation to tattoos.

It has been recognized that one of the similar practices that connect the Austronesian societies, aside from the similarities in agrarian economy, religious practices, political systems and, material culture, among others is the traditional practice of tattooing. Tattooing is a permanent form of bodily adornment and, had regional significance in the Kuroshio areas: the thread that connects the Philippines, Taiwan and Japan is tattoo. For this paper, I will examine the similarities and differences in tattooing practice between northern Luzon, Philippines and Taiwan. Due to time constraints, further investigation will be pursued in the future with the other indigenous groups who once practiced traditional tattooing in Taiwan, such as the Paiwan, Truku Saisayat and Seediq; and more importantly in Okinawa, Japan (Figure 1). A cross-cultural comparison of these indigenous groups will be useful in understanding the broader practice of traditional tattoos and tattooing. I have studied Kalinga tattooing since 2006, and moved on to compare this with Southeast Asian tattooing (2013b), and recently this paper on the Kuroshio connection.

The practice of tattooing also concerns the phenomenon of identity that it is not a static phenomenon, but a constant process. In this regard the concept of ethnic identities beyond the idea of groups is an unproblematic and a given concept. As such, it is not only about the categories made on what makes an ethnic identity, but also to include how these identities are constructed by including the analysis of those political, social, cultural and psychological processes through which these categories

Figure 1: A 1919 photograph of a young woman being tattooed with Okinawan hajichi (tattoo), a practice outlawed in 1899. (Source: Saito Takushi, Irezumi bokufu: Naze irezumi to i kiru ka,Yokohama: Shunpu sha, 2005:174).
are made. This approach contributes to the success and failure in the formation or crystallization of “groupness” or “identities” (Brubaker, 2004). As such, the everyday sense of identity strongly suggests that: “at least some self-sameness over time, some persistence, something that remains identical, the same, while other things are changing” (Ibid, p. 38). As this paper would elucidate in the succeeding section, the historical, political, social, cultural processes and contemporary developments of tattooing among the Kalinga and Atayal demonstrate that the notion of collective identities also change through time and are not static, but a continuing process.

To further elucidate Brubaker’s (2004) fluidity and diversity between ethnic groups in relation to their commonality and connectedness with tattoos, Mace and Pagel (1994) argued that cross-cultural comparison is a common method of testing hypotheses regarding the co-evolution of elements of cultures or the adaptability of a cultural practice (in this case, the tattooing) to some aspect of the environment. However, both posits, that although cross-cultural comparison has long been recognized, “that cultures are not independent but rather may share many cultural elements by virtue of common ancestry and proximity” (p. 549). In the case of the Philippines and Taiwan, they share an Austronesian origin and, geographical proximity (Figure 2); as such tattooing practices have similarities, but with varying trajectories. Further, the most common way of analyzing comparative data is to correlate two or more elements across a group of cultures.

The historical patterns of relatedness among societies mean that they cannot be assumed to have evolved or acquired their particular characteristics independently.
Therefore a cross-cultural association between two or more elements of culture does not necessarily indicate that the two elements tend to evolve or to be acquired together. They may both have been acquired for unrelated reasons in an older or ancestral culture and then subsequently transmitted to many later descendant cultures” (p. 550).

Furthermore, comparative anthropology examines the contrasts on how the different groups organize their lives, think about and experience both themselves and the world around them. In my approach in the study of the tattoos of the Kalinga and the Atayal, both have shared culture-specific attributes that further allow examination by comparison. In this paper, I outline the reference for comparative analysis as a result of knowledge of the social life of these two groups through long-term anthropological field research in Kalinga from 2008–2011 (see Salvador-Amores, 2008, 2011, 2013a), and recent preliminary research in Taiwan last April 2014. Both groups manifest an enormous complexity, but scope and limitation are employed for a more focused analysis. The research gaps can be addressed through further investigations.

A limitation for this study is on the literature on tattooing in Taiwan, where most of the articles were written in Mandarin and Japanese in the early 1900s. I was only able to access journal articles written or translated in English online and, from other libraries in different universities in Taiwan. Because of my inability to read Chinese, I have not been able to use these references for this paper, but only archival photographs relevant in the analysis. Most of the sources that I have gathered are from oral interviews of key informants during my preliminary research in Hualien, Taitung, and Hsinchu in Taiwan. Further study should be warranted for an in-depth research on indigenous tattooing in Taiwan.

This preliminary paper is the first to explore the similarities and differences of Kalinga and Atayal tattooing as a visible and material expression of culture and identity. This paper draws on a wide range of sources from archival records, colonial photographs, documentary and lexical data, oral narratives and ethnographic reports in order to illuminate the content and context of tattooing amongst the Kalinga and the Atayal. Understanding the practice will provide relations on the broader connection of tattooing practice in the Kuroshio context.

REMEMBERING ORIGINS:
LINGUISTIC RELATIONS OF THE WORD TATTOO

To understand the linguistic relations of the word ‘tattoo’ between the Atayal and the Kalinga, a brief overview of its origins is important. There are several hypotheses on the origins of the indigenous peoples in the Philippines and Taiwan. These hypotheses may also have some bearing on the word tattoo and the practice of tattooing. First, is the southern origin hypothesis that the people migrated from the Philippines or Malaysia (mainland Southeast Asia) (Stainton, 1999: 29–32, see also Greenhill et al, 2010). Second, the northern origin hypothesis, that the people migrated to Taiwan from the area that is now southern China, is used to show the connections between Taiwan and China as the motherland (Ibid: 32–37). Finally, the Austronesian homeland hypothesis is that Taiwan was the place of origin of the Austronesian languages. This hypothesis is a refinement of the northern origin hypothesis suggesting early Neolithic migrations from continental Asia followed by independent deve-
velopment in Taiwan. This theory places Taiwan at the center and links indigenous identity with Taiwan identity (Ibid: 37-41).

Current evidence and academic discourse gives greatest support to the Austronesian homeland hypothesis. This is based on the analysis of linguistic and archaeological evidence from Taiwan and the many islands of the Philippines, Indian and Pacific oceans where Austronesian-speaking peoples are found (Bellwood, 2009). The idea of Austronesian is primarily a linguistic one. Bellwood’s hypothesis is largely based on the linguistic view of Blust (1995) and supported by archaeological evidence (Paz, 1999: 151–152). For instance, the presence of prolific nephrite workshops in the Batanes, northernmost island in the Philippines is compelling evidence of a well-established relationship between Taiwan and the Philippines and, clearly demonstrates the movement of materials out of Taiwan (Blundell, 2011). Furthermore, in 2005, a team of researchers from Victoria University in New Zealand employed the combined use of DNA, radiocarbon and computer simulations to calculate the movement of Austronesians. The findings show that the Austronesian-speaking people left Taiwan around 5,000 years ago, travelling to the Philippines, Indonesia, and islands such as Papua New Guinea and reaching parts of Polynesia around 2.5 thousand years ago and New Zealand around 700 years ago (Harrington, 2005 cf. Johnson et al 2009). This is further supported by a lexical data from a study conducted by Greenhill et al., (2010:1):

“A pulse-pause scenario of Pacific settlement in which the Austronesian speakers originated in Taiwan around 5,200 years ago and rapidly spread through the Pacific in a series of expansion pulses and settlement pauses. We claimed that there was high congruence between traditional language subgroups and those observed in the language phylogenies, and that the estimated age of the Austronesian expansion at 5,200 years ago was consistent with the archaeological evidence.”

Languages are good markers of cultural groups (Mace & Pagel, 1994), as the Austronesian peoples spread throughout the Pacific, the languages they spoke diversified into one of the largest language families (Figure 3) in the world containing around 1,000–1,200 languages (Blust, 2009). It can be assumed that the words used for tattoos have links as well.

In relation to the practice of tattooing, the earliest account of tattooing in Formosa (now Taiwan) was given in the History of the Sui Dynasty in the 7th century (Krutak, 2005). In another account, the origin of tattooing in Taiwan can be traced back from 1,400 years ago (Council of Aboriginal Affairs in Taiwan). In the Philip-
In the Philippines, tattooing was prevalent during the pre-hispanic period and practiced widely in the early 16th century (Van Dinter, 2005: 85). *Batok* or *batuk* is the general term for traditional tattoos in the Philippines, and *batek* or *batok* in Kalinga specifically. Known, too, as *patik* in some areas, this refers to the markings of snakes or lizards or any design painted or printed on the skin (Scott, 1974: 20). *Batuk* or *batek* has an Austronesian origin (Blust, 1970: 118; 1995: 495) from the word *beCik* (*betik*) (Kelabit). The word is also present in other Austronesian languages such as the Proto-Atayalic or Paiwan *vitsik* (*vitsiq*), which means ‘tattoo’ (Blust, 1970: 118, 146). Among the Paiwan, the word is pronounced as *venchik*, and the word for tattoo among the Atayal is *ptasan* (also *patasan, pòtasan*).

**Table 1: Austronesian terms used for the word tattoo.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Version</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>batik</td>
<td>PWMP</td>
<td><em>batik</em>, make a design; tattoo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>batek</td>
<td>PMP</td>
<td><em>batek</em>, mottled design, as of a tattoo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>beCik</td>
<td>PAN</td>
<td><em>beCik</em>, tattoo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAN b&lt;in&gt;etik</td>
<td>WMP CMP</td>
<td><em>betik</em> (Formosan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMP</td>
<td><em>betik</em></td>
<td>tattoo</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: *Austronesian Comparative Dictionary* (Robert Blust).

In reference to the permanent adornment on the body, tattoos are variously referred to as *batôk* (in Kalinga, or *whatok* among the Butbut people), *fatek* (Bontoc), *batok* (Ilongo), *batek* (Ilocano, Lepanto, and Sagada Igorots), and *bátek* (Kankanaey and Ibaloy) in northern Luzon, Philippines. All these terms derive from the sound of the tapping of the stick on the tattoo instrument to pierce the skin. Similarly, the main tattoo instrument used by the Atayal in piercing the skin is *atok* (*排針*). The word *tek* (*tik*) means, “to hit slowly.” It has been suggested that the morpheme *tik* connotes “marking with spots or dots, giving an identifying mark” (Larsen, 1976: 77). The Filipino equivalent of *tik*, which is *tak*, as in *tatak*, means, “imprint, stamp, seal, trademark, and identifying mark” (Casiño, 1981: 133). In addition, an important point here is that all of these peoples were speakers of Austronesian languages and, part of a broad Austronesian cultural tradition, hence, the ancestral underlying affinities between Polynesian, Luzon (for that matter), and Taiwanese tattooing.

**KALINGA AND THE ATAYAL AS TATTOOED PEOPLE**

In this section, I would like to give a brief background of the Kalinga and the Atayal in relation to their tattoos as a form of identity. To understand their identity, is to understand how the historical contexts, social experiences and origins that have shaped these identities following Brubaker’s (2004) concept of that identities are not fixed,
but are fluid. The Kalinga is one of the sixteen ethno-linguistic groups found in the Gran Cordillera, north Luzon Philippines, and renowned for their intricate and symmetrical tattoos. While the Atayal is one of the sixteen officially recognized indigenous groups found in Taiwan, and renowned for their facial tattoos. Both present a particularly rich opportunity for an in-depth study on their tattooing practices.

**Kalinga**

Kalinga is part of a collective social identity encompassed by the term “Igorot” which is derived from the ancient Tagalog word *golot* meaning “mountain range.” The collective term is used to refer to the Filipinos born in the northern Cordillera region, comprising several ethno linguistic groups, who have inhabited the Cordillera region for at least five centuries and probably much longer. Scott (1974) notes that the term *Igorot* is not very accurate and that people in the area are more aptly referred to by the names of six ethno linguistic groups found in the Gran Cordillera (Figure 4): the Kalinga, Ifugao, Bontoc, Isneg (Apayao), Kankanaey, and Ibaloy (Benguet). Of these six groups, the Kalinga are renowned for the intricacy of their tattoos, elaborate and symmetrical tattoos compared to their neighbors, the Ifugao (which is figurative) and Bontoc (geometric). There are other Cordillera groups who have tattoos such as the Ibaloy as evidenced by the tattooed mummies in Benguet, but the practice had long been extinct.

The Kalinga as an ethnic group caught the attention of the American colonial peri-
od, and widely depicted in colonial writings and photographs as “the ferocious head-hunters that made incursions to different places and returned home with the heads they had cut off” (Billiet & Lambrecht, 1974: 18). During this time, the Kalinga were known for their ferocity as warriors, and tattooing was associated with the practice. I have argued in another paper (Salvador-Amores, 2002, 2013a), that the Kalinga tattoo their bodies for various reasons, primarily as painful rites of passage, personal adornments, and to denote religious and political significance. With the advent of Christianity and education, Kalinga tattooing lost its meaning and significance, however tattooing has been recently resignified in a Kalinga village because of the popularity of “authentic” and “tribal tattoos” being sought in the mainstream.

The traditional tattooing practice that I have studied belongs to an ethno linguistic group called the Butbut of the municipality of Tinglayan, south of the Kalinga region in Northern Philippines. More than fifty groups comprise the Kalinga (Delos Reyes & Delos Reyes 1986: 164–67), but lowland Filipinos are generally unfamiliar with the Butbut as inhabitants of the province. Butbut settlement patterns are characterized by clusters of houses within small hamlets consisting of thirty or more houses, which may be considered small towns, otherwise known as barangay. The settlements are located in deep canyons or in small terraced areas on slopes of steep mountain sides. Butbut land rises from the banks of the Chico River. North of the river are the mountain areas on whose slopes are found four of the five Butbut villages: Buscalan, Loccong, Ngibat, and Butbut proper. The fifth, Bugnay, is on a southern slope. These villages have a population of about 3,083 (NSO Census 2008), distributed in households that range from 55 to over 130 per village on 72.88 square meters area (Cordillera Administrative Development Council map 2000). There was a slight decrease in the 1990s to 2000 due to the emigration of residents to Tabuk, Kalinga’s capital, to look for work.

Today, the popularity of traditional tattoos is renown because of the presence of Whang-ud, the 90-year old female tattoo practitioner in Butbut. Like any other villages in the Philippines – they are exposed to external influences and market forces that affect their traditional lifestyles. During the 1980s and 1990s, the Butbut population greatly increased (as also did migration in search of wage work) and traditional activities such as tattooing, pottery making, weaving, and basketry changed. Today, the area is a popular destination for tourists seeking to be tattooed with traditional tattoos by Whang-ud. The local tourism office in Tinglayan is now promoting the village of Buscalan as a destination for those seeking batok (tattoos), in addition to products, such as kape (coffee) and unoy (native rice). Tattooing has recently reemerged as an alternative livelihood to the traditional agricultural industry of the village.

Atayal

In Taiwan the indigenous peoples are officially called yuanzhumin. They traced back a cultural heritage of more than 6,000 years ago to the beginning of the Neolithic period (Reid, 2010: 1). The Qing Dynasty excluded the “mountain peoples” by labeling them as “raw barbarians” (shengfan) on maps and forbidding Han Chinese from contact with them (Simon 2004, 2005). They were initially called the shanbao (mountain compatriots) or hoan-a (savages), which indigenous peoples considered as offensive even until now. The 1993 constitutional amendments replaced the word with yuanzhumin (aborigine or indigenous people).
Historically, Taiwan was ceded to Japan in 1895. Taiwan’s indigenous peoples were categorized according to a “nine tribes” model based on studies by Japanese anthropologists in the late 19th and early 20th centuries (Wang, 2008; Lin, 2007). This model has been abandoned since 2000, and currently there are now sixteen officially recognized groups: Amis, Atayal, Bunun, Hla’alua, Kanakanavu, Kavalan, Paiwan, Puyuma, Rukai, Sasiyat, Tao, Thao, Tsou, Truku, Sakizaya, and Seediq (Figure 5). Each of these groups have distinct languages, culture and customs. The indigenous population is 490,000 which makes up to two percent of Taiwan’s population (Council of Indigenous Peoples, 2007).

In the past, at least seven of the Taiwan’s indigenous groups practiced tattooing, such as the Atayal, Truku, Saisayat, Paiwan, Rukai, Puyuma and Tsou. However, today of the sixteen recognized indigenous groups in Taiwan, only five have some of the remaining elders with tattoos such as the Atayal, Truku, Seediq, Paiwan, and Saisayat. The Atayal, Truku, and Seediq had facial tattoos; the Saisayat wore facial tattoos inherited from the neighboring Atayal as well as unique chest tattoos for accomplished hunters for the men (Blundell, 2011). The Paiwan have tattoos on the back of the hands for women, and on the arms and chests for men. However, the practice lost its meaning and was gradually lost with the coming of the Dutch, the Han Chinese and later the Japanese in the 17th century.

For this paper, I will focus on the Atayal, the second largest indigenous groups in Taiwan, and found in the mountainous areas of northern Taiwan. The people are also known as Tayal or Daiyan, from the word in their own language for people. The Atayal were one of the “nine tribes”, although this model of categorization was abandoned in Taiwan following the government’s official recognition of five more indigenous groups between 2001 and 2008. In 1911, the Japanese colonial government officially named this group the Atayal. Because the Atayal were distributed widely and many groups had different accents and customs, Japanese scholars divided the Atayal into several sub-groups (Wang, 2008: 7). For instance, the Truku and Seediq were formerly classified as part of the Atayal group (Figure 6). In January 14, 2004, the Truku were recognized as a separate ethnic group (Ru, 2010: 80) because of the differences in language, culture, garments, including the facial tattoos (see Truku Name Rectification Campaign of 2003). Before the date, the Truku was categorized as a subgroup of the Seediq under the Atayal (Ibid). Then in 2008 the Seediq also gained official recognition. Hence many references to Atayal in the literature from the twentieth century may also include the Truku and Seediq groups. All these groups can be considered to share some characteristics (Hsieh, 1994: 186) and they all speak Atayalic languages.
The Atayal population is 75,751 (Council of Indigenous Peoples, 2006). The Atayal traditionally live in the mountainous areas of Nantou, Taichung, Miaoli, Hsinchu, Taoyuan, Taipei, Yilan and Hualien counties. Hunting and farming are their traditional life style. The Atayal practiced swidden agriculture growing millet, dry rice, beans and root crops. They also added to their diet by hunting and fishing. Millet was not only a staple part of their diet but had religious and cultural significance (Kaneko, 2009: 249–250). Their fabric weaving skill feature sophisticated patterns and designs. Red color symbolizes blood, which is vital and can keep the evil spirits away from them. Therefore, the Atayal people prefer to dress in red. Ancestral worship groups constitute the major social organization and a prominent religious ceremony (Council of Indigenous Peoples, 2009 cf. Lee 2009: 157). Today, many Atayal may have moved temporarily or permanently to major urban areas for work or education. How this has affected Atayal identity is a topic that needs further research.

The tattooed groups in Taiwan were known as “warrior groups” (Simon, 2012), like that of the renown Kalinga, Bontoc and Ifugao of northern Luzon, Philippines. Notably, all ethnic groups in Taiwan were headhunters (except for the Yami) and headhunting profoundly contributed to the cultural and physical boundaries. Headhunting is part of the ‘Austronesian complex’ of warriors (Desveaux, 1996: 145). In particular, the Japanese anthropologist, Yasaburo wrote that: “the Atayal live in mountain recesses, are extremely ferocious and attach great importance to headhunting” (Takekoshi, 1907: 219 cited from Simon 2012: 170). There were feuds and hostilities between villages (sometimes even of the same cultural and language group) where frequent conflicts were mostly settled by revenge or negotiation with compensation (Chiang, 2000; Simon, 2002, 2006). While Taiwan displays a mosaic of ethno-linguistic groups mostly of Austronesian origins, it is the *ptasan* (tattoo) that makes these groups distinct from each other.

The *ptasan* follows the core belief of the Atayal called the *gaga*. This is a set of rituals and prohibitions inherited from the ancestors and held by the elders within patrilineal clan groups. The clan group that shares the same rituals and prohibitions is known as the *qotux gaga* (Kaneko, 2009: 252). The *gaga* is an all-embracing concept for the Atayal and it regulates almost all aspects of Atayal affairs (Yabu, 2009: 70) including the practice of tattooing, which I will discuss later in this paper.

Today, among the Atayal and other indigenous groups in Taiwan assert their culture and identity for recognition under the state, and are undergoing a recent revival of their culture through festivals and performance of rituals in their own locales. In relation to tattooing practice however, the status of tattooing dramatically declined among the indigenous groups ever since this was outlawed during the Japanese period. Those who have the facial tattoos are elderly men and women between the ages
of 80 to 110 years old. Kimi Sibal (Kuei-Shi Tien), an Atayal who lives in Hualien earlier documented the facial tattoos of aboriginal groups since 1994 and said that, “there were more than 300 old men and women with tattoos twenty years ago, many passed away, and their memories are documented through my photographs.” In a recent interview with Kimi last April 2014 in Hualien, he said that only five elderly women are left with their facial tattoos and are now in their twilight years. The oldest, Wu Lan Mei who was 110 years old from the Miaoli county passed away in 2008.

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE BATOK AND PTA SAN

The rationale for the comparison of the tattoos between the batok of the Kalinga and the ptasan of the Atayal are due to the broad connection of tattooing, more specifically: (1) there is a recent revival of the tattoos in Kalinga where urban and diasporic Filipinos get their tattoo in a remote village in Kalinga, in contrast to the decline of tattooing among the Atayal of Taiwan whose only four surviving elders are the last remnants of a once held collective practice, hence the expediency of the subject under study is urgent most especially for the latter case; (2) the presence of a female tattoo practitioner in Kalinga which is a rare case in a specialized tattooing activity only accorded to the men in the past; while most of the tattoo practitioners among the Atayal were women such as the grandmothers and maternal aunts;¹ and (3) the similarities of the tattoo methods which both employ the hand-tapping technique for the Kalinga, and a combined method of hand-tapping and hand-poking technique among the Atayal. Further, how these tattoos are resignified in the contemporary context, specifically on how the tattoos are perceived and the meanings attached to these tattoos in terms of individual or collective identities will be examined.

1. Why Tattoo?

As a bodily aesthetic, tattoos act as painful reminders of rites of passage. For the Kalinga, the approximate age of the women when they were tattooed was between the ages of thirteen to fifteen years old, just right before or right after their menstruation, clearly the tattoos were done when they reach puberty, and largely dependent on their tolerance for pain. The Kalinga young women would have X-marks or // parallel lines tattooed on the cheeks and forehead. This practice is in contrast with the Atayal, where tattooing of lines on the forehead begins at the age of five as identity markers, while most of the tattoo practitioners among the Atayal were women such as the grandmothers and maternal aunts;¹ and the more elaborate facial tattoos on the cheeks were done when they reach the age of fifteen as a symbol of adulthood. The tattoos symbolized “chastity, weaving ability and duty” (Johnson et al, 2009: 5).

When the Kalinga women reach the puberty age, they were tattooed on both arms, below the neck and the hands depending on their tolerance for pain, and the ability of the family to pay the fee of a tattoo practitioner. The affluent members (kadan-gyan) in Kalinga society were encouraged to get tattoos to visually demonstrate their social status, while the other members of the society would remedy other means, so as not to be ostracized as chinuyas (“person without tattoo”) in the community. In other words, the tattoo was an equalizing factor for everyone. Once tattooed, a wo-

¹ In Okinawa, Japan the hajichi (tattoo) was an exclusive activity of the women prior to 1800s.
man was considered of marriageable age. The Kalinga also believed that tattoos were for fertility for the women and virility for the men.

For the Kalinga men, they are tattooed on the face, arms, chest, and back through time. They earn their tattoos after a headhunting prowess, wherein the incentives to join the headhunting expedition were to assert masculinity or emerge ritually to manhood (Simon, 2012: 169). Headhunting was often the prerequisite to marriage (Hoskins, 1996: 18, Rosaldo, 1983: 46), thus it met the basic needs for reproductive success (Simon, 2012: 169). Headhunting is only one of the many reasons why the Kalinga people get a tattoo: aside from bodily aesthetics, it is also a form of identity, becoming a person, for healing, protection from malevolent spirits, fortitude, religious and political significance, rites of passage, status marker among others. Young people were integrated into the adult community and socially recognized as being ready to take an adult role – ready to marry, bear children and carry responsibility for other forms of social relation in society.

This is also true for the Atayal; the women had more elaborate tattoos made on the cheeks and on the chin as a sign for excellent skills in weaving (Figure 7, colour appendix). The ability to weave was once the major index of maturity for girls. According to Nettleship (1971), there was a specific ritual for weaving when young women reach puberty:

“Their puberty rite included a weaving dance in which the girl demonstrated her skill at the loom while her female kindred danced around her. The steady resonant boom made by the hollow-log forming the main loom beam as fill threads were correctly beaten home provided the rhythm for the dance. After the performance the girl received her facial tattoos and could be married. The quantities of almost entirely hand-woven fabric and items made from them were included in the exchange of goods marking a marriage. The cloth was woven by the bride and/or her female kindred” (p. 70).

Furthermore, Nettleship (1978: 184) assumed there were two interrelated considerations that brought prestige to a weaver: one was that the technical and aesthetic qualities of a good work would be complimented; the other was that a skilled weaver would be admired by members of her weaving work group and likely become a group leader. Women who were expert at weaving were called kneril bale (it means intelligent people) whereas ones who were not good at weaving were called putut, it means foolish people (Papa, 1986: x). Atayals without tattoos were regarded like monkeys and not real persons, and no one would like to marry a woman who does not have a tattooed face. In addition, the more elaborate tattoos were also a means of testing chastity (Johnson et al, 2009: 5):

“The belief being that a promiscuous female would not survive the tattooing process. In order to earn the right to be tattooed, and therefore also the right to take a partner and create their own family, males had to prove their expertise in hunting and in battle.”

Aside from this, Atayal women also exerted considerable authority as shamans and healers in the community, as well as becoming tattoo practitioners passed on from one generation to the next. While women weave, there were strict taboos on
men touching the instruments of weaving, which were thought to bring bad luck. Men hunt, with strict taboos on women touching their hunting implements (Blundell, 2001: 28).

On the other hand, the Atayal men had a more fine-lined tattoo made on the forehead and chin because of prowess in hunting and warfare. Traditionally, the facial tattoos symbolized honor for those men who have hunted enemy heads; it represents bravery. Men who were particularly successful at headhunting were given special tattoos on their chests, feet and foreheads. According to Kimi Sibal, he said that in the past, it is important to note that the Atayal had conflicts among their neighboring groups due to incessant headhunting, and killing their own tribesmen. In order not to repeat this mistake, the men had facial tattoos as a means of identification from the other groups. The *ptasan* determined the way that the Atayal interacted with the other people – either their friends or enemies.

Tattoos were a symbol of transition from childhood into adulthood for both males and females, however, not everybody can get tattoos. It was necessary to obtain the approval of all community members in order to receive the tattoo. The Atayal men with better skills or more experienced in such vital activities as hunting and warfare wielded influence in the communities. A similar case to that of the Kalinga where they build their social and political roles as *pangat* (tribal leaders or peace pact holders) through experience, and the tattoos accorded to them.

Being tattooed marked coming of age and, once men or women received tattoos they were able to marry. The tattoos also symbolized recognition by the community that a person was a true Atayal, or a *taku* (person) for the Kalinga. For the Atayal the *gaga* refers to norms, regulations and ritual prescriptions, a person’s identity or good luck, the words were spoken to *lyutux* (‘ancestor spirits’) (Wang, 2008: 26). The Atayal facial tattoos for the women represent “*gaga* on the face” and the diamond pattern represents the ancestral spirits. They are a bridge for communication between humans and the ancestral spirits (Yabu, 2009: 154-162), as such the tattoos were deemed important. For instance, according to Kimi Sibal (2011: 3):

“The Atayal believes that if a tribesman reaches adolescence but does not have a facial tattoo, he will bring disaster to the tribe and will be regarded as ominous.”

From this, the Atayal tradition demonstrates pressure and expectation on the Atayal who had no choice, but to accept facial tattoos, because “a person can be barren or bring disaster to the family, incur rage and curse among the tribal peoples and be expelled from the tribe” (Ibid, p. 4). The same pressure was held among the Kalinga women, they were teased and rubbed with saliva on their arms by young men. According to them, young women without tattoos suffered social stigma and were taunted by their peers who called them *chinuyas* (‘a person without tattoos’). Many of the elder women say that they were extremely hurt by this. It was even more painful than the physical pain experienced in the process of getting tattooed. As such, many people opted to endure the process until the tattoos were complete.

The tattoos also have a bearing on death. For the many tattooed Butbut elders, tattoos are valued over ephemeral material possessions. These, they believe are the only things they truly own even in death and the afterlife. “It is only the *batok* that is buried with us”, they say. “That is the only thing that we inherit from our ancestors.” In the *jugkao*, they say, is a place where “equally tattooed ancestors live. When peo-
ple die, they are recognized with the tattoos on the body.” They explained that, “the tattoos makes one worthy to live with the deceased ancestors in the jugkao”. According to the elders, the alichug-wa (soul) unites the body (longag) to become a full person (taku). When the alichug’wa is taken away, the taku (person) is lost and the soul becomes a displeased ayan (spirit). The ayan causes illnesses and misfortunes to the family or the community. Hence, it is important to have the batok for the Kalinga to enter the jugkao.

In the same way that the Atayal believe that humans have an immortal spirit known as the utux. After death the utux leaves the body and sets out on a journey. The journey ends at the rainbow bridge (hogo utux) where the ancestral utux are waiting at the other end. The utux was requested to provide proof that they had lived according to the gaga, making them a true Atayal. For a man this means being a brave headhunter, for a women a skilled weaver. The Atayal people believe that the tattooed face is the only way to maintain their identity, and allow their spirits to be recognized after death. In those days, being a leading weaver was the sure way for an Atayal woman to cross the rainbow bridge, along with the headhunters, to a better life in the otherworld after death. An Atayal person without tattoos is said to wonder in toil to get into the spirit world.

To summarize, tattoos for both cultures are for (a) bodily aesthetics, i.e. the tattoos were their permanent markers of beauty; (2) rites of passage – tattoos were a symbol of transition from childhood to adulthood reflective of the assumption of social roles in the society; (3) tattoos act as talismans or protection from malevolent spirits; (4) tattoos as markers of identity and status; (5) tattoos as a form of connecting to the ancestral spirits; and (6) a means of equalizing factor and social control for community cohesion and as a (7) passage to the afterlife.

2. Tattoo Practitioners

This section deals with the practice of tattooing itself, how does one become a tattoo practitioner and how they acquire their skill. I will use the term “tattoo practitioner” rather than “tattoo artist” to refer to the local people involved in the creation of bodily tattoos (for further discussion see Salvador-Amores, 2013a: 68–69).

Among the Butbut in Kalinga, tattooing was a specialist activity of the men, as well as among the Ifugao and, Bontoc of the Cordillera region in northern Philippines. It was usually the male manwhatok (man – a prefix for a person who does, whatok – tattoo, also spelled as manbatok) who tattoos the young men and women in the village, and female tattoo practitioners are very rare. In contrast, among the Atayal, tattooing was restricted solely to the women, that is, the grandmothers and maternal aunts. The presence of Whang-ud (Figure 8, colour appendix) and three other known female tattoo practitioners in Basao, Kalinga is exceptional compared to thirty-six known male tattoo practitioners in Tinglayan and neighboring Kalinga villages. The presence of only a few female practitioners in Kalinga, according to Mallingay, the daughter of a male tattoo practitioner from Bangad, Kalinga, can be attributed to the fact that tattooing is relatively difficult for women to learn from men. Male tattoo practitioners do not teach their female children to tattoo because drawing blood from one’s “own blood” is contrary to the practice.

However, learning indirectly from male practitioners who are not relatives has proven to be more effective, such as in the case of Whang-ud, the ninety-year old tat-
too practitioner in a remote village of Buscalan in Kalinga. Whang-ud learned the tattooing process through observation and getting tattooed from Whag-ay, an old tattoo practitioner in the village. The fact that tattooing, a once male-dominated activity across the Kalinga, is now pursued by women in Southern Kalinga provides an example of recent changes in women’s work activities in the region (away from traditional pursuits such as weaving, pottery, and farming). The tattoo practitioners in Kalinga may be residents of the village or traveling tattoo practitioners who make the rounds of different villages. This is the reason why there are similarity of designs and technique among the different groups in the Cordillera region.

For the Atayal, aside from their prowess in weaving, tattooing was also restricted to the women (Figure 9). Both the skill of weaving and tattooing were passed on to female kin, from mother to daughter. As such, tattooing was a specialist activity, which means that skills in tattooing were passed on to the next line of female kin of the succeeding generations. The female tattoo practitioner among the Atayal was also called the ptasan, and occupies an important role in the community as shamans and healers.

Unlike the Kalinga tattoo practitioners who travel to different villages to tattoo, the Atayal had resident tattoo practitioners who performed tattooing within the community. Each of the aboriginal groups, such as the Seediq, Truku, Paiwan and Saisayat had their own tattoo practitioners. In Kalinga, while the master-apprentice relationship is evident, skills were not necessarily transferred to the next generation within the family, but to specific individuals on the basis of whether a person has a keen interest in tattooing.

Figure 9: Tattooing among the Atayal was a specialist activity for the women and passed on to female kins (Source: Illustrations of Formosa Savages 1895–1945, Vol. 1: 39).
3. Technology of Tattooing

So far, I have described how one becomes a tattoo practitioner in the Kalinga and Atayal context. In this section, I will discuss the various tattooing procedures, paraphernalia and costs.

**Ink**

Whang-ud, the old tattoo practitioner in Butbut Kalinga would gently scrape the first layer of soot from underneath the surface of an aluminum pan, then scrape the inner layer and gently tap the half-shell of a coconut (bao) where the fine charcoal powder has collected. About 50 ml of clear water is poured into the coconut shell and gently mixed with the fine dark soot powder together with a slice of sweet potato (kamote). On other occasions she would use sugarcane soot with the mixture. Traditionally, ink is made from the charcoal powder or soot (lagit) scraped from underneath a clay pot (fanga or whanga). When Whang-ud opts to use traditional tattoo ink from charcoal, instead of clay earthenware she scrapes soot from the bottom of an aluminum pan used for daily cooking. Sugarcane soot and water are added to the fine charcoal powder and stirred to a desired thickness. Although Whang-ud still uses this traditional mix, there have been instances where she used ink from a Rotring pen or the bottled Indian ink from a pen given her by a Bontoc teacher, Kerchaten, who lived among the Butbut in the 1980s.

Among the Atayal, the ink is called the ihoh, a pigment from the charred pinewood resin stored in a small gourd or iron case. In some cases, the ink that was used for tattooing was from the soot of the pan that turns into a fine powder mixed with water. The ink is applied on the skin and pierced with the tattoo instruments. In one narrative of an Atayal elder, while the Japanese prohibited facial tattooing, there were also aborigines who made friends with Japanese soldiers and were given hand-held guns as ammunitions. The aborigines discovered that they could also use gunpowder as “ready-made ink” for their tattoos. They hid in the forests and secretly continued tattooing their faces despite the strict prohibition on facial tattoos.

**Tattoo Instruments**

For the Kalinga, the main tattoo instrument is called the gisi (‘stick with a thorn’) and is hand-tapped using a pat-ik, a wooden stick (Figure 10, colour appendix). The gisi has a tiny hole near the end of the stick where the lemon thorn is inserted. Near Whang-ud’s backyard are two citrus trees (Citrus limon) where she collects the lemon thorns used for tattooing. I saw scars on the tree where the thorn had been removed indicating the many thorns that Whang-ud had used for practicing and for the actual tattooing of locals and foreign visitors. The lemon thorn is covered with a protective layering that makes it sturdy for use in tattooing. Whang-ud also explained that she prefers the parakuk id lubwhan (lemon thorn) because of the strong scent that drives away the bad spirits (ayan), which can interfere with her tattooing. In the case of tattooing, it is the sight of the chara (blood) of the tattooee that attracts the ayan, and the thorn plays a role in keeping them away.

Another tattoo instrument that she uses is the gisi made from a buffalo horn bent by fire with steel needles (gambang in Kalinga, chakayum in Bontoc and chakum in Ifugao) attached at the tip (Figure 11, colour appendix). The skin is pierced and the design filled in through repeated tapping of the stick (pat-ik). In many of the tattoo-
ing sessions I observed, the tapping frequency was about 90–120 taps per minute with a continuous tapping of the skin. Whang-ud would stop for a few seconds to replenish the ink at the tip of the thorn. It would take an hour or more to tattoo a design. It takes a day to finish full sleeve tattoos on one arm, and another day for the other arm. The chest and back tattoos of the men is a lengthy process that takes place at different points during their life.

For the Atayal, since traditional tattooing is no longer practiced nowadays, visits to the National Prehistory of Taiwan in Taitung and Kevalan Cultural Center showed some of the Atayal and Truku tattoo instruments. Furthermore, Kimi Sibal showed me the tattoo instruments used by his grandmother (Figures 12-13, colour appendix). As a child he recalls that “I was always at my grandmother’s side, so the tattoos on her face were a familiar sight and tells me how the tattoos were made.”

The Atayal’s main tattoo instrument is the atok (排針), it has twelve to fourteen needles arranged in rows and fastened to a wooden handle (Figure 13). Before the steel needles were introduced in Taiwan, lemon thorns were used, similarly to the tattoo instrument in Kalinga. In other archival photographs and from displays of the tools in the ethnographic museums in Taiwan, I observed that there are set of comb-like tools arranged according to the number of needles and length of the stick (Figure 14). It could be assumed that different tools with varying number of needles used to make fine lines for the tattoos.

All these tools employed the use of hand-tapping technique in making the designs with the use of a light wooden mallet called the totsin (木槌). The totsin is used to tap the atok (Figure 15, colour appendix). In addition to these set of tools, there are two other instruments included in the tattoo instruments of the Atayal that demonstrates the complexity and sophistication of the method. There is a stick (墨笔) with a linen thread coiled around it (c). This was used as a stencil to draw the initial patterns (such as lines) on the forehead and the cheeks, and at the same time to apply the ink on the skin. The other instrument the “ink pen” (刺针) has a single sharp needle inserted at the tip of the stick (b), which was then used to pierce the skin through the hand-poking technique. In other words, the Atayal employed these methods in tattooing in one sitting, the first to draw lines through the hand-tapping technique, and for shading the fine lines through the hand-poking technique. This is also similar to a method done in Ifugao and Bontoc, the neighboring ethnic groups in northern Lu-
zon, Philippines. Both these methods are considered old and complex, and significantly pan-Austronesian.

Furthermore, the *quwar* (刮血器), a rattan splint bent and bound together at the end with a thread is used to scrape the blood from the wounds. It is used to clean the blood and for the tattoo practitioner to see if the designs are fine, and further reinforce this through tapping the instrument. A similarity can be attributed to the *quwar* with the tool in Kalinga. In the 1913 photograph of Kip Moore (from the Otley Beyer Photographic Collection) shows of a young Kalinga woman being tattooed on her arms. The photograph also shows that the tattoo practitioner also used a similar tool like that of the Atayal (Figure 16). Today, this has been substituted with a cloth to wipe the blood from the wounds.

Figure 16: On the left is a similar tool found among the Kalinga and the Atayal. Photograph by Kip Moore in 1913 (Source: H. Otley Beyer Photographic Collection).

---

2 A series of this photograph is found at the American Historical Collection of the Ateneo de Manila University, Manila.
**Tattooing Process**

For the Kalinga, to prepare the first designs on the skin Whang-ud uses the *uyot*, a dried straw of the rice chaff bent into a triangle and used as a stencil for marking tattoo patterns. The word *idiid* means ‘press lightly’, before the designs are permanently tattooed with a thorn. The *uyot* is dipped lightly in the black charcoal ink and pressed on the surface of the skin. This is also Whang-ud’s way of scaling and measuring the tattoo patterns on the skin. On some occasions, Whang-ud would borrow ballpoint pens from her brother or her niece to draw the more figurative tattoo patterns. Whang-ud then dips the stem of rice chaff into an ink and use this as a stencil. This is also replenished with ink to re-draw the patterns and tattooed simultaneously. Other groups in Kalinga use the *kammai* (a handmade wooden block with designs) to stamp the tattoo pattern on the surface of the skin before the actual tattooing is done, for some tattoo practitioners they used thread as a stencil for the *chuyos* or lines of the tattoo, a similar process done by the Atayal.

For the Kalinga, tattooing is made after the initial designs were made on the skin. The lemon thorn is dipped into the ink, and then stick is hand-tapped on the *gisi* (main tattoo instrument), as the lemon thorn pierces the skin. The hand-tapping technique is an old tattooing technique employed by other indigenous groups in Southeast Asia and the Pacific. For detailed and fine lines, continuous tapping is made as the designs starts to appear. Usually, it would take an hour to finish a design, a day to finish an arm.

The physical positioning of the subject being tattooed matters as this allows for better management of pain and achievement of a good visual outcome of the tattoos. Women position themselves in a sitting position when getting tattoos on the arms or upper shoulders. According to the women, a tattoo is *whayyu* (‘beautiful’) when no resistance is given during the actual process, and the tattoo is completed without much pain on the part of the tattooee. To get tattooed on their chests, men rest their backs against a wooden house post to maintain a steady position. When the area being tattooed is the upper chest they lie on the ground. For tattoos on the back, the men lie supine on a wooden bench. Some of the elder men recall that neophyte warriors who were tattooed often fell asleep while the tapping and chanting of the *liwliwa* (chants) were going on. As such, they were distinguished as *naontog* (brave and strong). It might be the awareness the Butbut had of the close relation of the status and ostentation of tattoos that allows them to endure the painful process of tattooing.

For the Atayal, the recipient of the tattoo would lay down on the ground with a mat, and a folded cloth under his or her head (Figure 15 in colour appendix). A blanket would cover the body of the recipient except for the head, where the face will be tattooed. The tattoo practitioner would usually sit down on a low stool behind the recipient. The tattoo practitioner would first stencil the designs upon the skin with a thread soaked in black soot, the ink is applied on the skin. The tattoo practitioner would heat the steel needle of the instrument briefly on the fire to sharpen the tool. Others would rub the needles to sharpen the instrument. She would take the *totsin*, the wooden mallet to tap the *atok* that would pierce the skin, and then scrape the blood from the wound with a *quwar*. Afterwards, the tattoo practitioner washed the hammered area and rubbed it with black soot.

When the Atayal got tattooed, he or she lay down – this was the appropriate position to get fine tattoos. The recipients would take the pain gently and should not show emotions of pain, this is to prevent the inflammation on the skin, and hence it is important for the recipient to remain still during the whole process of tattooing.
While the Kalinga employ hand-tapping technique to produce the designs, it is interesting to note that the Atayal employ two methods of tattooing, this is a combination of (a) hand-tap technique using the comb-like tool (atok); and (b) hand-poke technique using the one needle tattoo instrument in one sitting. The atok was used to make the first lines, and the other instrument was used for fine lines for the more intricate designs. The tattoos for the men would take five hours, while the women would take a day to finish the facial tattoos.

**Tattoo Designs**

In my discussion of the designs and meanings of tattoos in this section, it does not follow a mechanistic approach in understanding the signification of tattoos. It focuses rather on how tattoos come to acquire meanings in the Butbut, Kalinga and Atayal context, rather than what the tattoos themselves mean. It seems that the indigenous groups view tattoos and tattooing as more of a social practice and a cultural endeavor than a form of art. The lack of a specific word for ‘art’ is often an indication of the production and reception of imagery, symmetry, performances and, so on as being integrally connected to a particular way of life (Morphy & Perkins, 2006: 13).

The Butbut have a variety of tattoo motifs found on their arms. The local names vary according to the manwhatok and tattooed in different Kalinga areas. Most figurative motifs are ‘traditional’ Butbut tattoo designs, which have different meanings (Figure 17). The motifs are related to each other and they appear in repetitions, such as long parallel lines (chuyos), hexagon shapes (tinulipao), triangles (iniijab) X-designs (chu-ing or chung-it, also called lingaw) or three short parallel lines (inud-udchan, meaning like ‘rain’). The motifs are usually representational and are connected to or organized in relationship to other designs. There are also abstract and figurative designs consisting of geometric elements in stylized representations such as the snake (tabwhad), coiled snake (inong-oo), eagle (tulayan), centipede (ginaygayan-man), frog (tokak), fern plant (lawhat or chinapat or inam-amam), tree fern (whangyan or attifangan), bundles of rice (sinwhuto or panyat), stars (tinatalaaw), ladder (inar-archan), pig’s hind legs (hibul) and rice mortar (linus-lusong) among others. The designs are combinations of natural and cultural phenomena and relevant objects. The chuyos (lines) serve the dual purpose of dividing and defining the boundaries of these tattoo patterns. The spatial relation of the tattoos is also an interesting feature in the process of whato’an (tattooing), this reflects the skill of the tattoo practitioner. The tattoos of women on both arms are not enclosed by tattoo patterns (Figure 18, back cover). The tattoo runs horizontally on the arm, and the end part of the tattoo design is left ‘open’ (i.e., not ‘closed’ by a chuyos (line). This means that the arm is not fully ‘wrapped’ with the combinations of tattoo patterns, but is left with a part of the skin untattooed (i.e., the inner part of the arm). When I asked about this ‘un-enclosed’ tattoo, I was told that the arrangement is significant to achieve sinangat, which means ‘to grow upwards’ (like a robust plant). It is the untattooed portion that serves as an indication of growth (simit). Many women observed that, over time, the untattooed part of the skin becomes wider (i.e., stretches), evidence that they have ‘grown’ during this period. A combination of these designs can be tattooed on the women, while there are specific designs that were accorded to the men such as the ginayaman (centipede), tabwhad (snake), tinulipao (snake skin), inong-oo (coiled snake) and the tulayan (eagle) as these designs indicate the status of the warrior (Figure 19, back cover).
With regards to the Atayal, the designs are more geometric with bold lines. Although Truku and the Atayal share a level of homogeneity of culture (Ferrell, 1969: 32), such as facial tattooing, they also share a difference in tattoo designs. Notably, the Atayal men were tattooed in several straight decorative designs on the forehead and chin, making two short vertical bold lines (Figure 21, colour appendix, Figure 22), and the Atayal women’s tattoo is V-shaped with a wide line from one ear, through the lips to the other ear (Figure 20, colour appendix).
It would take about an hour to two hours to tattoo for the men; and about ten hours for the women.

In Kimi Sibal’s photograph documentation of the Atayal tattoos of the women, some of them only have tattoos on the forehead, without the V-shaped tattoos. According to him based on the elders’ narratives, the Japanese already banned facial tattooing, and therefore the full facial tattoos were not completed.

Payment for Tattoos

In the past it was customary for anyone to be tattooed to perform paranos (butchering a chicken or pig), particularly for travelling tattoo practitioners among the Kalinga. Many elders say that the tattoo practitioners would get the best part of the chicken and were fed with tasty soups so that they would be able to tattoo well. The pig meat was usually redistributed to the other members of the family or to neighbors to consume. This show of courtesy and hospitality by the host is still practiced in Kalinga.

When a tattoo service is rendered, a reciprocal payment is made to the tattoo practitioner. According to the elders, payment for the tattoo service in the past was expensive. For instance, payment for tattoos on both arms (for women) or the chest (for men) would be a medium-sized pig, bundles of rice, silver coins, a loincloth (bahag) and wrap-around-skirt (kain), and beads (carnelian and agate (achongan) equivalent to the price of a pig or water buffalo (five yellow stone beads or kinubar is equivalent to two medium-sized pigs). A big and fine achongan is equivalent to one or two carabao.

When families cannot part with their beads, clothing or spears, payment can also be made in the form of land (kiring). According to the elders, material objects like beads are visible symbols of wealth to show that a family is affluent. Some families cherish these priceless heirlooms and become strongly attached to them so that even generous offers of compensation will not persuade them to part with their prized pos-
Payment in terms of land however is, different. For instance, Lakay Allos says that he is not as wealthy as the other men in the village, but had enough land to part with, and that he was fully aware that he could retrieve the *kiring* back in exchange for other goods such as bundles of rice and pigs.

With the influx of foreign and local tourists into the village, and with young Butbut starting to get tattoos, Whang-ud adjusted her rates for tattoo services. She now charges by the *changan* (a hand measurement from the thumb to the middle finger or around four inches long). A tattoo of the size of a *changan* costs between 1,000–2,000 pesos (US$ 20–40) for local tourists from Manila and foreign tourists from different countries. (Lower rates apply for locals i.e., those from Kalinga). Clients ‘choose’ the designs from among those found on her arms, which she tattoos accordingly for a fee. A Filipino American recently got a full sleeve tattoo on her right arm, for which she paid 6,000 pesos (US$ 140) for Whang-ud’s tattoo services. A German tourist, who had the centipede tattoo on his leg, paid 1,500 pesos (US$ 30). As a bonus from Whang-ud, he asked for the latter’s tattoo instrument to add to his collection.

For the Atayal, the tattoo practitioners would be given a piece of woven cloth or two strings of beads for an individual’s first tattoo; but, for one who had married she would have two beaded skirts. As the tattoo practitioner occupies a high social position in the society, her service was remunerated with venison, lamb, pork, millet wine, small cakes, weaving, and shell beads, which was a form of currency during the earlier period.

| Table 2. Summary of similarities and differences in Kalinga and Atayal Tattooing |
|------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|
| **Reasons for Tattooing** | Kalinga | Atayal |
| ♂ | prowess in warfare, assumption of social roles, acts of bravery | ♂ | prowess in hunting and warfare, acts of bravery; |
| ♀ | bodily aesthetics, signs of maturity and marriageable age | ♀ | excellent skills in weaving, chastity, duty |
| ♀ | (a) bodily aesthetics (concept of beauty); (2) rites of passage; (3) talismans or protection from malevolent spirits; (4) markers of identity and status; (5) connection with the ancestral spirits; and (6) social cohesion (7) passage to the afterlife |
| **Location of Tattoos** | ♂ | facial tattoos (cheeks and forehead) |
| ♀ | facial tattoos (cheeks and forehead), special tattoos on the chest and legs (rare) |
| ♂ | face, both arms, chest, back, some on the legs, rarely on the back of the ears, sides of the stomach |
| ♀ | face (cheeks and forehead), both arms, back of hands and fingers, below the neck |
| **Tattoo Practitioners** | Tattooing is a specialist activity of men ♂; only few tattoo practitioners were women ♀ (rare); and only one female tattoo practitioner left in Kalinga today; process learned through observation | Tattooing was a specialist activity of the women ♀, usually the grandmothers and maternal aunts passed on from one generation to the next; process learned through apprenticeship |
Now that we have examined the distinctive features of the Atayal and Kalinga tattooing, it can be said that there are similarities in terms of the rationale why they tattoo. As noted, a tattoo implies the status of those who get tattooed to differentiate themselves from others, for the Kalinga and their non-Kalinga neighbors and as a social status within the Kalinga society; while for the Atayal, tattoos were for distinction among their friends and enemies in the mountain areas, and to affirm the relevant social role that they occupy in the society. The tattoos are also a record of achievements and a signal of rank: as a weaver, hunter, and warrior among others that are consistent with the social practices within the society. An important function of the tattoo is their belief of recognition of the ancestral spirits in the afterlife.

### CONTESTED TATTOO: BRANDING OR MARKING OF IDENTITY? HISTORICAL EXPERIENCE IN THE DECLINE AND CONTINUITY OF TATTOOING

The Kalinga and the Atayal both experienced the negative associations of their tattoos attributed by their colonizers that led to the decline of the practice. However, the decline in Kalinga is not solely attributable to a general loss of understanding or awareness of tradition. The decline also reflects a simple change in preferences for new and different forms of tattoos. As such, traditional tattoos are given different meanings in the contemporary context. On the other hand, it is also a different case among the Atayal, where the decline of tattooing practice was due to the historical ex-
Figure 15: The Atayal ptasan has set of different tools to produce the fine lined tattoos as seen on the right. (Source: Illustrations of Formosa Savages 1895–1945, Vol. 1: 126).

Figures 12–13: Tattoo instruments of Kimi Sibal’s grandmother found in his Museum of Disappearing Facial Tattoos in Hualien, Taiwan. From left to right: (a) quwar or the blood scraping tool, (b) tattoo needle, (c) ink pen (d) totsin or wooden mallet, (e) atok, tattoo instrument and the (f) wooden bowl.
Figures 10-11: Tattoo instruments of Whang-ud made of (a) lemon thorn and (b) steel needles (Photograph by AV Salvador-Amores).

Figure 23: Whang-ud, the 92-year old tattoo practitioner from the remote village of Butbut in southern Kalinga (Photograph by AV Salvador-Amores).
Figure 8: Whang-ud, the last tattoo practitioner in the remote village of Butbut in Kalinga (Photograph by AV Salvador-Amores).
Figures 20-21: Atayal elders with their tattoos. Dana Yavu, a male tattooed Atayal elder was tattooed on the forehead and on the chin. The women were tattooed with a V-shaped design and were very distinct among the Atayal. Photograph courtesy of Kimi Sibal, reproduced with permission.

Figure 7: Atayal elderly women with their tattooed faces. Photograph courtesy of Kimi Sibal, reproduced with permission.

Figures 20-21: Atayal elders with their tattoos. Dana Yavu, a male tattooed Atayal elder was tattooed on the forehead and on the chin. The women were tattooed with a V-shaped design and were very distinct among the Atayal. Photograph courtesy of Kimi Sibal, reproduced with permission.
Figure 24: University students and their felt-tip marked tattoos as part of their native attire at a cultural festival in Baguio City (Photograph by AV Salvador-Amores).

Figure 26: Young children with their sticker tattoos in an attempt to revive Atayal tattoos. (Source: Cultural-china.com).
Figure 27: An Atayal couple, Shaoyun and Dali Foudu with permanent tattoos done on their faces with a modern method of tattooing (Source: Taipei Times, 2008).

Figure 28: Kimi Sibal has been documenting the last of the tattooed Atayal in Taiwan. The photographs are displayed in his Disappearing Facial Tattoos Museum in Hualien in an effort to educate the younger generation about ptasan (Photograph by AV Salvador-Amores).
Alekseev’s photography at locals’ home (Yupik, New Chaplino. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).

New Chaplino (Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).
Photo grouping of the dead ancestors together with some landscape pictures (Yupik, New Chaplino. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).

Hand-made decorative photo framing (Yupik, New Chaplino. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).

Photo assemblage of the living persons (Yupik, New Chaplino. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).

Photo grouping of the dead ancestors together with some landscape pictures (Yupik, New Chaplino. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).
Assemblages of the dead in one frame (Yupik, New Chaplino. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).

The deceased person’s umbilical cord is hanging in the bedroom. Note the multiple cultural interlayering of the objects grouped together - animistic element (umbilical cord), Christmas stocking, Soviet hanging carpet, and tourist souvenir (Chukchi, Yanrakynnot. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).

Hand-made decorative photo framing (Chukchi, Yanrakynnot. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).
The deceased ancestor displayed in a single picture (framed) (Yupik, New Chaplino. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).

The deceased ancestor displayed in a single picture (not framed) (Yupik, New Chaplino. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).

Alekseev’s photography at locals’ home (Yupik, New Chaplino. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).
△ The reindeer herder’s belt is hanging in the kitchen and needs to be fed until the first commemoration when it is put near the grave (Chukchi, Yanrakynnot. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).

Alekseev’s photography at locals’ home (Yupik, New Chaplino. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).
△ Assemblage of the dead in one frame (Yupik, New Chaplino. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).

Photo grouping of the dead ancestors (Yupik, New Chaplino. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).
Visual content of the grave photos, main cemetery in New Chaplino (Yupik. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).
Various types of the grave photos, main cemetery in New Chaplino (Yupik. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).
Transformation of the image in time, 2010 vs. 2014, main cemetery in New Chaplino (Yupik. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).

Replacement of the photo by a different type, 2010 vs. 2014, main cemetery in New Chaplino (Yupik. Photo by Jaroslava Panáková).
experiences of the aborigines under its colonizers where tattooing was prohibited. I shall discuss this in this section.

There has been a notable decline in traditional tattooing among residents and communities in the Cordillera region. The reasons for these are identifiable. First, in the early twentieth century, the American colonial government criminalized head-hunting, which had repercussions for tattooing practice. With the banning of head-hunting during the leadership of Gov. Walter Hale (Worcester, 1912; Krieger, 1926; Barton, 1949), the significance of tattoos waned. With the prevalence of the peace pacts and the eventual waning of headhunting, tattooing slowly lost its significance. What remains of the traditional tattoos are found on the remaining elders, aged sixty-five to eighty-five, who still have the whiing (chest tattoos) that they proudly earned for killing Japanese soldiers during World War II. Many of these tattooed elders have died, taking their hard-earned tattoos with them to the grave.

By the 1950–1960s, only a handful of men remained who had traditional tattoos done by the generation of male tattoo practitioners responsible for the traditional chest tattoos of the older generation of warriors. By this time, many of the earlier tattoo practitioners had died or stopped tattooing due to old age. Tattooing is a specialist activity of men in Kalinga society, as well as among the Ifugao and Bontoc of the Cordilleras. It is rare to have women tattoo practitioners, such as the case of the But-but and Basao. By the 1960s–1970s, however, the younger tattoo practitioner like Whang-ud rose in prominence as one of the finest female tattoo practitioners in Kalinga because of her skill in tattooing as a travelling tattoo practitioner.

Second, with the arrival of Christianity in the region tattooing was prohibited and the introduction of clothing (LAMP, 1932; Lambrecht, 1954) diminished the visibility of tattoos. The Kalinga were impelled to conceal their tattoos with clothes, in light of the shame of being labeled ‘criminals’ by lowlanders. Third, the mobility of the But-but to other places led to exposure to Western-style education, religion and technology, which changed the people’s traditional lifestyle. The younger generation of But-but refused to get tattoos because of the pain these entailed, and, more so, because of the changing symbolic associations of tattoos. This last point, however, is also instrumental in a renewed appreciation and modern revival of traditional tattoos.

The case among the aborigines in Taiwan is different. In 1895 the Japanese occupied Taiwan and gradually established control over the indigenous population. For the Atayal and other peoples that lived in the high mountains it was not until the Japanese era that their position underwent a massive change. In 1913, the traditional tattoos were prohibited during the colonial period and had adverse effects to the indigenous societies (Ru, 2010: 83). The Japanese prevented headhunting, and banned facial tattooing. This was an effective means in suppressing the Atayal headhunting because these cultural practices were closely connected to each other. The actual motive of the Japanese was probably to eliminate the rebellious spirits of the Atayal in order to keep them under strict control by forbidding the facial tattoo – the root of the Atayal consciousness (Ho, 1960: 6). For the Japanese, the ptasan were associated with people who were “backward, savage, uncivilized,” and took all means to forcefully abandon the practice.

In one narrative collected by Kimi Sibal, any aborigine found with tattoos had them surgically removed. An elderly Atayal narrates how she had to go to a Japanese hospital to have the tattoos on her forehead removed, and her skin stitched together. Kimi said, the elder explained “how the Japanese officials sliced the facial tattoos off the faces of teenaged Atayal in the 1920s and 30s”. Accordingly, it was painful to do this
partly as one loses one’s identity with such a painful operation. To maintain the social order of colony, the Japanese imposed severe sanctions on the violation of law. For instance, the Truku woman faced a brutal punishment when she broke the Japanese law to have tattoo on her face:

“I made facial tattoo when I was fourteen years old. I was punished by the Japanese policeman when he found that I made tattoo on my face. He used a thong to beat my legs five times. It caused noticeable scars. It really hurt. It was even more painful than making tattoo on my face. Several Truku women and men were also punished by the policemen because of making facial tattoos at that time.” (Ma, 2003, translated by Ru, 2010: 96)

Directives were now issued to step up enforcement of the 1927 policy of the kominka, which literally means “becoming a citizen of the Emperor” (Ru, 2010: 58). Effective immediately, Japanese subjects in the colonies prohibited the following: “foot bindings were simply torn off, queues shorn off and, most gruesomely, facial tattoos cut off” (Ibid., p. 60).

Some of the women had unfinished tattoos, as this is the time when traditional tattooing was banned, because anyone who had tattoos were considered ‘savages’ or ‘barbarians’. External forces have tried to change the identities of these peoples first to become Japanese and then to become Chinese. The Japanese also planned for the assimilation of indigenous people, but primarily through schooling. Indigenous children were forced to attend elementary and secondary schools. The education emphasized moral and social training, schooling in practical subjects related to agriculture and trade, and instruction in the Japanese language and national spirit (Ru, 2010: 86).

In 1910 the Regulations for the Supervision of the Aborigines was promulgated. That year, the government began to actively assimilate the island’s aboriginal peoples and give them a Japanese identity, partly by building schools in mountain villages. The vast majority of aboriginal children were enrolled in schools by 1940, learning about Japanese language and customs in addition to mathematics and trades. Meanwhile, as Japanese identities took root, many traditional practices were being lost, including tattooing and headhunting.

The role of Christianity is also linked to the changing identity of the indigenous groups in Taiwan. Christianity first came to Taiwan with the Dutch and Spanish in the seventeenth century. Mountain villages converted to Christianity on a large scale in the 1950s (Kaneko, 1960; Harrison, 2001: 76). Atayal began converting to Christianity. Yoshimura (2007: 150–152) writes the church is an important place for the Atayal to define who they are as Atayal. In Fishu Village in Hualien county, I noticed how Catholic and Presbyterian churches are often a marker that distinguishes indigenous towns and villages from those of the Chinese-speaking mainstream in Taiwan. Stainton (2002) describes the role that the Presbyterian Church has played in the support of indigenous peoples and their rights. Presbyterian churches support the indigenous identity, including promotion of the use of indigenous languages not only in worship but also in meetings and events.

It is clear that the historical experiences of these two cultures are essential in exploring how these affected the lives of the indigenous peoples in relation to their identity formation. The practice of tattooing showed how the tattoos are deeply intertwined in their culture, but viewed differently by others and eventually transformed or eradicated the practice. In the next section, I will discuss how tattoos are resignified or given meaning in the contemporary context.
CONTEMPORARY STATE OF TATTOOS: RESIGNIFYING TATTOOS, REDEFINING IDENTITIES

Despite the relative decline of traditional tattooing across the Kalinga region and northern Luzon in general, there is an unprecedented revival of tattoos in Buscalan, Kalinga (Figure 23, colour appendix). This revival or ‘(re)invention’ of traditional tattoos in Buscalan is both local and global. It is not just diasporic Filipinos returning ‘home’ from overseas who seek out tattoos in Buscalan, but also young Butbut-Kalinga and other urban Filipinos who have developed a renewed appreciation of traditional tattoos as a strategy to signify their own individual and ethnic identities. Traditional tattoos are also being sought out by urban Filipinos and diasporic Kalinga and non-Kalinga people (e.g., local and foreign tourists, professional tattoo artists from urban Manila, prominent tattoo artists in Hawaii such as Keone Nunes, expats with deeper relationships with the relevant community, who travel to Buscalan to be tattooed by Whang-ud).

Kalinga and non-Kalinga people are reviving tattooing practice and traditional tattoo designs, but although the technique remains the same, the meanings associated with the tattoos differ. For instance, for the Kalinga warriors tattooing allowed them to become recognized as such in their society. For tourists, diasporic Filipinos and the new wave of tattooing enthusiasts, tattoos function as permanent markers of individualized forms of memory (remembrances or souvenirs), as talismans and as ‘trophies’ (though no longer for headhunting). Some of the traditional tattoo designs have become popular graphic designs on T-shirts and native attire during cultural festivals (Figure 24, colour appendix).

For the experience of the Atayal, it is uncertain if the practice will be continued, as only four Atayal elders are left with the facial tattoos and are very old. The Chinese government recognized them as national living treasures; however, there is no active support in revitalizing this particular tradition, except in museums where old photographs of the Atayal are displayed. According to Shun Lu, a young Paiwanese (another aboriginal group in Taiwan) says that “there was a culture death in our generation; we know that the tattoos of the old exists, but we do not know what it means.” It is unfortunate that the tattooed elders did not inculcate the tattooing practice to the younger generation, precisely because of the negative experience that they had during the Qing dynasty and during the Japanese period, that tattooed aborigines were “branded” as criminals and deviants in the society. With the increased exposure of younger community members through school, religious influences, mass media and technology, the tattoos are seen as old practice and not fitting to the modern practices in the present.

There are also community efforts when the Atayal tattoos are given significance. For instance, Kimi Sibal’s Disappearing Facial Tattoo Museum in Hualien displays the pictures of the elders with face-tattoos. In the museum, tattoo stickers are also sold (Figure 25). In some cultural activities, some stalls also provided a face tattoo service. They drew the tattoo patterns on the guests’ faces with eyebrow pencil or have the stickers on the faces of young children and visiting tourists (Figure 26, colour appendix). In this context, face tattoos are not marks to distinguish people, but a way to integrate outsiders (Wang, 2002; 2008: 22). In my interviews with young Taiwanese, they said that they are aware of the tattoos in the past, but they do not know exactly what it means.

In January 21, 2008, Shayun Foudu, a thirty year-old Atayal from Hualien had her face tattooed with the V-shaped traditional tattoos for the women.³ The application of

tattoos is done through modern methods with pigments like ink. This was performed in a ceremony in Taroko National Park at Hualien county. This is the first time that an aboriginal woman tattooed her face after nearly a century since tattooing was last practiced. In 1915, the Japanese government outlawed the practice of tattooing, but the current Taiwanese government does not outlaw the practice. Foudou and her husband, also an Atayal had the tattoos on the forehead and chin (Figure 27, colour appendix). This they say is “one way of preserving the Atayal tattoo tradition and for the society to adopt an open mind about facial tattoos.”

When I asked Kimi Sibal what he thinks about this kind of revival of Atayal tattoos (Figure 28, colour appendix), he said that “I really admire their actions. But I think the wider society cannot accept them. For instance, maybe many Han Chinese in the city will look and point. I think they will have some problems later on. It is not good, what age is this? These young people have destroyed their skin to be like people from the past and other ethnic groups. The meaning is not the same as it was for our tribe.”

As of this time, Kimi said that there are only five elders with the facial tattoos; I asked Kimi what his thoughts are when these facial tattoos will be gone, as the elders are very old. He said that “I document the elders’ tattoos, to let the younger generation understand the meanings. I will not be upset if they pass away, after all they are close to one hundred years old. Their stories will be preserved. We will see them in books or memories. Actually, my personal dream is to allow the next generation to understand that facial tattoos are an honor and responsibility to our ancestors.”

CONCLUSION

This paper examined the similarities and differences of Kalinga and Atayal tattooing practices and their historical experience. The comparison is done through a combination of ethnographic narratives, textual records, archival records and others that tattooing is prevalent in Southeast Asia, and including Taiwan and Okinawa. First, it is observed that tattooing is shared because of its Austronesian ancestry and geo-
graphical proximity. Second, for both the Kalinga and the Atayal, we have seen various forms of body tattooing that expressed different kinds of individual and collective identities for the last hundreds of years or even probably longer. The tattooing practice were pre-contact practices in northern Luzon that have strong parallels in Taiwan and Southeast Asia, specifically on (1) tools used for tattooing, (2) the designs of the tattoos and more importantly, (3) the reasons why they tattoo. For the case of tattooing, which has been tied to Austronesian-speaking migrants from Taiwan, the origin of tattooing lacks support for now. The methods for tattooing were locally specific – hand poked and hand-tapped and over time underwent adaptive changes such as the use of lemon thorns to steel needles, charcoal powder to gun powder as ink, and others. Similarly fluid was the meaning of the tattoos as it responded to historical circumstances, like the arrival of the American or Japanese colonizers who gave derogatory meanings to the batok (Kalinga) and ptasan (Atayal) from a collective identity of the group to a criminal record of individuals or ethnic groups. While this is a preliminary research on the comparison of these two tattooed groups, this research certainly warrants further investigation and ultimately provides arguments for a broad diffusion of the tattooing practice in Kuroshio. This includes further investigations to the other aboriginal groups in Taiwan such as the facial tattoos of the Truku and Seediq, and the hand tattoos of the Paiwan aboriginal groups in Taiwan and Okinawa, Japan.

To conclude, the phenomenon of identity (in this case identities) demonstrates that they are fluid and not a fixed concept, but are constructed through a continuous process. Traditional tattooing both for the Kalinga and the Atayal had a long history and led to its different trajectories. Their colonizers outlawed Kalinga and the Atayal’s practice of tattooing in the past that led to its eventual decline in the succeeding century. The decline of tattooing among the Atayal was primarily because the practice had been outlawed and had not been passed on to the next generation, however, there are efforts to revive the facial tattoos in different ways in the contemporary period. The Kalinga on the other hand has a strong revival of the practice, as urban and diasporic Filipinos, including tourists have visited the remote village in Kalinga to get tattooed for their individual and collective identities. Younger tattoo artists have appropriated the technique and designs of Kalinga traditional tattooing and has become part of the repertoire of modern tattooing in the Philippines. This paper demonstrates that there are complex processes on how ethnic identities are formed that includes continuity (and discontinuity) of tattoo practices, specifically on how the past becomes part of the present.

Acknowledgement
I would like to thank the Butbut of Kalinga for their warmth and hospitality while conducting research in the village from 2008–2011, and until now. My gratitude to Prof. Kerim Friedman of the faculty of the Department of Indigenous Cultures at Dong Hwa University in Hualien for his kind assistance and sharing his valuable time during my preliminary research in Taiwan. My sincere thanks to Kimi Sibal from Hualien for sharing his valuable time and insights on the Atayal tattoos. I would like to thank Shaswati Talukdar, Shun Lu, Ezra, Sullijaw, Cameron Hanson and Cudry for their help while doing research in Hualien, Taitung and Hsinchu. I would like to thanks Mr. Ao Jaiyong for his help in the translation from Mandarin to Chinese. Many
thanks to Prof. Giovanni Malapit for sharing his generous time during fieldwork in Kalinga. To the tattooed elders that I met in this research, my deepest gratitude for the wisdom you shared. This paper was presented in the 9th International Conference on Ryukyuan-Okinawan Studies sponsored by the Asia Center and Department of Anthropology, Seoul National University May 9, 2014.

REFERENCES CITED


tion of a Globally Mediated Kalinga Identity”, *Southeast Asian Research*, 192, 293–18.


Truku Name Rectification Campaign (2003).


**ABOUT THE AUTHOR**

ANALYN V. SALVADOR-AMORES (*1974) is associate professor in social anthropology at the College of Social Sciences, University of the Philippines Baguio. She earned her Masters in Anthropology at the University of the Philippines, and MPhil (2008) and PhD (2011) in Social and Cultural Anthropology at Oxford University, UK with a focus on the anthropology of the body and non-Western aesthetics. She is the author of “*Tapping Ink, Tattooing Identities: Tradition and Modernity in Contemporary Kalinga Society, north Luzon Philippines*” (2013) published by the University of the Philippines Press and the Cordillera Studies Center. The book is this year’s Best Book in the Social Sciences in the 33rd National Book Awards conferred by the National Book Development Board (NBDB) and the Manila Critics Circle in the Philippines.
The study examines the phenomenon of ancestralization through the grave photo portraits. The aim is to show that although photography in Russian Beringia has its origin in the Soviet practice, the locals have been able to invent their own modes of photography use and incorporate them into the set of specifically local social and religious practices, including the feeding of the spirits and the phenomenon of "return". The study shows that while photography can under certain conditions preserve memory of the individual person, the collective memory remains heavily dependent on the traditional mechanism. Consequently, photography in Russian Beringia neither effaces, nor deeply transforms the existing practices of commemoration; nevertheless, it enables us to explore the terrains, in which the existing religious phenomena have not been studied before.

Key words: Siberia, Chukchi, Yupik, ancestralization, graves, photography

INTRODUCTION

The central position of photographs in social life has been widely recognized in social sciences. The focus on photography has certainly dominated over interest in other fields of visual culture, so that without exaggeration we could describe the research done so far as photo-centric. Scholars consider various underpinnings and aspects of photography, including social history (Sontag, 2005; Edwards, 2011, 2012; Morton & Edwards, 2009), aesthetics (Bourdieu et al., 2003[1965]), sociality and related social practices (Radley, 2010), meaning (and meaning-making) (Barthes, 1981), domestication (Chambers, 2003), materialisation of memories (Hirsch, 2005; Drazin & Frohlich, 2007), and tourism (Crawshaw & Urry, 1997; Osborne, 2000; Crouch & Lübbren, 2003). A significant part of work on photography is methodological: photographs are considered either as a type of ethnographic data (objects of study, source of analysis, field records) and show diverse ways how to treat them as such (Magidov, 2000; Pink, 2001; Pink et al., 2004; Meshcherkina-Rozhdestvenskaya,
For detailed description of this ritual complex, see Oparin (2013).

This study is a contribution to the discussion on how visual media, in this case photography, is adopted to existing cultural, social, and religious models, practices, and beliefs, and how, if at all, the media challenge these models. In order to conceive such cultural adoption, I will employ two views, on how photography takes part in life of the community: “social life of photography” and “social use of photography”. The former standpoint recognizes the fact that photography can have a life of its own parallel to people’s social life, in which it is embedded; if left alone, uncared-for, either on the cemetery or in the frame at home, it is transformed both by social and natural forces: it gets ruined, weathered, faded or wrinkled etc. If archived in good conditions, it can trespass into the lives of the people who are depicted in it, or who could remember how and why it was taken, who is portrayed and what it signifies. In this context, I will talk about life of photography after the death of the portrayed subject and how it regains a whole new life after the owner’s death.

In the latter standpoint, it is people’s attentive and conscious action in relation to their photographs, which is under focus. The photograph can become an object, around which people build their practices or even develop new ones. It can become even the sole purpose of the practice as it is (see e.g. Bourdieu et al. 2003[1965]) for the rise of tourism for the sake of travel pictures). In this study, this focus is aimed at unravelling how the photo portrait of the deceased person is selected, what is its origin and how it is presented on the grave. Moreover, photography is apt to parallel significant religious beliefs and practices, including commemoration and ancestralization. My concern is not to show only how the deceased are represented visually but how these images of the deceased get embedded in the existing notion of death and memory. Thus, this study also draws on the recent move in anthropology of death from the ritual itself to other social practices related to dying (including Rosaldo, 1989; Taylor, 1993; Delaplace, 2008).

The aim of the study is to prove that although social use of photography (Bourdieu et al., 2003[1965]) in the Bering strait has its origin in the Soviet practice, the locals have been able to invent their own modes of photography use and incorporate them into the set of specifically local practices of commemoration and mourning ceremonies¹, including ritual complex of feeding the spirits (yup. aghqesiaqghtughaqut – they go ‘there’, meaning they go to feed the spirits) and “return” of the name soul. In addition, life of photographs is not limited to the use or purpose people have invented for them: visual décor of the tombs aimed at commemorating the ancestors (traditional belief) in a visually pleasing way (Russian influence), loses its colours, forms, and shapes and transforms into absence. Such non-existent imagery feeds back in the belief that the ancestors are not visible yet omnipresent.

In more general terms, my concern is to argue that import of a particular visual genre can be critical in the ways the already existing social and religious phenomena persist as well as how these can be conceived anthropologically. I suggest that despite the intermingling of the existing practices and newly adopted media, the difference

¹ For detailed description of this ritual complex, see Oparin (2013).
between them remains significant. Visual memory, as opposed to genealogical one, has a very limited time span. Thus, photography in Russian Beringia does not belong to the most efficient ways of commemoration present in the local cultural model; it doesn’t transform the usual practices of commemoration but rather accompanies them.

In the summer 2010, spring 2011 and summer 2014, I collected ethnographic data in several hamlets in Russian Beringia populated by now sedentary Siberian Yupiget and semi-sedentary Chukchi people. In this paper, I will focus on New Chaplino (and the main, ethnically and religiously mixed, cemetery); it is a hamlet on the Tkachen-Bay inhabited by sedentary Yupik- and Chukchi people, in total 400 persons. The traditional subsistence economy consists of marine hunting (both Yupik- and Chukchi people) and reindeer herding (Chukchi people), fishing and bird hunting. Besides this, other people in productive age take part in the state-run economic sector; they are occupied mostly in education or reproductive jobs (electricity, heating, cleaning). The hamlet was established in 1958 as a result of Soviet policy of enlargement (politika ukrupnenia); small coastal settlements were put together but the division into lineage and territorial groups persists among Yupik people until today (Krupnik & Chlenov, 2013). Kinship has an impact on a person’s position in a society. The position in the hunting crew, choice of partners or sharing of material goods are in many ways defined by the lineage system. In the study, I will also use material from the Chukchi hamlet, Yanrakynnot (ca. 300 inhabitants), because most of the Chukchi people in New Chaplino come from this nearby hamlet. In literature, authors usually focus on either Chukchi people or Yupiget but the fact is that despite the differences, which I will pinpoint throughout the article, it is also necessary to see these neighbouring groups in one complex, while paying attention to those phenomena which emerge from this co-existence.

In the study, I have combined several methods: participant observation of the commemoration practices (3 related to the annual commemoration of the deceased relatives, 1 to funeral, and numerous ones associated with daily life, work in the tundra or hunting), photos, elicitation interviews over the photos archived at home (including the portraits which had been used for the purpose of the grave décor, over 20), visual data collection on the cemetery as well as in the home archives (ca. 210 Gb), and genealogical method (ca. 2090 persons). The coexistence of images and words in this study is important; I use the strength of photographs to act on the immediate experience of the interview and to stimulate the personal narratives on this occasion. Nevertheless, even after the data collection is finished, I acknowledge the power of the visual (Rose, 2007: 35). Even there, where the narratives are missing (the persons are deceased or the issue is taboo), the photos can act as self-contained, autonomous domains that can be subjected to analysis in their own terms. Apart from the cross-testing of the data of different origin and characteristics (visual, textual, oral, genealogical, observational), understanding of social reality acquired through pictures (Belting, 2001: 15; Mitchell, 1994; Rose, 2007) is one of the main goals of the analysis.
PHOTOGRAPHY IN RUSSIAN BERINGIA: SOVIET IMPORT

The modernisation project in Soviet Russia promised a great leap, not simply into modernity, but a superior form of modernity (Kotkin, 1995). The evidence from Siberia, however, suggests that policies (ideas), practices, and materials were not always vertically channelled ‘from above’ in the pure totalitarian fashion. Due to the factor of remoteness and peripherality, the Soviet course of Modernity acquired a somewhat random course in the Siberian province. It can be well observed in the ways home media have been introduced, spread, and used in the Siberian indigenous communities. The use of photos, in particular, as means of memory and testimony, can reveal to what extent the official urge for coherent, linear success story of a Soviet man was translated into individual stories.

In the first half of the 20th century, photography in the hamlet was a prerogative of the incomers, first ethnographers (Vladimir Bogoraz at the beginning of 1901 and Aleksandr Forshtein in 1928–29 in Staroe/Old Chaplino, Aleksandr Alekseev in 1971 and Igor Krupnik together with Michael Chlenov in 1970s and 1980s in New Chaplino), then Russian teachers who would be sent to the province by the government. The first native home-made black-and-white photography in New Chaplino dates back to its origin in 1958 and the following years. The youngsters, who got the chance to study in the town, learned the basic skills of photographing, developing and printing at the colleges and then brought their learning back home. Simultaneously, professional studios opened across the Polar North. The closest local studio to the hamlet worked in Provideniya; as the home archives show, most of the professional production was limited to the passport portrait photography or reportage (school, kolkhoz, and state holidays). In the home photography, the analogue reflex cameras dominated up to the 1980’s; when they were overtaken by the colour analogues cameras and intensive but short-lived use of the Polaroid instant cameras, most amateur photographers abandoned their hobby and closed their home black rooms. The spread of the digital cameras and mobile phones dates back to 2000’s, about 5 years later than in Moscow. The delay in the introduction of new media devices and gadgets has been shortening recently due to trans-regional networking, more intensive communication between the centre and periphery, and improving economic conditions. Nevertheless, the use of photography in daily life is not massive. An anthropologist, for instance, is still seen as a reliable source of the images.

The grave photography is a particular example of the Soviet import, i.e. it is not only photography as a medium but the genre of the grave photography, in particular, which was adopted by the locals; at the same time, it is a cultural practice, which was able to intertwine with the existing belief system. Let us first look at the images and then at the ways the photos are related to the commemoration practices.

Within the 326 graves in the cemetery (one is not covered with a tombstone) there are 128 with identifiable photos; in addition, there are 52 remnants of the former photos placed on the gravestones – ruined plexiglass or frame. In other words, slightly more than half of the gravestones have a photo on them. Such presence of the images is quite intriguing, while the traditional belief forbids any depiction of the deceased persons; the taboo is related to interpretation of the photo portraits as an iconic sign – literal substitution of the deceased: the dead persons (i.e. the photos of them), who

---

2 See Hughes (1996: 207) for inconsistent implementations of political policies.
look directly at the visitors of the cemetery, can endanger people’s life. In other words, glance of the dead may harm the living.

The taboo on photos on the cemetery might not have been broken right after the new hamlet was built and first members of the community deceased but a few years later. The year, in which the person died and was buried, is the point of reference here, even though it is evident that the grave photos come from different time periods of the life of the deceased and the gravestone itself may have been rebuilt several times after the burial.3 Some of these dates are not retrievable. Although the oldest graves at the Yupik cemetery of New Chaplino date to the origin of the hamlet, they have no plates on them and are not identifiable. The oldest grave with a readable plate is from 1962 (Kaitu 1915–6.5.1962). It is a wooden pillar with an engraved plate and a visible imprint of the photo frame; no photo, however, is available. The second oldest grave with an available photo is from 1966 (Nutanaun Galina Alexandrovna 1939–1966, photo on p. 512). In this case, the photo itself is a passport portrait and according to an informant’s words, it comes from about 1965. Thus a portrait of a young mother, just a short time before her tragic death, was preferred to any other images in the home archive. The metallic gravestone with a decorative plate and a coloured enamel photograph was made in the beginning of 2000s when another relative died and several graves of the family relatives were renewed at the same time (Uvoka died in 1974, El’vira – in 1988, Alexandr – in 2003). Another relative, Uvoka Lyudmila A., died in 2011; her grave is still a simple pillar with a plate and a more elaborate gravestone is expected to be ordered from the town outside of peninsula. All other graves from the end of 1960s show marks of former photo frames or have their photos recently refreshed: Tygilik’s grave from 1967 has a frame and Polutornikov, who tragically died in 1969, is commemorated by a black-and-white enamel photo.

Despite the fact that some locals still refer to the taboo to place the depictions of the deceased on their graves, between 2010 and 2014, when the data were collected, there has been an apparent increase of the photos. Some gravestones with a missing or ruined photo were decorated anew. Five photos in a plexiglass were replaced by enamel, i.e. more durable yet more expensive material imported from the city. Two expensive engraved marbles were added. According to my observations, such grave tending has become a social marker of the improving socio-economic status of some families; it imitates the incomers’ practice (Russians, Ukrainians etc. whose graves prevail in the district centres, such as Provideniya, and capital city of the okrug, Anadyr). In this context, as I assume, the photos take a part in the visual décor, which is faced towards the public viewing, i.e. they have significance for the living rather than for the dead. Below I will demonstrate the opposite is also true.

The changes in typology and materials applied to the photos are, however, not all-encompassing. Despite new technologies entering the Far North, what is still uncommon is the media convergence and fusion; hence, it is rather unusual to use in place of a grave portrait an image made on the mobile phone, then presented in the profile on the social networking site and finally downloaded to make a print-out. Neither is it usual to edit the photos (collage, visual effects etc.); the only visual editing present here is the coloration of the black-and-white portraits, which is offered in the profes-

3 This multiple renovation of the graves is also a Russian influence: before sovietization, the places of the burial would be left uncared-for; in fact, the faster and more complete ruin of the dead body and of other signs that the person was buried there, meant that the deceased was well accepted among the ancestors.
The choice of the photos is itself a curious issue and worthy of our attention. First of all, the photos are selected by the living, without any participation of the dead. According to the numerous narratives, the preparation of the things, including photos, for own burial is not common; I myself witnessed how a family was hastily purchasing clothes and other attributes for the deceased relative just on the day when the body was supposed to be displayed and visited by the relatives. The selection of the photos contrasts the ways how the place of burial is chosen: Yupiget are buried according to their locus- and tribal identity⁴ and the choice is usually made after the person’s death by an older (thus more experienced, as the informants say) relative. Although the Soviet-like burial in rows is present, the small groupings of the graves grouped according to the locus identity is visible. Chukchi people choose their place of the burial after their death; the dead person is asked by the means of divination where s/he prefers to be buried.

Secondly, the typology of the selected grave photos is important; although there is a genre of a grave photograph in the way the image is displayed, there is no such genre in the sense the image is made. Hence, the photos for the graves are simply selected from what is available in the home archive. Its content is directly bound to the adopted Soviet model I described above. Most of the photos chosen to decorate the graves are identity photos made in the studio. Till the very recent boom of digital imagery, a passport photo has been often the only portrait of a person available; such genre then represents the only visual memory at hand. Some of those deceased who have passport photos on their graves had also possessed other pictures of themselves; but

---

⁴ “Locus is a group of intermarrying lineages; it is territorially localized at a given time or in historic memory and is perceived by its members as a corporate unit reflected in its own name” (Krupnik & Chlenov, 2013: 43). Tribes “made up the highest taxonomic unit in the traditional Yupik social system”; they are “stable historical aggregations of several loci” within a well-defined common territory (Krupnik & Chlenov, 2013: 44).
still, their family members decided to choose passport photos. It may be assumed that this preference follows the Soviet (and European) visual canon, according to which a single portrait expresses the nuances of the personality in the most plausible manner. Again, the grave photograph as a display was at first adopted in its integrity; once the identity photos were used by the incomers, the locals simply copied the way.

Inconsistent input of technologies and materials to the Russian Circumpolar North was counterbalanced by the locals’ attitude to challenge the adopted model: if a studio portrait was missing in the home archive, a true home snapshot was used for the grave display. Even when taken by non-professionals, the portraits often lack spontaneity of home snapshots. They reflect the studio-like behaviour of getting ready for the image. Although the act of photographing had occurred in a real life situation, the informants posed for the camera: on the sofa in the cosy home, especially in front of the hanging carpet or at stoibishche; with their favourite object (pet, computer), and in the midst of some kind of action (e.g. travelling and being on the boat during hunting). These are all staged snaps for memories (na pamiat’). In contrast to the identity studio portraits, the snapshots show the person in an everyday life setting and may accentuate some life moments; they often lack serenity suggested by the Soviet model.

While the identity portraits usually lack the setting, in the home snapshots the background enhances the expression of the portrayed. The portrait itself, the foreground, is chosen to facilitate the living persons to identify the deceased. In this context, as I understand, the grave photos are again oriented towards the living. In accordance with the Soviet model, the portrait refers to the distinct personality of the deceased; the image mirrors the particularities of human face and even takes a role of a synecdoche for person’s biography: face shape, scars, quality of hair etc. might manifest a person’s life trajectory. My informants do not use such words as ‘personality’ (lichnost’) or ‘person’ (lico) but they may well talk about the appearance of the deceased person and his/her personal traits, likes and dislikes, talents and deeds. It is not always clear why some relatives prefer to choose the ancestors at a young age and some in the later phase of their ancestors’ lives. Certainly the availability of a photo plays a crucial role. When the photos are numerous, however, the “better” portrait is chosen. For these reasons, Granny O. N. preferred as her granddaughter’s grave portrait an image of a young student to the picture taken after her mental illness stroke. Just before her tragic death, the granddaughter had short hair, untidy look, and although still smiling, she had tears in her eyes; in contrast, as a student she had long abundant hair, open smile and vital glow. The latter image is chosen: this is how Granny wants her granddaughter to be remembered, this is how Granny commemorates her granddaughter.

In contrast, the background or the setting, in which the portrait was taken (if such an image is available), is chosen to please the dead more than the living; this is suggested by my informants’ claims: anything that will make the person feel content in the realm of the dead (Upper world), shall accompany the deceased (e.g. reindeer herder gets his lasso, woman – her sewing kit, and a young boy – his computer). Apart from the objects, the dead person can be surrounded by the setting, which was important to him/her: hunters’ brigade and the sea, cosy living room, place of work etc. Whereas the entourage of the grave may play a role of self-presentation of the family’s material- and social well-being, the setting in the image is directed to the deceased rather than to the living.

Now let us look at the visual aesthetic of the photos. The compositional structure of
the images is both in the identity portraits and in the home snapshots used as grave photos quite simple. The three elements – the “planimetric structure”, the “scenic choreography” and the “perspectivic projection” (Imdahl, 1996) are very limited. Perspectivity is oriented to the outside world through the depiction of concrete objects in their spatiality and corporality: the distant sea, decoration of the hanging carpet, structure of the house, fur of the winter hat, or abundance of the war awards. The scenic choreography is hardly articulated as most of the images are close-ups of the faces; less than five images portray the deceased in a full posture standing or sitting in the setting. The planimetric composition, including the picture’s formal structure in the plane and the compositional rules, are determined by the central focus on the face. Most of the images depict frontal, eye-level view, although a three quarter view or a perspective from below is also present. Overall, the present grave imagery follows visual conventions imported from the Soviet model. As shown above, there are rather two aspects that might be specific to this setting: the choice of particular portraits (not a serene but casual occasion when the portrait was taken: a man during the hunt or a woman in her home dress on the sofa) and their placement on the grave (in a weary plastic frame or home-made wooden frame; in a combination with all the former pictures and name plates used, while even when the grave stone is renewed, the old elements must remain next to the gravestone or on it, as nothing at the cemetery can be taken home, to the realm of the living).

Last but not least, in each case the image has gone through a quite distinct social life: received as a gift from the army buddy, cut out from a local newspaper dedicated to the local exemplary worker (Stakhanovets), circulated from household to household until it reached the final owner, or “just taken for myself, for the good memories” (as numerous informants claim). If it was not the photo itself, which was exchanged, it was the camera at the time of shooting. For example, some informants told me that during their travel they deliberately exchanged their cameras with another visitor; they would shoot each other during the trip and at the end of it get their cameras back. This way they would end up with the pictures of themselves.

So far it was suggested that the images placed on the graves are visible and identifiable. In this case, according to my observations, the photos communicate foremost of all with the living: they are seen by the visitors and can reciprocate their glance; they represent the deceased the way the person is remembered by those who bury them; they offer those visual hints, which might ease the process of remembering the person
by younger generations; the images are part of the commemoration practice: when dwelling in the place and thinking of the dead, the families may at one point look at the portrait and feed the ancestor; at the end of the first memorial, some people may come to the portrait, say a few words and kiss the image (in a sense of giving farewell, because on this day the grave should not be visited and the next commemoration shall take place outside the cemetery). And yet, photographs come along with the usual procedure without transforming its basics; they might facilitate the communication and make some new elements of the practice emerge, for instance the farewell. Nevertheless, without photographs the commemoration can still easily take place.

In fact, beside the photographic images, some other, pre-photographic visualisations are used: for instance, a) in order to appease the deceased when entering the cemetery, local people use another visual hint. Two men, usually the oldest and the most experienced in the family, have to go quietly, sneak to the tomb and grasp the stone behind the pillar with a rope. The stone “head” is caught into lasso (Chukchi chaat) and held “tamed” until the end of commemoration. b) A thread is tightened onto wrist of everyone who comes to the funeral; it is something like a virtual “hello or thanks” from the ancestors, a way of sharing the event, as well as a way of protection. c) During the period between the burial and the first commemoration, particular things important to the deceased, e.g. Chukchi reindeer herder’s belt (Photo in colour appendix) or Kivak Yupik man’s (Quiwaaghmii) pebble from his home, are stored at home and regularly fed. Such modes of visualisation or materialisation of the seemingly absent people or things are quite common. Similarly, among Yupiget the prevailing amount of communication with the dead is done through dreams and not at all through the photo images. This is only to give a few examples to point out that
photographic media have entered cultural context, which was already inclined to symbolic thinking. The main purpose of all these practices, as the locals believe, is to enable the process, in which the living please the ancestors and the spirits. If they are satisfied, the life of the living is good. Visualisation is a part of this reciprocal process.

If communication through the photos is at all used, it is based on the fact that the portraits are visible; it might be taken-for-granted for the ceramic portraits, which are durable. Nevertheless, most of the images are placed between two transparent plastic plates, which cannot, in any way, protect the images against the polar climate. As a result, the photographs are so severely damaged that just traces of former portraits can be actually seen. What happens with the portraits, which are weathered, ruined by rain, wind and moisture in terms of semiotics? How can these images be understood if the original portrayed subject has been lost? If the graves are meant to enable communication with the deceased and it is the living that are to use the photos, then such a function is seriously impaired. However, no matter how great the loss of the original “signifier” might seem, i.e. how irretrievable the appearance of the image is (i.e. of ancestor’s identity), the mental image associated with the “signified” (ancestor’s death) is kept by the tacit knowledge (Bohnsack, 2008) embedded in other forms of memory: name, genealogy, or narratives. Such “empty” images (images without depiction) can be thus associated with the relevant meaning, too. With every single gust of wind, snow fall or rain drop, the images lose their iconical significance but regain iconographical significance: the stains of rust and mould, the scratches and scrapes, the here-and-there lines and dots do not signify a memento of irretrievable loss. In contrary, the images materialize the local notion of death as disappearing and yet staying ever present. Visual inventories of personal transitions thus parallel the bigger scale life-cycle mechanism related to the collective histories.

Beside the grave portraits, there are photographs of the deceased, which receive considerable respect when placed at homes; they are objects of memory and commemoration. They are often decorated with embroidery, framed, hung on the wall or hanging carpet, or placed in the living room glass cabinet. These displays resemble “home shrines” or “familial altars” but not in a strict sense: the only religious practice bound to them, which I observed, is the feeding the spirits. Even that, however, does not have to be done near the picture. Every time a new package of food is opened or fresh meal is made, the feeding is done by throwing a tiny piece of the food or spilling a drop of a drink into the corner. The feeding directly into the air can be done in other places at home, almost anywhere because spirits are everywhere. The feeding through fire is done only outside or when a fire stove is available.

The basic format of commemorating portraits is a single frame, in which several small pictures of different deceased relatives are placed. According to the belief, as locals recall it, depiction of a living person next to the dead can bring him/her closer to death; it means that there is supposed to be one frame for the deceased and other frames for the living. This strict separation of the pictures of the deceased and the living is, however, not followed consistently anymore; some informants claim that such a principle was kept in 1970s and 1980s. Nowadays, the photo assemblage (photos put together in one frame, not cut out and put together in a new, creative way) can contain both the images of the dead and of the living. Moreover, the genre of such assemblage can serve to recall the pleasant moments of the living, e.g. travel, vacation, or studies in the city. The rest of the commemorating photos are single portraits hung
on the wall, often without a frame. Some are put in a small series of 3-5. Some “old” pictures, as the informants call them, (usually black-and-white images) exist in a single original and are, therefore, considered precious. Such photographs are passed on when, for instance, a daughter leaves the parents’ house after her marriage. Nevertheless, these photos can be now easily copied and reprinted by those locals who travel to city on vacation or for studies.

The photo portraits made in 1971 by Alekseev are often the only portraits of the particular relative owned by the family and therefore are used to commemorate the ancestors. Once the director of the school museum asked me to print out some photos. I made a series of high quality printouts of the photos as I believed she needed them for the showcase. I was surprised to learn upon my return to the hamlet that all the photos were distributed in different households. Such spreading and sharing of a photo, which depicts one’s relative is a common practice in the hamlet.

The photos of the dead themselves are not edited. There is no “invention” of the dead through visual means as it is demonstrated by Grégory Delaplace (referring to de Certeau) on the Mongolian material (Delaplace, 2008). Visual effects (offered by such software as Adobe Photoshop) are known mostly to young people in the village. They have already made numerous collages or assemblages for the purpose of a school presentation, a display for national holidays, or as a gift for the retiring teacher. Such effects are often used to pinpoint emotional (funny) moments or make the photo more decorative. These young people, however, play no role in creating the displays of the dead at home. This is done by the oldest women in the families. Moreover, I have not collected any visual material which would demonstrate the intention of the living to construct a distinct memory of the dead or to make the dead look different person. The only exception might be the colouration of the black-and-white photos (enamel grave photos) and the decorative framing (home displays). Idealization of the living and the dead is restricted to the narratives, including such Soviet official genre as a testimonial for encouragement/promotion (kharakteristika dlja poshrenia) still used today. I cannot at this point of my research of visual culture in Chukotka competently argue why there is so limited human interference with the visual but I would assume that in general, the locals are quite “stiff” (as one Chukchi art teacher put it) about changing or developing the usual visual patterns and techniques. This is certainly so in the traditional art forms, such as bone engraving, embroidery, and sewing, but not as much in the bone carving where new patterns come from (or are revealed in) the form of the individual material itself. This proclivity has deeper roots than the Soviet import and, therefore, cannot be interpreted within the Soviet and post-Soviet time framework, as offered by Delaplace (2008) in regard to Mongolia. More inquiry, however, is needed before any conclusions are made.

MEMORY

As mentioned above, home photography in Siberia is a Soviet cultural product. In its very social origin, however, it remains a phenomenon of modernity: mechanical reproduction (Benjamin, 1977) of the visual provides people with the testimony and memory of their existence. Through photos issues kept invisible, concealed, and hidden, obtain observable shape and form. It is intriguing then to find out whether distinct visual forms entered the Siberian model of memory.
As the subject of this study is grave portraits and home portraits of the ancestors, memory under stake here is related to the remembrance of the deceased persons and their commemoration. A person’s individuality is not a mere utterance; the photos are perceptible testimonies of it. And yet, is the photography the only tangible testimony of the persons, their personalities and distinct biographies? In Yupik case, it is observable that photography enters the already existing model and, perhaps, intensifies it. In the pre-photographic mode of memory keeping, it is the name soul or person’s name (Nuttall, 1994: 123) which plays a dominant role in preserving the notion of ancestorship.

The belief that the dead ancestors have their names come back (as they wish), reflects the circular conception of the universe divided into two modes of natural and supernatural where nothing can be added – what gets lost from the world of living returns to the world of dead and vice versa (Hamayon, 1990; Bodenhorn, 2000; Vaté, 2003, 2007). I shall use the emic term return, which might change the perspective. The locals say that often in the dream, the deceased claim about their return. They say: “I will come back in your child” (Yupik, Sireniki dialect, lpek tagnuggagpegun uteglequnga) or simply “I will come” (Chukchi, treyet). The person who is born is called “the one who has returned” (Yupik, uteghtekaq). Most scholars (including Willerslev, 2009) use the term rebirth for the dead coming to life through the new-born descendants and return for the living, who go back to the realm of the dead. This logic follows the hierarchical order, in which the dead stand higher than the living. For the living Yupiget and Chukchi people, however, it is possible to respect the hierarchy and at the same time see the matter from one’s own perspective, from the view of someone, who is still alive.

Drawing on the study of Mark Nuttall (1994) on the acquisition of a dead person’s name in one Inuit community in the Upernavik district of northwest Greenland, I studied similar phenomenon among Yupiget and Chukchi people in Russia. Personal names represent one of the most central features of community cognition. Here the “return” is materialised in the name soul, which “upon death leaves the body and remains ‘homeless’ until it is called back to reside in the body of a new-born child” (Nuttall, 1994: 123).

During the Soviet era, the naming became more complicated. I will not get into too many details here because this issue requires a separate article. I will just mention that on the official level (birth certificate, IDs etc.), Yupiget and Chukchi people started naming their children with Russian first names, adopted patronyms, and made up surnames (the first surnames usually come from the first names of the father or mother). The name soul has persisted as an inner, more intimate name. Numerous informants told me that person can have several local names (names to mislead the bad spirits) but “only those names are real, which have already been used” (V. E., Yupik), i.e. the name souls. The name soul must be called so often, so that the ancestor is pleased. This way the deceased is remembered, and therefore, satisfied. If the false name is used or the right name is used inappropriately, the ancestor gives a sign – s/he appears in the dream and claims his/her wishes. Nowadays the name soul is used by parents sporadically also in order to recall their children who they are, whom they returned. The continuity of this name materializes the concept of circulation of the living.

The name soul serves as a mnemonic device in the intergenerational transmission: Inata (Yupik) came back for the first time in Dmitriy Seliakin. Then he returned in the same year through Ekaterina Nutanaun (alive) and Vladimir Seliakin (already decea-
In 7 years, Inata supposedly came back again with the birth of Nadezhda Povolskich. She is already the 4th one to return and to hold the name Inata. This example shows how the name sets several individuals in a close social association, even those persons who have not been yet in a close kin relationship.

Moreover, naming is a mode of classification, a phenomenon that confers a social identity on the person who, while being himself or herself, is simultaneously regarded as a returned deceased relative. According to the above mentioned example, Marina Ivanovna Seliakina had a patrilineal uncle called Inata, brother Dmitriy Inata, and son Vladimir Seliakin; that is what the “regular” kinship system demonstrates. In the system of relations set by the name soul, Marina’s son was at the same time her patrilineal uncle and brother. So there might have been a life situation, in which Dmitriy reminded of himself through Vladimir, i.e. Vladimir acted as if he was Dmitriy; Marina then could address Vladimir with the word “Bro”, not “Son”. The affinities of the personal traits of those persons, who hold the same name soul, make people recall their dead ancestors. In my presence, however, Yupiget in New Chaplino used just the name soul and did not pinpoint the quasi-kin relationship set by the person’s name. In a Chukchi example, the affinity of two persons is actually expressed.

Image 1: “Return” of Inata (Liakagmiit)
through address: “My mother's mother returned in me. When I am strict [like my Granny], my mother uses my name soul or addresses me with the word “Mum” (M. D., Chukchi). Local children learn the identities of those people they are named after and acquire a knowledge of the various relationships that link them to an intricate pattern of genealogical and affinal kin. Kin relationships by name are often extended beyond own lineage, however, and therefore encompass a wider network of people and may include broader relations of solidarity.

And yet, there is nothing implicit in naming that informs people how to act. Although all the individuals who hold the same name soul, as mentioned above, may also share some personal traits, which liken them to Inata, they have their own distinct personalities and biographies. Shared names are reference points in a complex network of interpersonal relationships amongst persons, both the living and the dead. Nevertheless, they do not determine people’s personality. There is a vast room for particularity, which can be expressed through individual skills, conduct and likings (“excellent hunter”, “cheerful kind of guy”, “mother of ten children, out of which four died tragically”). Under the impact of the Soviet model, however, it is an individual’s face, which has become the reference point in identifying and distinguishing the persons, and the portrait photography – the modern means for remembering and commemorating them.

The presence of ancestors in everyday life is no abstraction for the locals. The name soul as well as the aghqesiaghtughaqut (yup.) are addressed in everyday practices; in fact, they are so taken-for-granted that nobody needs to articulate them. Without any particular need to make the things obvious or pronounce the “proper names” (Foucault, 1989: 10), photographic image, first and foremost, an iconical sign with primary denotative meaning, found its place in these social settings. Possibly, pictures could enhance intensity of the existing practices of action with their obtuse, connotative meaning (Barthes, 1991: 53), which can be transmitted only in the form of ambiguity and contrariness. Beside the question of who is depicted, it is therefore important to reveal the intrinsic meaning of how the particular image emerged and, in this case, also disappeared.

CONCLUSION

Photography is a recent element in very complex, multiple relations between the living and the deceased. At the same time, it relates to the conditions of the collective and individual effort of procuring memory of the deceased, whose position in life of the living is decisive. A good relation with the dead is a key to one’s own well-being. It must be regularly sustained by paying respect to the ancestors. Beside the “feeding” and naming, it is the modern means of photo imagery, which provides yet larger room for commemoration. On the one side, the name souls acquire their multiple individual faces (identities), which result in a precise visual reference system. On the other side, communication with ancestors may be addressed more vividly through the means of photos.

In addition, photography is apt to materialize the transition by depicting those persons who are not among the living any more. Even more so, when the actual photo of the deceased becomes completely absent. Such is the case of those photo portraits, which get blown away, ruined and weathered at the cemetery. Such absence is re-read
as a new code: what has disappeared is not gone but omnipresent. The already habitual, routinized practices of commemoration are thus newly structured by tacit experience of the photo imagery; e.g. every renewal of the photo portrait is accompanied by the regular feeding of the spirits or a more substantial annual commemoration service.

And yet the difference between the existing practices and the imported ones is striking. If the name preserves the memory of at least four generations including the precise position of the deceased person in the complex genealogical and quasi-genealogical system, the visual memory survives hardly two generations. While photography can under certain conditions preserve memory of the individual person, the collective memory remains heavily dependent on the traditional mechanism. Consequently, although photography in Russian Beringia has its origin in modern/Soviet *modus vivendi*, it neither effaces, nor deeply transforms the existing practices of commemoration; it accompanies them and in certain contexts intensifies them.

Acknowledgements
The study presented in this article was conducted within the fellowship program “Research in Paris” financed by the Paris City Hall (Mairie de Paris). Author is indebted to Virginie Vaté for supervision, Roberte Hamayon and Jean-Luc Lambert for further commentary, and to the GSRL at the CNRS-EPHE for intellectual support. The author also wishes to thank her numerous Yupik, Chukchi and Russian collaborators. The work in progress of this study was presented on 4th November 2014 at the day conference “Objectives and Issues of the Anthropological and Archaeological Research in the Northern Pacific” at the CNRS organized by Virginie Vaté, Claire Alix and David Koester.

REFERENCES


Nuttall, M. (1994). The Name Never Dies: Gre-
Jaroslava Panáková (*1980) received MA and PhD degrees in Social Anthropology at the Saint Petersburg State University, Russia as well as MA in Documentary Cinema at the FAMU, Academy of Performing Arts, Prague. In the years 2008–2011, she worked at the Siberian Studies Centre, Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology in Halle, Germany. In 2014, she was granted a year postdoc fellowship of the City Hall of Paris “Research in Paris” at the CNRS-EPHE. She currently works as an assistant professor and researcher at Comenius University in Bratislava, Slovakia. Her areas of interest are Visual anthropology, Siberian studies, mobility and social change.
Filipinos are avid consumers of South Korean media products. Teenagers and young adults know the lyrics and dance moves of their favorite K-Pop performers while older viewers are engrossed in the weekly Korean television dramas (known in the Philippines as “Koreanovelas”). There exists, however, a fundamental disconnect between the idealized images disseminated in the media and their everyday lived experiences. Thus, my objective in this article is to examine how Filipino consumers negotiate these conflicting messages. More simply stated, I would like to explore the relationship between Koreans and Filipinos in the Philippines through the prism of what has been referred to as the “Korean Wave”.

Key words: South Korea, K-Pop, Philippines, globalization, media ethnography

This article will explore what has now been referred to as the “Korean Wave” or “Hallyu” to describe the phenomenon by which South Korean media exports, such as cinematic films, television dramas, and popular music, are spreading throughout Asia and, increasingly, the world. Indeed, at the time of this writing, Psy’s “Gangnam Style” has been viewed more than two billion times on YouTube, making it the site’s most “liked” video in its history. Not surprisingly, Euny Hong has declared that “it would not be an exaggeration to say that Hallyu is the world’s biggest, fastest cultural paradigm shift in modern history” (Hong, 2014: 4).

The South Korean government has supported the expansion of the country’s culture industry abroad, seeing it as a tool to promote Korea’s global reputation. The Korean Wave serves as a hegemonic vehicle for “soft power” through the marketing of Korean cultural values as opposed to traditional methods of “hard power” based on coercion and oppression. In an article for National Public Radio (NPR) entitled, “Gangnam Style: Three Reasons K-Pop is Taking Over the World”, Zoe Chace attributes the global phenomenon of “Gangnam Style”, and South Korean pop music more generally, to the government’s deliberate decision to produce mass media in the same way that it produces cars: “An infrastructure to make and export culture can develop just like an infrastructure to make and export anything else” (Chace, 2012). In the
21st century, the South Korean government has emphasized the importance of cultural content as the new driving engine for the national economy. As part of its “10 Point Action Plan”, the Council on Korea’s Nation Branding decided to promote the Korean Wave program by providing developing nations with the technical assistance to help their economies move forward based on its past achievement of double-digit economic growth during the industrialization period (Dinnie, 2009).

During the summer of 2012, I was selected as one of the participants for a Faculty Enhancement Program in South Korea entitled “Understanding Global Trends Through Korean History: Cultural Synthesis, Colonialism, Cold War and Globalization”. Funded by the Mellon Foundation, this three-week travel seminar enabled us to visit important cultural and historical sites. I noticed a common thread woven throughout the various site visits: namely, the discrepancy between what Erving Goffman calls “front stage” and “back stage” (Goffman, 1959). As an economic juggernaut, South Korea has reached a point where it possesses the means to (re)-construct its national identity and historical memory. At the various museums, memorials, folk villages, and even the Buddhist temple stay, there was a clear and deliberate message that South Korea is a modern and industrialized society that still values and celebrates its ancient customs and traditions. But this is simply propaganda. The Korean Wave fits within this larger national narrative as a state promulgated discourse of national strength.

My objective in this research project to investigate sites of media reception in one particular developing Southeast Asian country, the Philippines, is to determine how these messages are transmitted and interpreted. Although Koreans now constitute the largest immigrant population in the Philippines, there is a tenuous relationship between these two groups marked by mutual antipathy. I have overheard many Koreans describe Filipinos as impoverished, lazy, and socially backwards. They appear to have internalized a racial hierarchy whereby they perceive their darker-skinned Asian counterparts as ranking lower on the pigmentocracy scale. Conversely, Filipinos complain incessantly that Korean immigrants and visitors alike are arrogant, rude, and provincial, refusing to learn not only Tagalog but also English.

Yet Filipinos are avid consumers of South Korean media products. Teenagers and young adults know the lyrics and dance moves of their favorite K-Pop performers while older viewers are engrossed in the weekly Korean television dramas (known in the Philippines as “Koreanovelas”). There exists, however, a fundamental disconnect between the idealized images disseminated in the media and their everyday lived experiences. Thus, my primary goal was to examine how Filipino consumers of Korean media negotiate these conflicting messages by exploring the relationship between Koreans and Filipinos in the Philippines through the prism of the Korean Wave.

BACKGROUND

Popular Korean music, called “kayo” or “song of lyrics” traces its origins to the colonial era, stemming from Japanese, Chinese, European, and American influences (Lee, 2006: 130). Kayo traditionally relates to poetry in medieval Korea but now refers to a variety of genres, such as ballads, dance music, rock, and hip-hop. The genre of Korean pop, or “K-Pop,” is superficially a hybrid of many of these different styles, but blended together to create something distinctly “Korean.” Since the late 1990s, this
genre has gained a broad international following, particularly among East and Southeast Asian urban youths. The messages of K-Pop appeal to issues of modernization and what it means to be “Asian” in an increasingly global and commercial world.

K-Pop is situated within a larger context of increased Korean cultural exports. In addition to music, Korean television dramas and films have gathered a large following among fans in Asia, particularly in China, Japan, Vietnam, and, of course, the Philippines. *Hallyu* began in the 1990s, a period marked with decreased media restriction and censorship by the South Korean government. This deregulation led to a large amount of unscheduled airtime; television networks consequently turned to the music industry to fill these slots. This resulted in the development of music videos, which established the high degree of visibility and aesthetic focus of K-Pop music. The industry also created promotional programs, such as interviews with musicians, reports about concerts, shows hosted by singers, etc. that served to increase interest in the artists, in addition to the music (Lee, 2006: 132). This led to a culture of idolization, where stars are constantly scrutinized in their role as “national representatives” of Korea.

**GLOBAL AND LOCAL**

Despite the relaxation of direct control and regulation, the South Korean government remained involved in the film and, to a lesser extent, music industries in the late 1990s.

Following the economic collapse in 1997, the Korean government began to invest in the cultural industries, recognizing the importance of local production; for instance, it required that movie theaters show only locally produced movies for a certain number of days per year (Lee, 2006: 130). With the rising popularity of Korean media abroad, cultural exports such as film, television shows, and music became a significant component of South Korea’s economic growth. Fans from all over East and Southeast Asia spend money on Korean language courses, tours of locations depicted in television dramas, and camps that will bring them closer to their idols. Some artists are also linked to Korean consumer products and services through marketing and advertisement campaigns in foreign countries (Shim, 2006: 30). In these ways, “Korean” culture is commoditized, packaged and exported throughout Asia.

K-Pop reflects issues of cultural rights, given its place as a locally produced and globally consumed medium. It could be argued that K-Pop is counter-hegemonic, in its attempts to challenge the influence of traditionally colonial, Western media. Yet at the same time, Korea’s cultural influence has been characterized as “soft power,” an expression of influence that relies on manipulating images and values, rather than the typical military or economic control of “hard power” (Lee, 2008: 179). The global spread of K-Pop represents a wider assertion of Korea’s competitive edge in its political interactions with other countries, resulting in a sense of “cultural nationalism”, where culture is associated with knowledge and economy (Lee, 2008: 181). This can also lead to feelings of cultural essentialism, where producers or government officials express the sentiment that K-Pop is appealing because of the inherent “superior” nature of Korean culture and values conveyed in the music. This discourse tends to overemphasize the national consciousness of the artists, while disregarding the hybrid nature of K-Pop music, such as the influence of Western styles like hip-hop and rap.
Others argue that the localization of K-Pop messages and artists can be a hindrance to its future ability to attract a global audience. Yi Oh Yong, the former Minister of Culture and Tourism in Korea, claims that K-Pop must lose its “parochial” character in order to appeal to a mainstream, global audience (Lee, 2008: 179). One method for creating a more global product is by “pluralizing us”, where the boundaries of “Korean-ness” in the music become broader through tropes, such as the use of non-black hair dye and non-Korean lyrics (Lee, 2006: 142). Although the Korean character of the music may not have changed, the artists aesthetically link themselves to a more international culture.

HYBRIDITY AND MODERNIZATION

K-Pop is generally considered to be a hybridization of multiple forms of pop music, such as rap, hip-hop, ballads, and R&B. Perhaps the first song to introduce this style with any measure of success was Seo Taiji and Boys’ “I Know”, released in 1992. This song was revolutionary in its experimentation with different styles of dance and music, particularly rap. Although the style of Seo Taiji’s music demonstrated indebtedness to Western genres, the actual messages conveyed reflected more Korean content. Seo Taiji challenged the traditional ballads by singing about issues that appealed to youths, such as the educational system and desires for unification with North and South Korea (Shim, 2006: 37). The syncretic style of Seo Taiji reflected an increasing global awareness among urban youths, and a desire for a more “modern” sound. Seo Taiji and Boys became the first K-Pop stars to make it big, selling more than 6 million copies of their four albums within four years. His music ushered in the age of Korean cultural consciousness, where locally produced music became more valued than foreign styles.

However, prior to the Korean Wave, Western and Japanese popular cultures were dominant among youths and urban professionals across Asia (Lee, 2008: 176). In many respects, K-Pop can be viewed within Asia as a measure of counter-imperialism. Although the musical styles may appear to reflect American or European genres, the actual content and interpretation of K-Pop music is deemed to belong to the shared “cultural proximity” of Asia. Within Asian countries, there is a sense of “contamination of the imperial” after years of European and American colonial influence. As such, K-Pop provides a music that appeals to concepts of modernity, yet simultaneously appropriates it to belong to a blended “pan-Asian” culture.

Within Asia, there are also issues of imperialism and cultural domination, due to Japan’s history of colonizing Asian countries, particularly Korea. This proves problematic for Korean and other East Asian consumers of Japanese culture, with the South Korean government even banning Japanese imports from 1978–1999. In 1984, Korea became drawn into a national debate over ppontchak, a style of popular music with a 2/4 or 4/4 beat. Arguments raged over whether this style of music had traditional Korean origins, or developed from Japanese music, such as enka, during the occupation. Some scholars also posited a more nuanced theory, that ppontchak is neither wholly Japanese nor wholly Korean in origin; instead, it developed out of an interaction of the two cultures, with the final product remaining distinct and complete from both influences. Since it was Japanese colonial policy to assimilate Korea by altering its language and culture, it was not surprising that the musical style bore ele-
ments of Japanese aesthetics. Proponents of this argument also point out that ppongtchak artists have influenced Japanese enka music, indicating that cultural transmission often occurs in both directions, rather than strictly from the dominant to the subordinate (Pak, 2006: 66). Although this occurred over a decade before the official Korean Wave, the arguments and issues of identity in ppongtchak remain relevant to the questions of hybridity and cultural essentialism in K-Pop. In Korea, there remains an incontrovertible sense of national pride and resistance to cultural domination, which plays out in the strict focus on “authentic” Korean artists and musical themes.

In addition, modern Japanese media is occasionally viewed as being too “Westernized”, whereas Korean media expresses more “traditional” and “Asian” values, such as Confucianism and family focus (Lin & Tong, 2008: 94). In comparing Japanese and Korean television dramas, Chinese consumers claimed that Korean dramas depicted more “pure” or “restrained” love, compared to the more sexually explicit and “liberalized” Japanese products (Lin & Tong, 2008: 103). Consequently, Korean media is interpreted as remaining more traditional than some other Asian products, appealing to the sense of nostalgia in the older generation of consumers. Although the music of K-Pop appeals primarily to a younger, urbanized audience, it remains more conservative than other genres, in part due to government and self-censorship. The artists and fans interact to reinforce this idea of traditionalism, with fans expecting artists to engage in more demure, humble behaviors off of the stage (Willoughby, 2006: 100).

The imagery of K-Pop music videos reflects both a sense of nostalgia and modernity. Many of the music videos focus on an urban setting, to appeal to its primarily socially mobile, young audience. A sense of Korean identity is presented as belonging to a pure, yet modern past. This is particularly apparent in the ballad genre of Korean popular music, where the singers place themselves and their sad love story within a cityscape that reflects elements of nostalgia, such as old shops or small towns (Lee, 2006: 134). Consequently, the “traditional” themes and messages of Korean media reflect a wish to return to this purified past, while remaining relevant in an urbanized, modern setting.

THE “IDOL” CULTURE

In Korea, stars are made, not born. Partly due to their high degree of visibility, K-Pop stars are selected not just for musical talent, but also for their appearance and personal appeal to both Korean and international audiences. For example, some artists are chosen by producers for their ability to speak Japanese or English (Shim, 2006: 38). For this reason, a large number of artists are Korean-Americans, who are seen as being culturally fluent in both Korea and America. These artists are colloquially referred to as “salmon”, because they return to their homeland or country of birth, and are expected to wholly embrace their Korean identity (Lee, 2006: 140). In 2002, the Los Angeles-raised artist Yoo Seungjun opted for a United States citizenship in order to avoid serving in the Korean military. This resulted in a huge backlash, losing him albums, TV shows, and advertisement spots. Consequently, the music industry became more wary of global mobility in favor of local loyalty, at least insofar as the artists are concerned.

The process of making “idols” is also highly industrialized. Most artists are selected at a young age (in their early teens or preteens), and taken out of the normal school.
system, to be taught solely the skills needed in the music and music video industry (Shim, 2006: 38). Music producers typically establish the image that they are trying to create, and then find artists who will fill this image. The individual role of the artist in establishing his or her own image is minimal. In addition, very few stars will actually go on to have long-term, successful careers. Most artists only last a few months, and once their image loses popularity, they are quickly discarded by the production companies (Willoughby, 2006: 101–102). Thus, although K-Pop revolves around individual singers and the images they project, these personas are almost entirely manufactured by marketers, based on what will “sell”. Along those lines, artists represent a very materialist culture, with their styles becoming commoditized and branded for consumption by the audience. The clothing trends set by artists are imitated by fans, since “the only way to prove one is a true fan is to look just like the stars” (Willoughby, 2006: 106). Fans will even go so far as to undergo plastic surgery in an attempt to look even more like their idols. Thus, style irrevocably supersedes the musical aspects of K-Pop, particularly as it becomes exported to other regions where the fandom is more restricted by fewer opportunities to see live performances.

Because of this focus on visibility, K-Pop stars are constantly scrutinized, both on and off the stage. In concert and on the television, artists are expected to wear sexier clothes and act more rebelliously. This serves as a medium of wish fulfillment, through which members of the audience can express their desires while maintaining their own actions within the realm of socially acceptable behavior. At the same time, K-Pop artists are also expected to act with humility and restraint in their “everyday” (though still highly publicized) lives. When artists do not remain within the bounds of expected behavior, they experience a huge backlash, as in the case of NaMi, who was considered to be sexually promiscuous and was so harshly criticized that she moved to Japan (Willoughby, 2006: 100). Women in particular experience contradictory images of appropriate behavior on the stage. In recent years, they have been transformed into sexual objects, dancing and dressing provocatively, although rarely at the level of Western or Japanese media. At other times, they are expected to reflect ideas of purity, almost to the point of being infantilized, in keeping with the ideas of Asian “traditional” values of sexual reservation. Another aspect of image is the concept of beauty; many women undergo plastic surgery to look more European, such as lifting the eyelids or building up the bridge of the nose (Willoughby, 2006: 105). However, this practice of facial modification is rarely acknowledged, since artists are expected to express a “natural” beauty. No matter what the act or appearance is on stage, K-Pop idols are expected to maintain ideals of morality in their daily lives, and act as positive role models for their primarily younger audiences.

**CULTURAL RIGHTS FOR PRODUCERS AND RECEIVERS**

K-Pop appropriates the styles of Western music, such as hip-hop, metal, rap, and more, to create an internationally consumed product that is recognized as having distinctive Korean qualities. The use of “traditional” Korean music styles and instruments is generally limited, although some artists have made an effort to use these elements to create a more “authentic” Korean sound. Nevertheless, the music of K-Pop relies heavily on technology, such as synthesizers and the electric bass, to appeal to an urbanized, modern audience. Despite the use of styles that originated in Western
media, K-Pop is branded as having a unique, “Korean” form, focusing on more traditional values. This is in many ways counter-hegemonic to the historical Western cultural influences, by focusing on restraint, family, and “Confucian” values, as opposed to the more sexual and explicit themes of Western music and lyrics.

Although it primarily reflects issues of Korean identity, K-Pop is now being widely consumed and reinterpreted by non-Korean audiences as belonging to a sort of “pan-Asian” moral code. It is quickly becoming a dominant cultural export, which raises further issues of hegemony and power within East and Southeast Asia. Korea’s “soft power”, the ability to manipulate image through music, films, and television, could have long-reaching effects on the political relations between Asian countries. In addition, because the music glorifies Korean identity, non-Korean consumers may experience feelings of cultural inferiority, in their desire to obtain a lifestyle that is like the ones portrayed in music videos and television. In choosing K-Pop over other locally produced music, non-Korean consumers may be implicitly criticizing the music of their own culture.

Ultimately, K-Pop expresses ideas of modernization and globalization within Asia. It co-opts Western styles to depict Korean identities, which are consumed and interpreted to belong to pan-Asian ideals. The “cult” following of idols requires a level of restraint in both the private and public lives of artists, and reinforces the concept of Asian restraint and morality, in direct contrast to the more sexually explicit Western images portrayed in music and the media. Although K-Pop is counter-hegemonic to the historical imperialism of the West, it also enacts another sense of hegemony and Korean idealization on non-Korean consumers. The production, distribution, and consumption of K-Pop reflects a series of complex political, social, and economic interactions between various nations.

**METHODOLOGY**

My research in the Philippines focused on the consumption of South Korean media and non-media products by college students at De La Salle University in Manila. College students are a logical constituency since young people between the ages of 15 to 25 are the most devoted consumers of Korean popular culture. DLSU is widely considered to be one of the top research universities in the country. I targeted a wide variety of students ranging from first years to seniors. I also made deliberate efforts to ensure that these students came from different colleges within the university.

In keeping with my training and previous fieldwork experience, I employed the standard ethnographic techniques of participant observation, surveys, focus groups, and semi-structured interviews to collect my data. The research design was organized in the form of an inverted triangle, proceeding from the broad to the increasingly narrow. Thus, the responses from the surveys helped to identify members to invite for the focus groups, from which the most engaging individuals were selected for one-on-one interviews.
MEDIA CONSUMPTION

The first area of inquiry related to the consumption of Korean media exports. Here, I focused on fans of K-Pop and other forms of Korean media among the student body of De La Salle. I began by distributing an online survey among students enrolled in the College of Liberal Arts. To my pleasant surprise, there were 276 total respondents. Although the surveys were anonymous, I included a section that asked for contact information if they were willing to discuss their interests further in interviews. Almost a third of the respondents complied. It became abundantly clear to me that not only are young Filipino men and women avid consumers of Korean media products, they are more than willing to share their enthusiasm as fans.

Although television and the Internet both offer K-Pop content, these media differ in the amount of content they provide. For instance, free television channels like ABS-CBN and MA have little or no airtime for Korean music and videos, which explains why so few of the respondents selected it as their primary means of consumption. Meanwhile, pay cable channels such as Arirang and KBS World have relatively more content available but these are also available online in free media-hosting sites such as YouTube and MediaFire. There are many Internet users worldwide who upload videos, songs, and other media content in these media-hosting sites, which in turn become available for free to anyone who wishes to access the links.

Due to the proliferation of online content, Filipino fans primarily utilize the Internet to access Korean music and videos. Aside from being the main source of media content such as videos, songs, and images, the Internet also served as a tool for news and updates. Indeed, my interviewees mentioned sites like allkpop and dailykpop as their main sources for the latest news about their favorite idol groups. According to one of my informants, this type of crowdsourcing enables fans such as herself to feel closer to their idols: “Fans are able to share their fan art, get info about their idols, and the idols themselves are able to communicate with their fans in a personal way”. Another informant told me that she regularly checks updates from her favorite K-Pop idols through various social networking sites. Having browsed the accounts of some of these Korean stars, I noticed that they openly provide information about themselves for the fans to read. Through these, fans can obtain a closer look to the daily lives of their favorite idols with just one click.

To pursue this phenomenon further, I followed several K-Pop fans via Twitter and observed the happenings in their timelines. A large number of tweets were devoted to
their favorite K-Pop groups and idols. Noticeably, all the tweets contain stories about what a certain artist was doing at a certain moment and included promotional information about their albums, music videos and the like. There were also videos and live streams that have millions of views from users around the world with a great number coming from the Philippines.

Filipino fans of Korean media exports do not seem to be discouraged about the language barrier. As the saying goes, music is a universal language. Moreover, fans of K-Pop are drawn mostly by the beat and choreography. In addition, one of my interviewees stated that the first thing she looks for in a K-Pop song is not the message or its lyrics but the catchiness of their music. Fans are also attracted to the universal themes present in these songs, such as romantic love, unrequited love, friendship, and diligence. So in spite of the unfamiliar language, fans still found a way to understand the stories behind the music.

Next, the following table indicates the most common reasons given for the popularity of Korean soap operas (or “Koreanovelas”, as they are called):

Koreanovelas are appealing to Filipinos because of their more riveting plotlines compared to the locally produced telenovelas and also because the characters are more aesthetically pleasing, as one of my informants stated: “I don’t like watching telenovelas, but I like watching Koreanovelas. Telenovelas are boring, Koreanovelas are fun! They’re more unpredictable. And the girls are cuter, too”. Filipino fans find mass mediated Korean attractive yet also relatable because they share similar Asian values such as the importance of family and respect for elders. But there is also something else happening.
NON-MEDIA CONSUMERISM

In an interview with Dr. Crisanta Flores, a professor of Filipino Literature at the University of the Philippines in Diliman, she asserted that “the target audience of the Korean dramas is not the poor but the lower middle class with aspirations to advance in their economic and social status.” In poorer countries such as the Philippines, the peoples and lifestyles presented in the Korean music videos and soap operas are aspirational. Exported media products are exceedingly popular throughout Southeast Asia precisely because they represent an idealized future. This explains why Korean media products encourage Filipinos to consume their non-media counterparts: they are, in essence, attempting to get closer to an idealized way of life.

There is also a tremendous variety of Korean products available in the marketplace. Some of these products, such as cosmetics, are marketed directly in connection with Korean media. According to Kim Hee-jeong, a marketing manager of The Face Shop: “Cosmetics sales tend to mirror the popularity of Korean cultural exports, so K-Pop stars are the best way to market our products”, Moreover, the way these idols and stars are marketed is very specialized. As one of my interviewees stated, “Koreans offer something for everyone”. She added that “if you like the badboy type, they’ll market one of the members of the boy band to be like that. Every pop star and artist has his or her own appeal and character marketed to audiences”. The use of single-gender bands is effective at focusing their target demographic on just one gender rather than trying to pleasing both.

The surge of Koreans into the Philippines further helps to promote their products in the country. As more Koreans arrive, they invest or start their own businesses selling Korean-related products. Min Kyong-ho, minister and consul general of the South Korean embassy, told the Philippine Daily Inquirer in a 2013 article that “Korean companies are very much interested in investing in the Philippines, because there are many good elements, favorable elements for investing” (Quismundo, 2013). In fact, some areas have already been earmarked as “Korean territories” due to their large Korean presence. So true to any effective marketing strategy, supply and demand are mutually constitutive and reinforcing.

FUTURE RESEARCH

Since the 1990s, there has been another type of Korean Wave emerging in the Philippines in the form of a growing influx of Korean nationals. Drawn by the tropical weather and picture postcard beaches, significantly lower cost of living, trademark Philippine hospitality, and proximity, South Koreans are now the top tourists in the country with over a million visitors last year alone (Waga, 2013). Besides the short-term tourists who usually stay less than a week, more than 100,000 South Koreans have chosen to permanently reside in the Philippines (Van den Brock, 2010). Typically, the Korean migrants are businessmen, students, or missionaries.

In recent years, however, rifts between the two groups have become increasingly common as reports and anecdotes circulate about the visitors not always behaving as guests. As their numbers and influence have grown, so has their bad reputation. The main issue of contention appears to be the widespread perception that Koreans are not reciprocating the hospitality and good will that have been shown to them. Instead
of embracing any of the local culture, Koreans prefer to bring Korea with them. One characteristic feature of both Korean tourists and immigrants in the Philippines is their desire to stick together. Koreans tend to only socialize and do business with other Koreans, thereby effectively ostracizing their Filipino hosts. Wherever Koreans move in large numbers, they will create their own ethnic enclaves. A common strategy for Koreans is to buy all of the available property in a specific cluster and subsequently designate the area as its own. All of a sudden, Korean restaurants, KTV bars, grocery stores, hotels, and tour companies – all of which are easily identifiable by the distinctive Hangul script that is entirely unintelligible to the Filipino masses – appear to be practically ubiquitous in the Philippines. Significantly, all of these businesses and services cater almost exclusively to a Korean clientele.

I would now like to take the logical next step in this ongoing longitudinal research by examining how the current wave of Korean migration to the Philippines is very much the product of globalization and transnationalism. I wish to investigate the Korean diaspora in this country in terms of its nature and magnitude, its causes and history, and its repercussions and implications for Philippine-Korean relations. Further, I am curious about the extent to which each mode of social cultural adaptation – integration, assimilation, isolation, and marginality – applies to the Korean context. Alas, the Korean Wave to the Philippines extends beyond the export of mass media and now includes the growing numbers of tourists and immigrants as well.

REFERENCES CITED


ABOUT THE AUTHOR

SAM PACK (*1974) is an associate professor of cultural anthropology at Kenyon College, Gambier, Ohio. He has also held visiting appointments in universities and research institutions in India, Costa Rica, Vietnam, Palestine, South Korea, and the Philippines. He earned his M.A. and Ph.D. in Anthropology at Temple University in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, USA. His research focuses on the relationship between media and culture, specifically on an anthropological approach to the production and reception of television, film, photographs, and new media. He has conducted ethnographic research throughout the USA as well as Southeast Asia, East Asia, Central America, and the Middle East. Dr. Pack is the author of over forty articles published in a variety of peer-reviewed journals and edited volumes. A manuscript titled Ethnographic Media: History and Practice is currently under contract with the University of Toronto Press. He serves on the editorial board of Slovak Ethnology.
The objective of this study is an analysis of historical changes of selected visual research tools used by anthropologists during fieldwork. Special attention will be devoted to the photography and drawings as the gnoseological tool in anthropology. The author will describe the differences in purpose and in practical usage of photography and drawings in anthropological research. The author will also explain why anthropologists have generally understood photography as the evidence and the record of the ethnographic reality, while drawings were used as a projective tool that enabled us to record native perspective in different ways. The author builds on ideas developed by leading anthropologists such as Taussig or Pinney. The aim of this study is to provide a comparative overview of the historical changes of the position of photography and drawing and their mutual relationships in anthropology.

Key words: drawing; photography; anthropology; fieldwork; crisis of representation

INTRODUCTION

Photography and drawing played really important roles during the establishing of modern social and cultural anthropology. Their significance and purposes of usage, however, have been changing because of the development of the standards of anthropological methods and techniques of collecting and recording ethnographic data. Many scholars have provided an overview of the history of photography application in anthropology (see for example Freeman, 2009; Pinney, 1992, 2011). The comparative studies devoted to drawing are still rather missing (see Hubeňáková, Soukup 2012). In this article I would like to argue that drawing was replaced by photography as a mean for recording the ethnographic reality in the second half of the 19th century as the scholars began to consider photography as an unbiased and reliable recording of reality. The fieldworkers however, did not lose interest in drawings, but they gave the pencils to the natives in order to create drawings for them. The fieldworkers almost exclusively created photographs, natives made drawings since the turn of the
The paper aims to introduce drawings and photography in anthropological perspective. However, it does not deal with ethnographic film. The area of interest is the static means of representation. Neither do I deal with interactive publication nor visuality in cyberspace.

There is a certain logic to the development of various visual means for recording ethnographic data. Explorers and scientists recorded ethnographic data via drawings and paintings until approximately the first half of the 19th century, then they started using photographs for the same purposes. The drawings became the projective technique which anthropologists have been applying in order to study native’s personality, mentality or their world view (see Cox, 2005; Johnson, Phister, Vindrola-Padros, 2012). Anthropologists had reserved the usage of the camera for themselves for a significant part of the 20th century. The fieldworkers did not put cameras into the hands of natives until 1960s and they did so in order to study “visual grammar” cross-culturally (Worth, Adair, 1975). Thanks to this research it became apparent that photography is also based on cultural convention of displaying. It was later discovered that reading photography, or visual material generally, is a particular social skill acquired by training (Forge, 1970; Mundy-Castle, 1966). To put in other words, results of numerous research projects proved that both a textual and visual type of representation is significantly affected by cultural background of the creator and that the ability to “read” visual representations is a socially acquired skill. A crisis of representation (Marcus, Fischer, 1986) began to show in the last two decades of the 20th century. Anthropologists have faced a problem of finding adequate means to describe cultural and social reality (see for example Crang, 2005; Lewis, 2007; Throop 2003). Initially, the issue was linked mainly to ethnographic writing, later the issue of visual representation also arose. Anthropologists also began to address the issue of reliability of ethnographic testimony, evidence and knowledge expressed via words, photography and drawings (Clifford, Marcus, 1986; Taussig, 2009, 2011), as I will discuss in the final part of the article.¹

DRAWINGS AS RECORD OF EARLY EUROPEAN ENCOUNTERS WITH “THE OTHERS”

There was an increasing interest in drawing in anthropology at the beginning of the millennia (see Ingold, 2007; Pink et al., 2004). But anthropologists have been interested in native drawings ever since the end of 19th century. It was applied as a research technique during 20th century, especially if the research’s subjects were children (see Mitchell, 2006). As I will demonstrate, there are many reasons why anthropologists applied drawing as a technique primarily focused on children. It resulted from the concept of culture and construction of an object in anthropology at the time when this field was being founded as a science. Drawing and painting, however, was used to record ethnographic reality before the emergence of anthropology as an independent scientific field. Sailors, travelers, merchants and missionaries – they all recorded the appearance of “the others”.

Since the beginning of the Modern Era the European encounters with “the others” were creating certain issues in an effort to describe them and explain their origin and nature. Many authors with first-hand experience drew up their own experiences gained during their travel and stay among the natives. The testimonies drafted by Christopher Columbus, Hernando Cortés, Bartolomeo de Las Casas, Jean de Léry and many others

¹ The paper aims to introduce drawings and photography in anthropological perspective. However, it does not deal with ethnographic film. The area of interest is the static means of representation. Neither do I deal with interactive publication nor visuality in cyberspace.
in the 16\textsuperscript{th} century\textsuperscript{2} are really valuable today, because they contain precious grains of information on the pre-contact state of the native cultures and societies. In addition to these \textit{written} reports and recollections there is also an abundance of images representing “the others”. Anthropologists and historians highly value the artworks by John White (1540?–1593?) or Jacques de Morgues le Moyne (1533?–1588), who painted the Algonkin peoples and the natives from Florida respectively (Harvey, 2008). Their artworks were later popularised by Theodor de Bry (1528–1598), who created engravings based on their originals and included them into popular books about the Americas (see Keazor, 1998; Lorant, 1965). There are many other painters who portrayed natives not only from the Americas, but from every part of the globe that was visited by the conquistadors and explorers. Diego de Prado y Tovar made drawings of the New Guinean natives in 1606 for example (Hamy, 1907). The most significant discoveries were made in the 18\textsuperscript{th} century, when Europeans undertook many expeditions in order to not only expand overseas domains, but also to enrich the scientific knowledge of flora, fauna and human types outside of Europe. Participants of Cook’s outstanding voyages into the Pacific collected and recorded an enormous amount of objects and subjects. There were remarkable drawings and painting such as the ones made by Sydney Parkinson and John Webber. The former recorded the looks of Maori, he is credited for the drawings of Maori tattoo called \textit{moko}. The latter portrayed the inhabitants of Alaska and Hawaii; he particularly focused on the various types of clothing which is why he is probably the first European who recorded the appearance of \textit{tapa}. Cook’s discoveries not only helped to map the Pacific, but also contributed to the knowledge of the cultures of Oceania. He did such an extensive work that “he left his successors little to do but admire” (Oliver, 1989: 35).

Ethnographic drawing declined in use during the second half of the 19\textsuperscript{th} century because of the development and relatively rapid spread of photography in scientific research. But the natives from the non-European areas started to create drawings and paintings with the help of materials of the European origin.\textsuperscript{3} A Polynesian called Tu-\textipa, who participated in Cook’s first voyage for a while, created one of the oldest drawings of this type. He not only charted part of the Oceania, but he also portrayed inhabitants of Pacific islands (Druett, 2011). “Ledger art”, created by the American natives of the plains, was very popular in the end of the 19\textsuperscript{th} century. The American natives narrated their history and culture through drawings (see Berlo, 1996). Anthropologists and ethnographers became interested in the native drawings and began to collect them in the end of the 19\textsuperscript{th} century. There is the beginning of a transformation of ethnographic drawing into the native drawings designed as a research tool, which was intended either to represent the native’s point of view or to record the subject’s mentality or personality. At least initially, the ethnographers collected drawings in order to investigate the natives’ ability to portray the things and phenomena via drawing.

\textsuperscript{2} The aim of this selection is just to illustrate written report. There is richness of books and reports covering the history of European expansion from the end 15\textsuperscript{th} till 19\textsuperscript{th} century.

\textsuperscript{3} There is, of course, an incredible amount of native drawings and paintings designed with local materials and procedures.
Alfred Cort Haddon collected native drawings in Torres Strait in 1898 and later provided their comparison with the set of drawings from the Rigo district, where Seligman carried out his fieldwork (Haddon, 1904). The amount of native drawings collected by researchers has been growing ever since the beginning of the 20th century. Paget could thus provide in 1932 a comparison of about sixty thousand drawings collected in the non-European regions (Paget, 1932). Many prominent anthropologists began collecting not only ordinary ethnographic data but also native drawings in the course of their particular fieldwork. There are many outputs of this research during which anthropologists have been collecting native drawings and paintings. Margaret Mead (1901–1978) worked on Manus (Mead, 1932),4 she also cooperated with Gregory Bateson (1904–1980) in Bali (Geertz, 1994), Cora DuBois (1903–1991) carried out fieldwork on Alor (DuBois, 1944), Meyer Fortes (1906–1983) conducted research among Tallensis (Fortes, 1940, 1981). Of course there are many others results of anthropological research focused on native drawings (see for example Alland, 1983; Martlew, Connolly, 1996). It is significant that the scholars were particularly interested in children’s drawing for many reasons. First, there was a long-term anthropological distrust of a child as an informant (see Hirschfeld, 2002). Especially American cultural anthropologists that belonged to “the personality and culture” school were interested in the processes of socialization and enculturation by which a subject acquired particular society and culture, respectively. Therefore it was believed that children couldn’t be informants to anthropologists, because they were interested in a culture and society that children were still learning. So if the anthropologists were interested in researching children, they were actually investigating processes through which children acquire society and culture, not the society and culture itself. That is why the anthropological approach to drawings was rooted in psychology, where this approach has been developing ever since the end of the 19th century.

There are hidden paradigmatic reasons for using drawings during anthropological research among the non-European natives. (1) There was an evolutionistic view that non-Europeans are undeveloped in comparison with the Europeans; (2) Drawing is a second-rate activity in comparison with highly evaluated writing skills.

Using children’s drawings in scientific investigating came to anthropology from psychology, where it was introduced mainly by James Sully (1884–1923). His theory was directly connected with a Darwinian viewpoint. In accordance with Darwin he argued that childhood reminds us of our affinity to the animal world (Sully, 1900, especially chapter IX, X). He was an advocate of the approach to the drawing that Donna Kelly (2004) calls “a mirror paradigm”. Psychologists understand the children’s drawings as representation of the world the way the author sees it; in other words, the drawing mirrors the author’s view of the world including his / her mind and psyche. It is also assumed that the drawing represents the state of a mental and psychical level of individual development. An important point is that Sully paralleled “a crude child-art” and “a primitive race-art”. It is in general conformity with contemporary views of “primitives”. The theory of a social and cultural evolution was based on the assumption that non-European natives’ mental and psychical abilities equal to European children’s

4 Probably Reo Fortune had inspired Margaret Mead to collect drawings made by children in Manus, because Fortune himself dealt with children drawings in his master thesis (see Fortune, 1927).
ones. This view stemmed from the theory of recapitulation, which was derived from Haeckel’s biogenetic law and that postulates that ontogenesis recapitulates phylogeny (Haeckel, 1866: 7). The psychoanalysis was based on the same law, when it claimed that the individual recapitulates traumas of humankind (see Gould, 1977). So when Sully likened European children’s art work to “the primitive art”, he built on evolutionistic paradigm. His work influenced anthropologists (see Mead, 1932; Fortune, 1927), who used and interpreted drawings during their particular research. Anthropologists thus implicitly agreed that a suitable technique of inquiring into the “primitive” mind has to be built on such a childish activity as drawing is. Doing this, anthropologists contributed to the construction of the “others” as “primitive”.

The application of drawing as a research tool in anthropology can also be interpreted as an expression of an assumed European superiority over the Non-Europeans. Writing is highly valued in Western societies. Some authors argue that writing is actually a “powerful weapon”, which helped to conquer the overseas territory (see for example Todorov, 1984). The natives often understood writing as some kind of magic, which conquerors possess. For example, Lévi-Strauss in his famous *Tristes Tropiques* recollects an encounter with a native, who simulated the skill to write in front of his people and the anthropologist (Lévi-Strauss, 1961). The Westerners understood literacy as one of the signs of civilization; the formation of a civilization corresponds with the discovery of writing. Because the anthropologists were mainly dealing with illiterate societies, about which they wrote, they themselves contributed to the strengthening of the view that the subject of anthropology is “primitive”. The anthropologists of the 19th century did not even trust verbal testimony provided by the natives. They were convinced that natives’ testimony is quite likely biased, incorrect or even misleading (see discussion in Pinney, 2011: 14–15), unless they are guided by the researchers. They helped them to express their viewpoint by structured questioning. The native drawing is in that case a useful and suitable research tool, because it allows expression of the *subjective* viewpoint without *words*. Contrary to that, anthropologists could collect *objective* visual evidence via photographs. This also affirmed “a primitiveness” of the “others”, because it was believed that the non-European natives feared that photography is some kind of magic stealing one’s soul. Photography became not only a sign of Western superiority but it also became a powerful anthropological tool, trusted as a reliable source of evidence.

**PHOTOGRAPHY AND ANTHROPOLOGY**

Christopher Pinney (1992, 2011), based on the research of a relationship between photography and anthropology, came to the conclusion that photography provided the foundation of anthropology as a science. The power of photography lies in the fact that one can capture reality via photography relatively easily and quickly. Scholars developed a number of guidelines in the second half of the 19th century, aiming to standardize image capturing of the non-European subjects in order to create comparable photographs. To put it in other words, if one followed the guidelines then it was possible to compare the results with those obtained by other photographs elsewhere.

---

5 In fact it was Balzac, who feared that photography steals his soul. Later Westerners transferred this fear to the primitives.

6 It took tens of minutes in the end of 19th century (see Frič, Fričová, 1997).
The ease of photography and its accuracy were the main advantages in comparison with drawing where creating is dependent on manual skills too.

At least initially, the scientists used photographs as an objective record of reality in their particular research, because it was believed that photography allows fair representation of the facts. Photography is conceived as “technical images” (Flusser, 2013), because one only controls the camera the same way an astronomer focuses a telescope or a biologist focuses a microscope. The result depends solely on the researcher’s technical skills and it was believed that nothing such as researcher’s emotions, biases or even a cultural background affected the actual result. Therefore photography has become a promising scientific method, because it was believed to provide an objective representation of reality. It is not surprising then that the anthropologists were also interested in photography.

PHOTOGRAPHY AS A TOOL FOR ANTHROPOMETRY AT A DISTANCE

“The father” of anthropology Edward Burnett Tylor expressed an opinion that “The science of anthropology owes not a little to the art of photography” (Tylor, 1876: 184). Photography undoubtedly played a very important role in establishing anthropology as a science of humankind – as the above mentioned Pinney (1991, 2011) proved. There were many guidelines for a proper ethnographic photography. The anthropologists wanted to take such photographs that would enable them to deduce body proportions of photographed individuals in order to compare these with similar data from different populations. The scientists were trying to develop a method that would provide them with a reliable way to convert an ethnographic photography to a document usable in “interracial” comparisons (Maxwell, 2010: 30). Based on these requirements anthropometric photography was developed. Maurice Vidal Portman (1860–1935) gained extensive experience during his long-term stay among the natives of the Andaman Islands (Portman, 1888), where his main focus was taking photographs (Sen, 2009). He photographed each step of tool manufacturing, because he believed that subsequently such documentation would, as a part of a scientific study, provide us with a possibility to repeat the process of making the same artefacts. He also developed his own method of taking anthropometric photography. The photographer working under his instructions had to take pictures of the naked subjects, face on and in profile. Behind the subject had to be a curtain with black and white squares of 2-inch size. The result would be austere and exact without any aesthetic (Portman, 1896).

John Lamprey suggested a similar method of taking anthropometric photography. He also worked with a grid system (Lamprey, 1869). The aim of this method was to provide a guideline for doing anthropometry at distance as the colonial administration required in order to obtain comparable data on the inhabitants of the colonised lands. The method designed by him was easily applicable and that is why it became more popular than the somewhat complicated method developed by Thomas Henry Huxley, who required photographing a subject together with a scale (see Maxwell, 2010). The photographers, however, interpreted instructions differently, and the photographs were ultimately so diverse that “an interracial comparison” was ruled out.

I have to note here that these invented methods of taking ethnographic photography rejected the subject’s natural surroundings that had to be excluded from scientific photography. This can be regarded as evidence of the fact that the anthropologists
were interested in “the body surface”. It is possible to see not only the foundations of anthropology in natural sciences, but the anthropologists were also interested in photography of subjects as examples of species because of the central position of evolutionism in anthropology at that time. The anthropologists understood the characteristics of the body as indicators of the position in the evolutionary ladder (see Grimshaw, 2001: 21). The photographed subject is used in that case as a sample, standing here instead of a whole population and can be compared with other samples from different locations. This conception of photography remained in anthropology at least until the end of the 19th century. We can see the evidence of this in the guidelines written by Alfred Cort Haddon and John George Garson for third edition of Notes and Queries on Anthropology: “the lens should be on a level with the face, and the eyes of the subject looking straight from the head should be fixed on a point at their own height from the ground, or on the horizon of water. When the whole nude figure is photographed, front, side, and back views should be taken; the heels should be close together, and the arms hanging straight down the side of the body; it is best to photograph a metric scale in the same plane as the body of the subject. It is desirable to have a soft, fine-grained, neutral-tinted screen to be used as a background. This screen should be sufficiently light in colour to contrast well with yellow and brown skins” (Haddon, Garson 1899: 239).

PHOTOGRAPHY PRESENTS NATIVES AS “LIVING BEINGS”

In contrast to these conceptions of ethnographic photography Sir Everard im Thurn (1852–1932) demanded that a photograph must present the natives as “living beings”. He was convinced that taking an anthropometric photography is undoubtedly useful but photographing “primitive” way of life was more important as it was quickly disappearing at that time (Im Thurn, 1893: 1; see also Cox, 2007). He created a sophisticated composition of pictures, he impressively arranged the subjects and their surroundings; the results, of course, do not mirror ethnographic reality, but rather express the author’s idea of the nature’s and native’s appearance. His work was focused on the boundary of art and ethnography. There are many other examples of this kind of photography. It is possible to demonstrate the aesthetics of ethnographic photography on the work produced by an Italian artist and ethnographer Guido Boggi (1861–1901?). He lived among Chamacocos and Kadiwéus for an extensive period at the end of the 19th century. He undoubtedly knew the principles of anthropometric photography but his photographic work (luckily saved by Alberto Vojtěch Frč (1882–1944) at the beginning of the 20th century) is mainly artistic and only then ethnographic (see Frč, Frčová 1997). Frank Hurley’s (1885–1962) photographic work has also a certain ethnographic value, but its main value lies in art photography (see Hurley, 1924).

In spite of the tendency of some ethnographers, whose photographic work bears aesthetic features, the ethnographic photography became a part of the scientific documentation, collected by ethnographers in the course of fieldwork. The aim of the photography was to objectively record the ethnographic reality and preserve its documentation for the future generation of scientists. As Margaret Mead (1901–1978), who

---

7 The same is true of the movie, there is also no space for the art or aesthetics in the ethnographic movie.
helped to shape visual anthropology, and Gregory Bateson (1904–1908) expressed in The Introduction to the Balinese Character: “We treated the cameras in the field as recording instruments, not as devices for illustrating our theses” (Bateson, Mead, 1942: 49). There is an important point regarding photography in ethnography. Some authors (Pinney, 2011) speak about a paradoxical scarcity of photographs in the ethnographic monographs in the “Golden Age of anthropology” – as George Stocking (1992) called the period of 1920s and 1930s. Malinowski (1922) included 65 photographs in his more than five-hundred-page book The Argonauts of the Western Pacific, Fortune (1932) incorporated a mere eight photographs in his famous ethnography on Dobu. It is interesting to note that Mead worked mostly with words without pictures (Mead 1928, 1935) until she discovered the power of photography as a gnoseological tool (Bateson, Mead 1942; Mead, Macgregor, 1951). Boas often took pictures during his research among natives of British Columbia, only occasionally did he include the photographs in his texts (Jacknis, 1984). As the low proportion of a visual representation in the classical written ethnography indicates, the photography was subsidiary to the writing as a source of scientific evidence. It is quite understandable if we accept that the main production of anthropological knowledge is based in writing.

PHOTOGRAPHY AND “WRITING CULTURE”

The anthropologists are obviously occupied with writing during the whole process of research, from preparatory work to a completed ethnography. Especially during fieldwork the anthropologist extensively acquires written notes and records, which they then organize daily in order to make an initial analysis of the collected and recorded data (see Emerson, Fretz, Shaw, 1995); the anthropologists usually immerse themselves in writing for several hours a day (Bernard, 2006: 387). Initially, the photography was considered to be just one of many sources of the anthropological evidence. Its purpose was to record particular artifacts or human beings; scholars were convinced that photographs could not display culture as such. We can see this not only in cited a work by Haddon and Garson (1899), its authors build upon the idea that photographs should record the world in a particular time and space and they should also be the valuable documents for the future generation (see Wright, 1991). This approach is still present in the guideline prepared by John Collier and Malcolm Collier (1986). In it the authors argue that the photography is useful for various purposes; it helps to record particular phenomena, to do mapping or it can be helpful in identifying particular people or names of local places. To put it in other words, a photograph is a useful document. However, the authors also addressed a problem of interpretation of the photographic material; I will return to this issue in last part of this paper.

The ultimate goal of an anthropologist is to provide a description and an explanation of a whole culture. There is a hidden assumption that a holistic “picture” of a culture can be achieved only via written text. The photograph was considered to be a source of ethnographic evidence for a long time; the ethnographers did not see photography as an alternative way of representation of the culture as a whole, because

---

8 There is an interesting paper written by Wright regarding a comparison of photographic works of Malinowski and of Jenness (Wright, 1991). It is rather odd that Malinowski included few photographs in his ethnographies, because photographing was his frequent activity during a fieldwork (see Malinowski, 1967).
photographs were considered to be too piecemeal and fragmentary. Freeman (2009: 55) noted that the anthropologist obviously added photographs as a kind of evidence into a completed written ethnography, the purpose of the photographs was to illustrate the topic not to explicate it. There was an exception in the 1940s and 1950s. Gregory Bateson and Margaret Mead took approximately 25 thousands pictures in Bali in the first half of the 20th century. They made a selection and compiled a famous “photographic monograph” using 759 frames (Bateson, Mead, 1942). Although this method of ethnography is generally recognised as pioneering work of visual anthropology, the authors incorporated a textual description to every particular plate, which helps the reader to understand reprinted photographs. They combined visual and textual means of representation. Regardless of this they understood the photography as a scientific document. Margaret Mead was convinced that the camera captures what was really happening and that there could be an ethnographic photography unbiased by the ethnographer’s cultural background. She also refused any artistic innovations emerging in the visual anthropology since 1940s (Mead, 2003: 9–10).

The supporters of a critical wave that took place in anthropology in 1980s addressed the problem of anthropological practices of representation (Clifford, Marcus, 1986). They subjected the forms and norms of anthropology to critique. Especially the new generation of American anthropologists graduating in 1970s became sensitive to the matter of power that is inherently a part of the discipline (see Rabinow, Marcus, Faubion, Rees, 2008). These anthropologists examined the narrative methods, which the founders of the anthropology used in their particular ethnography; it was apparent that an anthropologist constructs his / her subject rather than objectively describes and interprets it. In the written ethnographies the critics revealed political power as subjective biases of the authors. It was proved that “a writing culture” is a power constructing culture. The photography did not become a suitable alternative of representation of “the others”, because it is an expression of power as equally as a text is. The anthropologists, however, started massively questioning photography as an expression of power in 1990s and later on.

AN ETHNOGRAPHIC TESTIMONY AND EVIDENCE: PHOTOGRAPHY AND DRAWING

Drawing, photographing and writing are the three main means of representation in anthropology. All of them were examined in terms of reliability, transparency and suitability to be the proper means of representation. The scholars found all of them problematic for various reasons. Writing has been reviewed ever since the eighties of the 20th century (Clifford, Marcus, 1986). There are also particular problems with photography and drawing when it comes to its analysis, interpretation and notably its aptitude to work as an appropriate means of ethnographic evidence.

Recently Michael Taussig (2011) devoted his attention to the issue of writing during the fieldwork and to the role of writing as a process of creating an image of the studied “culture”. He understands the anthropological notebook and diaries as a kind

---

9 Margaret Mead later co-authored a similar book about childcare and child-training in Bali (see Mead, Macgregor, 1951).
10 Robert Gardner and Karl Heider had adopted a similar approach in their work Gardens of War. In this case the authors also combined texts and photographs (see Gardner, Heider, 1974).
of modernistic literature; it contains raw material, drawings, cuttings from newspaper, impressions, feelings or reverie. The anthropologists compose books or articles from these diverse records in the same way as William Burroughs or Brion Gysin, who used an aleatory technique of writing called cut-up technique. Anthropologists do the same. They look for an explanatory sense in the pieces of notes and records. Writing is “an imaginative logic of discovery” (Taussig, 2011: xi), during which an author composes a work that is a mixture of personal testimonial, testimony given by others, and what the author believes that he saw. Taussig also focused on drawing in anthropologist’s notebooks and diaries. He is convinced that drawing has a unique place in documenting the fieldwork process. It is a shortcut to the witnessing of the reality. A fieldworker can capture through drawing the reality including his own feelings, it is a representation of a subjective testimony.

What is the difference between a drawing and a photograph? As Taussig pointed out a photo of a drawing does not have the same credibility as a photography of anything else (Taussig, 2011: 11–13). Probably because it is a representation of a representation; to put it in other words it doesn’t have the status of a first-hand representation; as a second-hand representation it loses reliability. A photograph is frame of a movie, a frozen moment of a process in front of a lens. Because photography is a result of a technical procedure depending on the settings of a camera, photography received a prominent position as an objective source of evidence in anthropology. The trap of photography is that it gives an impression of objectivity. It seems as if photography is a self-evident. As Roland Barthes highlighted (1981) a photograph is loaded with many meanings, which are out of control for the photographer; a spectator can “read” a photo in many ways. This is an essential feature of photography. That is probably why photographs used to be subsidiary to the written text in anthropology. The role of photographs is an auxiliary one; it illustrates or supports arguments included in a text, which gives the photograph its particular meaning. There is another problem with photography. It lies in the cultural convention of displaying inherited from European art (framing, whole bodies, whole action, composition etc.) (see Pinney, 1992, 2011). Many ethnographic photographs cannot be considered an objective representation of a reality. As for example, as Pinney or Taussig pointed out, Malinowski’s photography from Kiriwina is art photography, composed as a game of black and white (sic!) and loaded with sexuality (see Pinney, 2011; Taussig, 2009). The ethnographic photography is a subjective representation of reality just as much as a text.

The pitfall of an analysis and interpretation of the native drawing lies in its subjectivity. A creation of drawing depends on many influences; it is a result of manual skills, the personality of the creator and a convention of drawing. That it is why drawing naturally became a gnoseological tool applied in an anthropological research project focused on subjectivity and personality. The anthropologists are convinced that a drawing is a mirror of subject’s mentality and psyche. There is, however, a problem with the availability of a suitable analytical tool. The psychologists developed and tested a number of projective tests based on drawing (the tree test, human figure test etc.), but these analytical tools are validated for the European context. In other words, we do not have a validated tool, which would be possible to apply on drawing materials collected outside of the European context. Drawings have a generally low credibility in anthropology, because they are considered too subjective and the anthropologists face a problem of analysis and interpretation. Drawing as a visual means of representation has an inferior position in comparison with photography.
THE CONCLUSION

Drawing and photography are an important source of evidence in anthropology. It is possible to put all three means of representation in order on a scale of credibility: writing has gained the highest credibility in anthropology. Photography became subsidiary to the text, because the anthropologists considered photography too piecemeal and fragmentary; it does not provide a holistic representation of culture or society. Moreover, photography is loaded with many meanings and possibilities of interpretation. Thus a text gives a meaning to the photography. Drawing is at the bottom of this scale. It is due to the fact that drawing is considered a second-rate activity in the European worldview. Drawing is an individual and subjective activity; it relies on the manual skill of the author, their mentality and a personal condition. That is why it is believed that drawing cannot be an objective source of evidence in anthropological research. In this article I focused on two visual means of representation, neither of them may be considered as objective. Moreover, in anthropology it is possible to understand photography and drawing as an expression of power and a supposed superiority over the non-European natives.

REFERENCES CITED


### ABOUT THE AUTHOR

MARTIN SOUKUP (*1977) is a Czech cultural anthropologist. He is an associate professor at the Institute of Ethnology at Faculty of Arts, Charles University in Prague. He focuses on history, methodology and theory of anthropology. Soukup is particularly interested in the cultures of Melanesia. In 2009 he undertook anthropological research in Papua New Guinea in the three local communities – Wannang (Madang Province), Kegeslugel (Chimbu Province) and Yawan (Morobe Province). In 2011 he returned to Yawan. Besides numerous papers and articles, he is also an author of the textbook *Essentials of Cultural Anthropology* (2009, in Czech). He published monographs *Culture* (2011, in Czech), *Anthropology and Melanesia* (2013, in Czech), Fieldwork in Social and Cultural Anthropology (2014, in Czech) and co-authored *Nungon People of Uruwa* (2012, in English) and *The Body* (2014; in Czech).
You started the Centre for Visual Ethnography (Primorska University in Koper), organized the annual Summer School of Visual Ethnography in Nova Gorica since 1979 and in 2006 you commenced the ‘Days of Ethnographic Film’, which is an international festival in Ljubljana. These activities are just a sample of your work. **What is the reason behind using specifically the term ‘visual ethnography’ in academic settings in Slovenia?**

In the history of visual anthropology many terms were used to characterize a specific visual production alongside anthropological and ethnographic fieldwork. Since the camera mostly serves as a device for gathering (visual) information of all kinds the term visual ethnography is the best way to stress the basic status and purpose of visual products made by the researchers. Visual ethnography is therefore the name of an activity and the name of its results (products). The question is why not use the term ethnographic film instead. The answer might raise the polemics of ethnographic film’s position nowadays in the field of visual anthropology and generally. Using the term visual ethnography we simply indicate a “differentia specifica” facing the “colonisation” of ethnographic film by documentary film producers and filmmakers. Many TV documentaries are promoted as ethnographic films. The festivals in the CAFFE (Coordination of anthropological film festivals in Europe) network are full of such documentaries which are not made entirely by the interest of anthropologists and ethnologists; however they all remind us formally of specific methodological invention known as “observational realism” or of a method of “participating observation” used in the field of visual anthropology. This methodology implies a specific aesthetic, which supports an effect of realism or even naturalism in filmmaking.

**Based on your long-term experience in the field, which specific visual techniques are currently used in ethnography and how does its usage differ with the past? Can you describe the particular visual techniques utilised in ethnographical research in**
Slovenia? Which subjects or topics were and are portrayed by visual ethnographers in their films? How do these activities of visual ethnography fit in academic discourse itself and moreover, how does it correspond with written ethnography?

Like many of my colleagues in the field of visual anthropology I believe that visual ethnography is not only a technical device (method) for gathering information but also a device and a media which brings different information at least information on the level of a wider perception of reality. In many cases the visual surface of manifested reality recorded by the camera reveals a better understanding and deeper feeling of particular cultural elements. Each practitioner of visual ethnography is discovering his or her own method how to come closer to the events or to the people. The contemporary development of visual technology is of great help in that. Just remember the film and video cameras 30 years ago, their weight and bulkiness. Not to mention the editing possibilities and the whole blessing of digital environment in which today’s visual production is running. In Slovenia we profit from all the goods of digital visual media. The production is diversified a lot. There are two main production centres. In the national ethnographic museum the department of ethnographic film is producing visual documentation of rituals and crafts, which is then exhibited in the public collection and used as a visual appendix of the elements in the register of living cultural heritage. An audio-visual laboratory at the Institute of ethnology is the starting point of ethnographic visual production in Slovenia(from 1983). The pioneer work started with 16 mm film production; turned to video in the early 80’s and to digital visual production recently. The basic experience is a visual recording in the field made by the researcher himself.
or herself. The footage is later used as a visual note along the presentation at a conference or in the teaching room. Only periodically the footage is organized in a more articulated visual narration, which can communicate independently with a wider audience. Many of our colleagues are practicing observational type of visual registration with possible cooperation or participation of informants i.e. subjects of the research.

Both production centres are recently focused on visual presentation of living cultural heritage either as an appendix of the elements in the national list of intangible heritage or as a part of multimedia Internet sites. A constant discussion is going on regarding the true value of visual documentation in comparison with written anthropological and ethnological discourse. Multimedia seems to be an excellent environment implicating complementary visual, audio and written components of a scientific research endeavour. Only such publications are still very rare.

Your name is listed as one of the members of the famous Slovenian art group called ‘OHO’, which was active in between the years 1965–1970. It is known, that this group was formed by young people from various contemporary art practices of that era, who were not satisfied with their life and the art of the day.

How does your membership in OHO, noting that it was one of the most important artistic movements of the time, influence your work in the field of visual ethnography? How would you describe the relationship between art and visual ethnography?

At that time the group OHO was not very appreciated except among some intellectuals. Indeed we were not understood generally. And perhaps we were not aware of how an inventive new perspective on life and culture could influence the whole structure of the society, which I believe was not even our intention. We preferred firstly to change our own attitude and the behaviour in an ideologically polarized world, not to change the world. Don’t forget that it was a time of flower movements and flower children and hippies. Art came out of the galleries. Historical humanism was under question. Is Man still the centre of Universe and the champion of evolution? Or is he only one of species on the planet with no right to exploit limitless other species and environment? Very simply said, the non-political ideology of OHO was equidistance from ideological polarization and from (fake) humanistic principles of Western civilization and acceptance of equality between things (objects) and living creatures in the universe on an ontological level. The consequence of such reasoning is a deep turn in understanding the position and significance of art. The artist is not the one who can judge what is beautiful
and what is ugly, and thus he is not creating pieces of art according to the ideal of historically determined values. (Isn’t it a typical subversive element of modernism in general?) What he can do is simply to be amazed by everything around him and to say: “uau...” or “oho...” in Slovenian. OHO is an acronym, which in Slovenian language sounds like Ear (UHO) and Eye (OKO). So in the word OHO visual and audio components are joined to show an exclamation of wondering.

I was deeply influenced by being a member of the OHO group, participating mainly with filming the group’s activities (happenings, installations) and making short experimental films on 8 mm.

There is no comparison between visual projects in the time of OHO and later visual ethnographic works on the formal level. Especially the camera strategy is different while there is a continuation in the way how the word is perceived in both cases. The “Anti-humanistic” view of OHO produces the term “reism” (from Res in Latin). The visual surface of reality becomes a decisive vehicle of meanings. Ideological background is invisible and therefore neglected. In this view the things and living objects are of the same importance for an artist. The similar understanding of visual registration prevails in visual ethnography. Again the visual surface of reality is the main or even the only possible object of visual recording. After entering the field of visual anthropology I was impressed by the pioneer era of cinematography with a fixed camera, observing the space in front of it. As homage to this kind of cinema I made an experimental film on 8 mm
with the title Presence and absence of persons and things (1982). This was probably my transition from OHO filmmaking to the observational style of visual ethnography.

*In the book “The Cinema makers: Public Life and the Exhibition of Difference in South-Eastern and Central Europe since the 1960’s”, you stated that: “What I felt was that I had a strong desire to make a film and show it to others”. How would you describe the “contact” with the audience today?*

The statement mentioned above was a general one. As young people we all wanted to show publicly our ideas even if the range of our products was not very big. Better to say we dared more than the true power of our “art” deserved. Nowadays I am more cautious regarding public presentation of my work. I understand more the nature of visual and media communication. Besides I am more demanding of ethnographic visual work. Basically the aim of visual ethnography is not to amaze the public as many so called ethnographic films are trying to achieve but to show silently the choreography of every day non-verbal behaviour, body language, body technique, speech or interrelations which is all supposed to show visual components of a cultural element, of an individual and possibly of his culture. If I am successful in recording and showing all this, putting empathically my privileged authorship apart, I enjoy showing publicly the final product.
One of the topics of a previous issue of Slovak Ethnology was the ‘Ethical concerns’ in the field of visual ethnography. What are the differences between visual representation and written representation in regards to their ethics?

Ethical concerns are very popular recently. The tolerance of being screened publicly is very low. People are aware of possible manipulations. It is true that ethical discourse dominates because of the misuses either in the field of anthropological research or in journalism. Let me mention the paradox: while stressing the significance of ethical concerns people are exposing their intimate life on internet even if they know that they are imprinting themselves for life.

However a great number of researchers are ethically faultless. Sometimes the high level of ethical concerns will prevent the publication of certain important facts or information especially in the field of visual production. (Imagine an ethnographic film where all the persons will have a black stripe over their eyes!) On the other hand many participants strive to be recorded and screened because they want to promote their activity, i.e. knowledge by the help of a media. Certainly I don’t want to be an advocate of unethical treatment of the people in the front of the camera. At least they have to be informed very well what our intention is as researchers and filmmakers and keep our word or even write down and sign an agreement.

In the written presentations we can much more easily avoid the question of ethical concerns as far as unwished personal identification is concerned but the focus will turn to the ideological misuse and mistrust which may affect people as individuals and as entire social groups. It seems to me that some anthropological treatment of social questions and topics are too aggressive regarding the relationship between researcher and his or her subject.

*Is the question of ethics in visual ethnography changed by media, social change and social activism in these current times?*

The answer is participation in the course of research and visual production. It is not easy to achieve true participation because there are differences between the researcher’s and protagonist’s interest. During the projects in the field of intangible cultural heritage I experienced different approaches when trying to understand and present cultural, social, economic and political meaning of cultural heritage. There were no ethical questions while focusing on the technological side of cultural elements. In this case the researcher is a master of the whole project. Only when the focus turns to the relationship between man, his activity and the social environment ethical questions suddenly appeared. Not as a question of (a dangerous) individual’s identification in public presentation but as a question of the copy right of the cultural heritage’s element. There are three shareholders participating in the “ownership” of cultural heritage: the creator, the researcher and the user. Traditionally the researcher is considered to be a main factor since he studies, understands and publishes the whole story. Recently (at least after the UNESCO Convention on the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage) things are changing. The researcher’s “authorship” is under discussion. The creators of cultural heritage become true protagonists whose ethical right has to prevail in the concept of national and worldwide significance of cultural heritage.
‘Days of Ethnographic Film’ is a member of the organisation CAFFE, which connects and coordinates festivals of ethnographic films in Europe. What is your experience from the European based events in the field of visual ethnography/anthropology and how would you compare it with your activities in Slovenia?

The publication of visual works is necessary to promote the field of visual anthropology in our academic environments and to compare different methods and styles in the field. Visual production is one of the fastest developing fields in anthropology and ethnology and the most neglected endeavour in the same time. Probably the field is a victim of its marginal position between film and science and between visual and textual. It is not easy to be everywhere and nowhere. There is a constant struggle for academic recognition and for a specific position in visual media. The festivals, if running properly, can display the current position of visual media in anthropology and also enhance original production and opening new ways of ethnographic filmmaking.

Production of relevant visual works directed in cultural and social topics is enormous. What I miss is production prevalently directed by researchers, i.e. academic people. This is the basic idea of visual ethnography. However, we are meeting more and more productions by professional filmmakers and TV productions. True observational ethnographic film is not possible with a traditional film crew. The most interesting works are made by individuals immersed in a particular cultural environment for a longer period.

Besides the Days of ethnographic film in Slovenia there is a Summer school of visual ethnography organized since 1997 by the Audio-visual laboratory at the Institute of ethnology affiliated to the Scientific Research Centre of Slovenian Academy of Sciences and Arts. Each year 10 to 12 students of anthropology and other humanistic disciplines learn how to make an observational visual etude. The school lasts 9 days and comprises mentored research, planning of the production, field production and editing the final work. The Summer school is a very good addition to the course of Visual anthropology at The Department of ethnology and cultural anthropology at the Faculty of Arts (Ljubljana University).

The summer school should enable the students to continue visual production in their later professional positions. The field of visual is very popular among the students and also among colleagues at the institute and in the national museum. Many of our colleagues use video cameras in the field but not everybody is skilful enough to construct a meaningful visual narration.

Recently both production centres have been focusing on visual production in the field of cultural heritage, mainly published at some Internet portals with interactive possibilities. This is a way to publish visual databases in a way to reach the wider audience and different users.

One of your plans was to build a Film archive of The Central Europe region. What was the main impulse to do so and how is this project continuing?

This is not a relevant question any more since you have probably in mind our concept VIKROS which means Visual rings of Slovenia. It was planned in the early 90’s and its intention was to collect relevant visual documents from different sources concerning the research of culture in Slovenia. After the first steps the discussion about the project stopped and was postponed or even cancelled. At that time we couldn’t find an organizational and technical solution. The concept came too soon. Today the
Internet allows much more sophisticated publication and even multidisciplinary and multimedia approach. Just remember Europeana and many others examples on national and global levels.

What do you think will be the next step in visual ethnography/anthropology?

In the near past the main question was production, connected with many technical problems. The equipment was expensive especially 16 mm cinematography and the first electronic media as well. Nowadays the production is not a question any more. The digital equipment and editing facilities can be easily accessed by individuals. We are facing an enormous quantity of visual footage, documents and products. The researchers are making big visual databases running on computers, intranets and Internet. There is a question of systematic use of such databases. Sometimes they are pure illustrations with no meaningful connection with a particular research question. Probably it is due to a generally low level of university education of visual anthropology and ethnography. The university programs of visual anthropology are still very rare. Not so many people are accepting visual ethnography as a non-art visual production, which is not only repeating or displaying visually what was said verbally or with a written word but to accept a specific sensitivity of visual media, which cannot be simply translated with words.

The future is probably in a massive distribution and access of visual databases and ethnographic films together with multimedia information. Due to new ways of publication a new categorization (classification) of visual ethnography will appear. There will not be only footage and ethnographic films but many different forms and categories between. New ways of ethnographic filming are supported by new visual technology. Small cameras and other visual gadgets allow us to come very close to our subjects either speaking about space proximity or social proximity. And again we shall meet a new dimension or challenge of ethical concern. How close we are allowed to come?

ABOUT THE INTERVIEWEE

NAŠKO KRIŽNAR (*1943) was born in Ljubljana. He completed his studies in ethnology and archeology in 1970 at the University of Ljubljana’s Faculty of Arts. From 1972 to 1982 he worked as a curator and ethnologist at the Nova Gorica Museum. Since 1983 he has been working for the SASA Scientific Research Center, initially as head of the audiovisual laboratory and since 1999 as an associate of the research program “Ethnological Research of Culture in Slovenia and Across the Borders” and head of the ISE audiovisual laboratory section. Between 1985 and 1990 he was chief editor of the Slovenian Ethnological Society’s newsletter. He received his doctoral degree in 1996 at the University of Ljubljana. As a visiting assistant professor he gave lectures in visual anthropology at the Department of Ethnology and Cultural Anthropology of Ljubljana’s Faculty of Arts. Currently he is a lecturer in visual research at Koper’s Faculty of Humanities. Each year he heads the Summer School of the Visual in Nova Gorica. He is a member of the IUAES Commission for Visual Anthropology.

The Gypsy Lore Society as an international association of people interested in Romani studies was established in the United Kingdom in 1888. Its headquarters moved to the United States in 1989. This society brings together experts in Romani studies from all over the world, and its main objective is to create a platform for exchange of recent knowledge and discussions of experts from various disciplines (ethnology, anthropology, linguistics, sociology, musicology, political sciences, as well as biology, health science, etc.) contributing to the development of Romani studies.

The international congress and the conference of Romani studies are organised in a world metropolis on an annual basis. Throughout the past years, the following cities hosted this event: Washington DC (USA, 2000); Budapest (Hungary, 2002); Ann Arbor (Michigan, USA, 2003); Newcastle upon Tyne (England, 2004); Granada (Spain, 2005); Helsinki (Finland, 2009); Lisbon (Portugal, 2010); Graz (Austria, 2011); Istanbul (Turkey, 2012); Glasgow (Scotland, 2013), and the Slovak Republic this year. It should be noted that no congress on Romani studies of similar size and importance had previously been held in the Slovak or the Czech Republic.

Bratislava was visited by a record number of experts from several continents to discuss topics of their expertise. The number of conference participants grew from the planned number of 130 guests up to 190. They were all researchers specialised in linguistics, history, sociology, political science, ethnology, or social anthropology. Conference papers were given by well-known world experts on Roma from various disciplines. It is a positive trend that Roma as such are increasingly represented among the participating experts.

The conference started on Thursday, 11th of September, at 13.00 o’clock. It was opened by Tatiana Podolinská, Director of the Institute of Ethnology of the Slovak Academy of Sciences (SAS), Juraj Marušiak from the Presidium of the Slovak Academy of Sciences, Elena Marušiaková, President of the Gypsy Lore Society; Dušan Chrenek, Head of the Representation of the European Commission in Slovakia, and Peter Pollák, Government Plenipotentiary for Roma communities and parliamentary deputy. The opening was followed by a presentation of papers. The official conference opening was accompanied by an opening of the exhibition “The Roma in Slovakia after 1989” and “Successful Roma Women” in Pálffy Palace in Bratislava. The two exhibitions were presented by the ethnologist Zuzana Kuma-
Two successful Roma women also performed at the opening: writer Zdenka Mahajová and violinist Barbora Botošová who showed to the conference participants her virtuosity together with her band.

The expert part of the conference consisted of a plenary paper of the emeritus professor Thomas Acton who focused on the collection of ethnic data, demographic statistics and policies on data surveys on Roma. This area stirred up an expert debate not only in Slovakia, but also in the United Kingdom where certain methodologically incorrect research studies and statistical surveys of demographical data on Roma migrants resulted in a wave of adoption of anti-Roma populist policies by the governing power. This topic is much debated also in Slovakia, and the inclusion of this paper in the introductory part of the conference agenda was therefore perceived very positively, and the paper of professor Acton met with a strong response in the discussion.

During three conference days, the papers were presented under 23 thematic blocks split up into open sections and pre-organised thematic panels. The different sections dealt with current social problems or less explored topics (European and national policies on Roma, Roma political participation, education, migration of Roma groups, inclusion and integration, issues of attributed ethnicity and the ethics of ethnic data collection, group identities, the activities of churches and religious movements among Roma, the perspectives of gender equality, historic events and many others). One of the new elements of this year’s conference in Bratislava was pre-organised closed panels, the lecturers in which were invited by the organisers of these panels. We thus held thematic panels on topics, such as Critical approaches to Roma participation and empowerment (the panel was organised by Márton Rovid and Abel-Bálint Bereményi), Roma/ Gypsies and public policies in the Iberian Peninsula (Olga Magano and Maria Mendoza), Muslim Roma – issues of language and identity (Hristo Kyuchukov), Religion in Roma studies (Tatiana Podolinská), as well as a panel on Romani studies in Slovakia and the Czech Republic: The experience, problems and Romani studies of Roma/Gypsies in Slovakia and former Czechoslovakia (the panel was organised by a prominent Czechoslovak expert in Romani studies Eva Davidová who, unfortunately, could not attend the conference due to health reasons).

The above-mentioned panel on Romani studies in Slovakia and in former Czechoslovakia was very important from the point of view of the presentation of the results of Czech and Slovak Romani studies to the forum of world experts. Will Guy from Bristol University, who dedicated most of his research to the study of Roma in the Czech Republic and Slovakia, presented, in addition to his paper, the work made by Eva Davidová, summarising the development of Romani studies in our region. The overview of scientific interest in Roma topics in Slovakia by Arne Mann from the Institute of Ethnology of the SAS also provided a historic perspective. His research on the Roma was also presented by Alexander Mušinka from the University of Prešov. Helena Sadílková spoke about the migration of Roma in Czechoslovakia during the Communist period, and Ondřej Cinkajzl described Roma criminality in the context of the Czechoslovak normalisation regime. Eva Krekovičová from the Institute of Ethnology of the SAS presented the picture of Roma in Slovakia and the changes in the course of time.

One of the most successful and most attended conference panels was a block dedicated to the views of Roma participation and empowerment. Up to thirteen participants presented their papers in this panel throughout the day, focusing on the different aspects of the evaluation of various programmes supporting Roma integration. The panel was unique thanks to its inter-disciplinary character with an added value in the form of a debate of social anthropologists, ethnologists, political scientists, sociologists and professionals, focusing on the different aspects of implemented projects, from education through Roma emancipation up to political participation of Roma within the European space.

The Institute of Ethnology of the SAS in Slovakia has been for several years pursuing
the trend of exploring the activities of churches and religious movements among the Roma, having become a prominent academic institute within the Central European region dealing with this topic in a systematic way. This professional interest resulted in organising a panel, in which Tatiana Podolinská raised a debate on the perception and re-definition of Roma ethnicity after the conversion of Roma to Pentecostal and charismatic movements. As the organiser of this panel, she invited academics from the United Kingdom, Spain, Russia and India to present their research on the different aspects of religiousness and the importance of churches and religious movements to the social change of excluded Roma groups.

The panel organised by Hristo Kyuchukov on Islam and the Roma was held in a similar vein, but with a more specific topic which has been acquiring importance mainly in the Balkan region and in some Eastern European countries (and is equally important in connection with Roma migration to different Western European countries).

The world Roma linguistics was widely represented at the conference, as well, being one of the key disciplines of Romani studies since the origins of interest in this field. The scientific trends in this area have for many years been determined by Czech Romani studies/linguistics, which had a significant presence at the conference. Viktor Elšík from the Charles University presented the results of a unique project of detailed mapping of the dialects of central Roma language (Roma dialects in the Central European region), and the debate on this topic was enriched by prominent world linguists focusing on Romani studies, such as Yaron Matras.
from the University of Manchester, or Kimmo Granqvist from the University of Helsinki.

The fact that this important conference was held in Bratislava was an added value not only in terms of the presentation of renowned researchers from all over the world, but also with regard to the fact that Slovak researchers had a unique opportunity to present the results of their research at such an important forum. Many of them proved that their research was unique not only in the local context, but also in the global one. For instance, the presentation by Andrej Belák from the Charles University, who has been dealing in his long-term research with the perception of health and access to healthcare by the Roma, extending his perspective to the research of the “other side” – doctors and professionals providing healthcare within the environment of segregated Roma settlements, showed a big potential of the methods of medical anthropology in developing practical and sustainable guides to improve the health situation in Roma settlements. On the basis of his several-year research conducted among Roma leaders and politicians, Tomáš Hrustič from the Institute of Ethnology of the SAS highlighted several factors of Roma political participation in Slovakia and the raising of awareness of the importance of Roma involvement in the management of public affairs, which is proven by the increased number of Roma mayors and deputies at a local level. Ľuboš Kovács from the Faculty of Social and Economic Sciences of the Comenius University presented his research on the economic relationships within the urban ghetto of Budapest, having significantly contributed to the discussion on the urban ghettoisation and pauperisation of the Roma. The historian Lucia Segľová from the University of Prešov described her exceptional research on Roma persecution in the Turiec region during World War II, and presented some new facts documenting the tragic period of the Roma holocaust. Many other Slovak and Czech academics also demonstrated that Romani studies in the territory of former Czechoslovakia have a firm position and are of big importance to the global study of the Roma.

Given the big interest of the Slovak mass media in this event and the positive international feedback, the conference organisers are convinced that events of this nature contribute to the deepening of knowledge and understanding of historic, cultural and social similarities and differences of the ethnic groups that have lived in the territory of modern nation states for centuries.

The conference also included the annual meeting of the Gypsy Lore Society, which debated several organisational and administrative matters of the association and pointed out that the Bratislava conference was an event with the highest attendance and success in its
Next year, the representatives of this international society and many other experts in Romani studies will meet in Chisinau, Moldova, on 10th–12th September 2015.

For more details on the conference, read the short interview with prof. Elena Marushiakova, President of the Gypsy Lore Society, who currently works at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences.

Why is this conference different and unique compared to other conferences on Roma?

In my view, all participants agreed that this conference had the best organisation from all conferences held so far, and everything ran very smoothly. I would like to thank personally and also on behalf of my colleagues to the Institute of Ethnology of the SAS for their great efforts hidden behind the perfect organisation of this event. The conference was extraordinary also thanks to the record number of papers, their diversity and high professional quality.

What are the benefits of organising this kind of events?

GLS annual conferences are organised mainly with the aim to enable experts from different countries and different scientific disciplines, working in the field of Romani studies, to meet, to exchange their views, to inform each other about their recent research, as is common at any scientific conference. In this way, our conferences also contribute to increasing the scientific quality of Romani studies, to the involvement of experts from the country in which the conference held into international cooperation, and to raising the awareness of both the expert and the general public. Last but not least, our conferences could also con-
tribute to improving the social practice, but this is up to politicians and practitioners to decide to what extent they would be involved and willing to use this scientific knowledge. 

**What are the criteria for selecting a country to hold a conference and for choosing lecturers and conference papers?**

We usually receive invitations from our colleagues, members of the Gypsy Lore Society, informing us about their willingness to organise a conference in their country. The basic condition is to receive the invitation to organise the conference at least two years before the planned date; another condition is that it must be a country with an existing research community dedicated to Romani studies; practical matters, such as logistics, spaces, etc. are also considered. At the meetings of the association’s leadership, we discuss the proposals to hold the conference and seek to select those ensuring the best possible preparation, the highest quality results, and those with the best impacts on the society. Certainly, we also take into account the reputation of the inviting organisation and colleagues.

We do not select lecturers, we select papers. Several months before the conference, a call for papers to be presented at the conference is published. The conference secretariat makes the paper abstracts anonymous (by erasing the names of authors), and the scientific board of the conference then evaluates the abstracts, disqualifying the ones of poor quality and approving those at a high expert level. This is done to ensure professional quality of conferences and to exclude subjective approaches.

**What are your feelings from this year’s conference in Bratislava? Why was it different/better/worse and what surprised you?**

This year’s conference was characterised by several peculiarities. I would first mention the great efforts of most participants to give all they could and to show the best it could be. We knew long before the conference that there would be a record number...
of the best experts from around the world, which helped to ensure that each participant tried to present the best results of their scientific work and to use every opportunity for consultations, discussions, etc. At this year’s conference, the local organisers (the Institute of Ethnology of the SAS) initiated pre-organised panels, which gave participants the opportunity to focus, under the different panels, on specific actual, thematic or disciplinary aspects of the phenomena studied. This initiative has been considered very successful. In order to achieve greater disciplinary synergy, we decided to continue with this practice also at our next conferences. We already have the first results – the members of the expert group “Romani linguistics”, who had organised their conferences separately from us, decided at their meeting in Oslo to hold their conferences as part of the Gypsy Lore Society’s conferences from now on. Our historians, too, announced their wish to have their pre-organised panel at the next conference.

IVANA ŠUSTEROVÁ,
TOMÁŠ HRUSTIČ,
Institute of Ethnology of the Slovak Academy of Sciences

Dr. Arne Mann from the Institution of Ethnology of Slovak Academy of Sciences on ceremonial opening of the exhibitions (photo: archive of IE SAS).
The film festival Etnofilm Čadca was founded in the year 1980 and since then it has been held every two years in the autumn in Čadca. It is an international film festival about ethnology, social and cultural anthropology. The main festival organizers are the Žilina self-governing region, the Kysuce cultural center in Čadca and the Town of Čadca. They closely collaborate with professionals from the film industry and many ethnological institutions from Slovakia. From its beginning, the festival presented movies that were created by professional movie producers but also movies of ethnologists / ethnomusicologists or amateur directors. In the beginning of the new millennium, professional movies were preferred. This was different from the other film festivals in the CAFFE network – Coordinating Anthropological Film Festivals in Europe. Even though in the present time the festival is open to all forms of film production, visual anthropology doesn’t have an institutionalized foundation, that could work in the CAFFE network.

The festival ETNOFILM ČADCA has built a stable structure and network of international partnerships with institutions and film creators in its 18 years lifespan. It has a competitive spirit and there are many associated events. The prerequisite for applying to show films at the festival is that they are max. 2 years old. In 2014 the international contest Etnofilm Čadca 2014, 76 films were subscribed, of which the selection committee selected 36 films from 9 countries (Poland, the Czech Republic, Hungary, Serbia, Italy, Croatia, Belgium, the United Arab Emirates and Slovakia) with a total of 24 hours of screen time. Competition films are judged by an international jury as follows; Zuzana Beňušková (ethnologist) – Slovak Republic, Daniel Luther (ethnologist) – Slovak Republic, Tomáš Petráň (film mak-
er) – Czech Republic, Ilja Ruppeldt (film-maker) - New Zealand, Tünde Tušková (linguistic teacher and former external collaborator in TV) – Hungary. For two awards – Literary Fund and the Prize of Film Journalists – Štefan Vraštiak (Slovak film critic and former director of the Slovak Film Institute) mediates between the Slovak Literary Fund, the Slovak Film Institute and Etnofilm Čadca, Slovak Republic.

The main prizes of the festival are the Golden, Silver and Bronze Turoň, among them the jury had the opportunity to grant several other awards. In 2014 the following films and filmmakers were awarded:

The Golden Turoň – Grand Prix: Pásztorok ösvényein (Po stopách pastierov) / On the Shepherd’s Path, Slovakia, Attila Vörös

The Silver Turoň: Exponáty alebo príbehy z kaštieľa / Exhibits or Stories from the Manor, Slovakia, Paľo Korec

The Bronze Turoň: La Carrera / On the Carrera, Italy, Francesco Costabile – Assunta Nugnes

Chairman of Žilina Self-Governing Region Award: Paľo Žiak, furman z Vrchslatiny / Paľo Žiak, the Carter from Vrchslatina, Slovakia, Ján Kuska

Award of the Festival Director: Kosma, Serbia, Sonja Blagojević

Award of the Mayor of Čadca: Pygmées de la Route / Road Pygmies, Belgium, Marie Devuyyst – Alain Lemaître

Award of the Slovak Society of Ethnology “Ethnologist behind the camera”: Carnival King of Europe, Italy, Giovanni Kezich – Michele Trentini

Award of the Cultural Foundation of Kysuce: Život je život / Life is life, Slovakia, Pavel Višňovský

The best Czech Film Award – awarded by the Embassy of the Czech Republic: „Nic, než národopis“ / “Nothing but...
ethnography”, the Czech Republic, Zdenek Bell

Award of the Slovak Film Institute: Láska, láska – szerelem, szerelem / Love, love, Hungary, John Bencsik

Further awards were granted:

Martin Slivka Award – for the best individual achievement of a Slovak filmmaker awarded by the Literary Foundation: Viliam’s Gruska: Rodiská a doliny / The Birthplaces and Valleys, Slovakia.

Matica slovenská Award – for the best film about the life of a Slovak filmmaker abroad awarded to a Slovak filmmaker living outside Slovakia: Pavel Korbel, Hungary, Zuzana Antalová

Award of the Film Journalists: Všetky moje deti /All My Children, Slovakia, Ladislav Kajoš

Student Jury Award: Život je život / Life is life, Slovakia, Pavel Višňovský

Compared with previous years, the festival Etnofilm Čadca 2014 was organized on a highly professional level. In 2014, it had one of the highest attendances in recent years and was attended by a relatively large amount of ethnologists, young people and filmmakers with many discussions taking place. Films that were played at Etnofilm Čadca can be played at other non-commercial events that promote this festival.

During the existence of the festival Etnofilm Čadca an archive of film documents has been created. The archive is held at Kysucké Museum in Čadca (the archive is not complete). The last two years of the festival are archived at the District cultural center in Čadca.

The film festival FOLKLORE AND TRADITIONS was held in 1st – 3rd May 2014 in Hriňová (near Detva) for the first time. The festival sets its goals to achieve the following:

• Involve non-professional film makers to focus their works on folk traditions and to encourage the emergence of other films with the same focus.

• Document and archive often merging workflows, events, and other things.

• Publicly present existing movies.

• To give active folklorists and audiences the opportunity to participate

• Provide space for an exchange of views on the issue.

This conceived mission of the newly established film festival fills a gap in the field of Slovak film festivals, which occurs at the border of amateur films and film festival Etnofilm Čadca.

Films presented at the festival weren’t limited by the year of release, which gives the film festival an undeniable advantage – it also allows wider reach for even the older film makers.

In addition to Slovak films the organizers of the first festival in Hriňová managed to get two German document films about Slovak culture. By genre, the films ranged from documents; through reports to film records of stage programs. In addition to competing films, the projections included non-competition films related to local traditions. The organizers have the ambition to organize the festival every year. The anticipated second annual festival (last weekend in April 2015) is again divided into competitive and non-competitive sections. The festival in the competition section focuses on amateur films, the non-competitive section gives the opportunity for the presentation of film production of professional makers, cultural institutions (museums, ÚĽUV – The Centre for Folk Art Production), Departments of Ethnology and individuals defined in the art festival.

The intention of focusing film documents, on the phenomena of traditional culture is in line with the trend of documentation of tangible and intangible cultural heritage. The festival originated with the awareness of the need to record often the last bearers of folk traditions – skills, production techniques and processes.

The jury composed of Zuzana Beňušková (ethnomologist), Igor Hraško (member of Slovak Parliament), Peter Dimitrov (filmmaker), Roman Varga (filmmaker) and Jozef Krnáč (university teacher in the field of public administration and regional development) awarded the following awards:

1. Prize – Ján Kuska: Paľo Žiak, furman z Vrchslatíny / Paľo Žiak, the Carter from Vrchslatina, Slovakia

2. Prize – Miroslav Ciglian: Na salaši Pas-
tierska / Shepherd’s Hut Pastierska
3. Prize – Beáta Oravcová: Remeslo pod Tatrami / Crafts under the Tatras
   Peter Poboček: Norik Muránsky / Noriko Murano

Honorable Awards went to:
1. Mgr. Anton Trebuľa for the development of regional education
2. Winfrid Skrobek (Germany) for the film FUJARA

There was an Audience Award, won by a documentary drama made by the local primary school with nursery Krivec, Hriňová: Witches days.

The Film Festival of Folklore and tradition should be seen as an example of improving the attractiveness of local / regional cultural calendar of Hriňová / Podpoľanie region in order to promote the village and its attractive environment with scattered settlements which stands for entry in the UNESCO list of natural heritage, and to attract those interested in film and traditional culture, as well as tourists. The first year was successful and although the festival is still forming, it may become the impetus for Slovak ethnologists to present their own film documentation, which lags far behind currently available technology. It also helps creating film documentaries in collaboration with professional or amateur makers.

ZUZANA BEŇUŠKOVÁ,
Institute of Ethnology of the SAS
vin Bratislava

5. SESSION OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATES PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION FOR THE SAFEGUARDING OF THE INTANGIBLE CULTURAL HERITAGE
(2nd – 4th June 2014, UNESCO Headquarters, Paris)

In this year more than 600 participants took part in the General Assembly of the States Parties to the Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage. The State Party of Slovakia was represented by Juraj Hamar and Ľubica Volanská.

One of the most important approved procedural changes is connected to the method of evaluation of the nomination files. From 2015 all of the nominations to any of the UNESCO lists related to the intangible cultural heritage (Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity, List of Intangible Cultural Heritage in Need of Urgent Safeguarding and The Register of Best Safeguarding Practices – further just Lists) will be evaluated by a single Evaluation Body instead of original two Bodies (Subsidiary Body and Evaluation Body). The new Evaluation body will consist of twelve members appointed by the Intergovernmental Committee for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (further just Committee). Six members will come from the single states, that are not members of the Committee and six members will come from the accredited non-governmental organisations. The selection of the members should respect equal geographic coverage as well as covering of various aspects and areas of the ICH.

The General Assembly made a decision to allocate more than $ 4 million from the Fund for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage to the support of the single states in their efforts in safeguarding ICH.

The General Assembly accredited 22 new NGOs, so now there are 178 NGOs, their task is to support the Committee and give advice on various questions. Twelve new members became part of the Committee this year: Afghanistan, Algeria, Bulgaria, Congo, Ivory Coast, Ethiopia, Hungary, India, Mongolia, The Republic of Korea, Santa Lucia and Turkey.
The Slovak Republic decided to withdraw its candidature in the sense or principle of solidarity and cooperation instead of competition and conveyed the place in the Committee to its original rival-candidates Hungary and Bulgaria. It is necessary to remark, the two mentioned states developed larger efforts to gain the seat in the Committee through various activities, propagation of their accomplishments etc.

Evaluation of the Committee Report for the years 2012–2013

Delegations of State parties (158) negotiated about the Lists (3 new countries ratified the Convention only in this year and have not participated in the General Assembly yet). During this period 60 new elements were inscribed on the Lists: 8 on the List of Intangible Cultural Heritage in Need of Urgent Safeguarding, 52 on the Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity. In the period of 2012–2013 the Committee approved the financial support for 15 nominations and related projects. The State parties’ delegations (foremost Yemen and Indonesia) stressed the importance of strengthening the cooperation with WIPO (World Intellectual Property Organisation) related to increasing the effectivity of the projects. The countries further demanded changes of the nomination process towards simplification of the whole procedure (countries of the electoral group 5a). During this time the Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage was signed by a further 17 countries. This Report was approved unanimously.


The Secretariat presented the project, to which is being given the biggest emphasis: Capacity Building. The goal of this project is to train the experts in different parts of the world in the area of safeguarding and protection of intangible cultural heritage. In this project just 17% was used for the administrative purpose and 83% directly on the project. The delegations of state parties participating on the General Assembly agreed unanimously, that the effectivity of this project is high. However, it is necessary to mention, that more than half of the projects asking for financial support were rejected. The main reason was the incorrect filling in of the nomination forms. The delegation from Iran suggested, the states could ask for the financial support via electronic form. This proposal was approved as a possible change in the future, but for the moment the actual regulations for acquisition of the financial subsidy is still valid.

The Secretariat evaluated the administrative side of its work in the mentioned period. The main complaints were connected to the insufficiency of financial means. On the other side it is necessary to mention, the Secretariat in this period used just approximately 60% of its funds. It is also necessary to mention, the effectivity of the utilization of the funds by the Secretariat is increasing. In this point the countries were mentioned, that are supporting the work of the Secretariat by the most financial means – over the framework of the obligatory dotation: Japan and Norway. The only member states from our (Second) electoral group that made a contribution to the fund were the rival-candidates of The Slovak Republic in the election to the Committee: Hungary and Bulgaria.

All of the changes concerning the Operational Directives were of a formal character: specifications of definitions. The main discussions by member states were focused on criteria, according to which the international experts – as advisors of the Committee should be chosen by the particular electoral groups. Related to this question it is interesting to mention, the delegation of Albania requested, the experts should be selected from NGOs that have no founders within the member states. With other words, the Albanian delegation posed the question, if some NGOs can have so called international status. This change would allow the separatist regions to nominate their own experts (for example Kosovo). This suggestion was not approved. Accreditations of all of the nominated NGOs were unanimously approved.

Utilization of the funds

The Secretariat stated, the utilization of the funds by the Secretariat is improving from year to year and getting more and more
Effective. On the other side, as it has been already mentioned, in the period June 2012 and June 2014 just approximately 60% of possible finances were used. The reasoning used by the Secretariat was the necessity of the existence of the funds in the case, a country would request the assistance and its proposal was successful. This argument doesn’t seem to be very strong, taking into account the Secretariat complaints about the insufficiency of financial means. For this reasons the Secretariat already had to reduce its personal capacities.

Redistributing of the Committee seats according to single electoral groups

In the period between June 2012 and June 2014 the Convention was signed by 17 new states. The majority of the new members come from Africa, thus it was necessary to adjust the seats of every single electoral group in the Committee. In the electoral group Nr. 2, where also Slovakia is a part of, one seat was taken away (4–3). Slovakia withdrew its candidature in the election to the Committee, as has already been mentioned above. One of the reasons was, its rival-candidates Hungary and Bulgaria actively participated on the obtaining of the seats also by increasing the voluntary donations.

Election of the new Committee members

In the First electoral group 1 one seat was taken by Turkey with 72 votes. The second ranked France with 44 votes and Italy with 25 votes. In the Second electoral group, because the Slovak Republic withdrew its candidature, Bulgaria and Hungary gained the seats in the Committee automatically. In the Third electoral group Santa Lucia got 102 votes in front of Guatemala with 39 votes. In the Fourth electoral group there were 4 seats, which were given to India (135 votes), Republic of Korea (126), Mongolia (102) and Afghanistan (97). Samoa gained 88 votes and so no seat in the Committee. In the Electoral group 5a Ethiopia got 119 votes, Ivory Coast 118 votes and Congo gained 105 votes. Botswana with 59 votes did not succeed. In the last Electoral group 5b the one seat was gained by Algeria with 104 votes over Mauretania that got 35 votes. To the successful election the delegations congratulated each other and new members committed themselves to keep the main Ideas of the Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage.

ĽUBICA VOĽANSKÁ,
Institute of Ethnology of the SAS in Bratislava

INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE VIDEO DOCUMENTING OF THE INTANGIBLE CULTURAL HERITAGE AND SHORT VIDEOS FOR ICH RESEARCH (25th – 26th September 2014, Slovene Ethnographic Museum, Ljubljana)

The conference was organised by the Slovene Ethnographic Museum, the coordinator for the protection of intangible cultural heritage in Slovenia, under the honorary patronage of the Slovenian National Commission for UNESCO.

The topic was focused on video documenting of intangible cultural heritage (ICH) and videos for national and various UNESCO Lists. Short videos (5-10 minutes) presenting the intangible cultural heritage phenomena as part of national and UNESCO ICH Lists (see (http://www.unesco.org/culture/ich/index.php?lg=en&pg=00559) are forming a quickly growing video library. The fact is that, UNESCO gives very specific policies on written documentation of ICH phenomena but less demands and recommendations for video production. The result is that, the video library presents a great variety of video forms and styles, some of them becoming predominant as they impact further visualisation of the ICH in general all over the world.
The aim of the conference was to offer space for evaluation and exchange of experiences, and furthermore, to introduce visual production based on principles of visual anthropology. Professionals from UNESCO and state agencies, coordinators, researchers, producers and authors of videos for ICH lists were invited to discuss strong and weak points of various video styles and give answers to the questions: “How do videos meet the UNESCO’s demands, state strategies, professional attitudes of the researchers, aspirations of the heritage bearers, filmmaker’s visions, etc.? Where are these videos presented and to whom? What is the relation between written documents, photographs and videos on the ICH web-pages? What is the impact of the ICH videos on the presented heritage phenomena, their bearers, education processes, promotion of countries, touristic industry, etc.” (quotation from the Call for papers).

The programme committee consisted of Nena Židov, SEM, Miha Peče, Institute of Slovene Ethnology SRC at the Slovenian Academy of Sciences and Arts, and Nadja Valentičič Furlan, SEM.

Interestingly, even in an academic environment, there still occurred emotionally coloured romantic phrases like “intangible cultural treasures”, coming mainly from the representative of UNESCO Slovenia Barbara Urbanija.

Related to UNESCO representatives, it is also necessary to mention, what message they are giving to scholars interested in the questions of filming intangible cultural heritage (not only related to UNESCO Lists), when they permanently answer the requests for further information by polite postponement of the answer to the future. Nadja Valentičič Furlan, one of the organizers of the conference remarked, there were several attempts to invite some of the UNESCO representatives of the Secretariat of the Convention for Safeguarding of the ICH to participate in this or similar conferences, but although they showed their interest in this particular issue, no one has actually participated. Nadja Valentičič Furlan suggested inviting them to participate in the published volume from the conference next year. Following from what has been just said, one could assume, the question of filming of ICH related to UNESCO Lists does not seem to be one of the priorities of the Secretariat.

Most of the contributions brought more questions than answers, apparently because filming ICH in general is a relatively new topic in the academic discourse in many of the countries participating in the conference. Beate Engelbrecht, a Senior Research Partner from the Max-Planck-Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnic Diversity in Göttingen, Germany, presented her paper Documenting the intangible cultural heritage with film: Questions of protecting, preserving and safeguarding. She discussed the way that many anthropologists use the video camera in their research into complex events such as rituals. The technical development made it possible to analyse the created audio-visual document of an event more closely afterwards. On the example of filming the House Ceremony of Toraja in Indonesia she asked questions about the facts influencing the form of the video documenting ICH: Who is filming? – Anthropologists, local videographer, tourists, guests; What is the purpose of the films?; What is their contribution to safeguarding the intangible cultural heritage?; How to work with already existing films?; Where the material can be collected? What image of Torajan culture is transmitted? Further questions she raised were related to more general problems: Who are the owners of the cultural practices? Who can decide what may be filmed? The whole discussion was focused on the search for more general recommendations, rules, etc.

Shina Erlewein from the International Graduate School: Heritage Studies, Brandenburg University of Technology Cottbus in Germany presented a paper titled Screening the intangible: Audio-visual representation and community participation. She concentrated on the major shifts in the conceptualisation and usage of ethnographic film in the representation and mediation of culture and the constitution of knowledge and cultural memory. She argued that in addition to the text/content, the social parameters of production need to be scrutinised. Audio-visual representations are media practices through which meanings are constructed, communicated and circulated among social groups.
These meanings are to a certain extent shared meanings. They are constitutive of culture and as such never innocent, neutral or objective. They exercise power, make sense of the world and position subjectivities within the world. These representations may be manufactured from outside or from inside a socio-cultural group. Relying on a constructivist theoretical model and postcolonial paradigms she proposed that, in the context of mediating culture, we may also consider a conscious approach towards a shared representation, wherein the self combines with the other in an imagination of the self and the other at once. This approach acknowledges that audio-visual representations are not “windows into the world”, but are constructed in an encounter between representatives from different cultures. In this encounter the camera does not mark a demarcation line between two cultures, but a possibility of shared practice and meaning. In her opinion the communities present the most important part of the film-producing process and the approach she suggested will lead to a democratisation of the ICH. Intangible cultural heritage depends on communities. Their interpretation are significant and constitutive, meaning is constructed and recreated within representation.

Mirela Hrovatin, Ethnologist and Cultural Anthropologist, Senior Expert Advisor of the Ministry of Culture in Croatia, Zagreb, presented her paper with the title Creating a unique narrative: The background of the making of short films on ICH elements from Croatia inscribed in the UNESCO lists. She discussed her experiences with the creation of about 20 short films that refer to ICH elements from Croatia during the preparation of the nomination files for the UNESCO ICH lists (Representative, Urgent and Register of Best Practices). She described the procedure, the issues involved and the goals of the making of these films. In the Croatian national register of ICH, there are more than 130 files inscribed, the approximately 20 mentioned were chosen according to the question, whether or not the communities were willing to communicate and participate on the nomination process to one of the UNESCO Lists of ICH. The films were a result of a cooperation of several kinds of experts, coming from the Institute of Ethnology and Folklore in Zagreb, the Institute of Croatian Language and Linguistics, the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences from the University of Zagreb and various museums etc. and the professional editors and movie makers from the Croatian radio-television, as the professionals from Croatian TV have a lot of experience and the country has its own tradition in creating the movies related to traditional cultural practices.

Their effort was to make a “shot from the side” – interestingly – a slightly different perspective as presented in the previous paper by Shina Erlewein, where she claimed the eyes of the movie makers are always culturally constructed.

Tamara Nikolić Đerić has been working as a curator in the Ethnographic Museum of Istria in Pazin, Croatia over the last six years. During this time she has encountered different issues regarding intangible heritage and presented her experiences in the contribution Visualising intangible culture: Towards new “markets” for visual anthropologists. She described how the perceived lack of adequate documentation, but also of interpretation of various cultural phenomena resulted in the setting up of a film festival with accompanying programmes. The organising committee soon realised that the festival was probably the best way how to communicate their research to a wider public and an (almost) perfect platform for developing innovative approaches in documenting, researching and interpreting intangible heritage. She presented the video she worked on for the Ecomuseum Batana, when in early 2014 the museum was proposed for UNESCO as an example of best practice in safeguarding ICH. The work on this and similar movies offers a ground where it is possible and necessary to combine both theoretical and practical work, stressing the constraints during the production of videos aimed at presenting ICH for UNESCO’s lists and accentuating the potential these projects have for the development of visual anthropology in terms of applying anthropological knowledge in wider cultural and scientific contexts.

She talked about the potential of the film connected to the senses and emotions, as film is the medium to help us to transmit all
the feelings. Through emotions and creative reinterpretation of culture the experimental films, new media help us to better understand the mentioned issues.

She also discussed the “invisibility” of visual anthropologists in Croatian scientific discourse, (e.g. the lack of a web page dedicated to visual anthropology).

János Tari, from the Institute of Social and Communication Science of the Faculty of Humanities, Károli Gáspár University of the Reformed Church in Hungary, Budapest, as well as cinematographer and docu-media-film director made a presentation titled The flowers of Kalocsa: The cultural space and a form of cultural expression. Actually, it was more a presentation about the successes and activities in safeguarding the ICH in Hungary (AVICOM, FIAMP) – connected also to ICOM, UNESCO and Smithsonian Folklife Institute – than a problem oriented paper.

The Kalocsa Region is an area of Hungary that has always played a rather special part in the life of the country due to its historic role, its characteristic dialect, its world famous folk art and its gastronomy, as well as for the sheer natural richness of the landscape. The rich floral patterns of Kalocsa’s embroideries and wall paintings have come to represent Hungarian folk art throughout the world. It is the art form of the traditional peasant culture of the villages established around the town of Kalocsa: twenty-five farmsteads and minor satellite villages (szállás). Using archive footage, the movie makers of the film about this particular region, added a new tool of mediating memory to illustrate and describe the survival and revival of intangible cultural heritage in the traditional community of Kalocsa.

Juraj Hamar from SĽUK – The Slovak State Traditional Dance Company, Bratislava, Slovakia presented a paper with the title The problem of the presentation and representation of the elements of ICH in video films. In the first part of the paper, the author concentrated on the theoretical base of the current (scholarly, artistic and institutional) discourse about short videos related to intangible cultural heritage elements nominated for inscription on one of the UNESCO Lists of Intangible Cultural Heritage. The problem is, neither the UNESCO Operational Directives nor the instructions concerning the video documentation provided in the guidelines, offer advice regarding the ideological content of the film footage, they only specify the technical details. What should the films be like – an ethnographic film, an artistic document or commercial entertainment? Who is the target group – ethnographers, anthropologists, laymen or diplomats? Shall the film present or represent the particular element? Is it possible for the bearers of the tradition to mediate the value and the importance of the element for the local community towards the international society, merely through a 10 minute video?

The second part of the paper presented two video documents. The first one was about the element of the Music of Terchová that was inscribed on the UNESCO Representative List of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in 2013. The second was the pre-production of the video related to the multinational nomination of the element The Phenomenon of Czech and Slovak Puppetry which is being prepared by the Slovak Republic in coproduction with the Czech Republic. This element will enter the process of inscription on the Representative List of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in 2015.

Miha Peče from the Institute of Slovenian Ethnology, the Research Centre of the Slovenian Academy of Sciences and Arts in Ljubljana, Slovenia presented the paper Filming intangible cultural heritage: beyond promotional and educational genres. He stated the audio-visual clips which are associated with the elements of UNESCO’s lists of intangible heritage are mostly made in the manner of promotional or educational films. These genres are very different from cinematographic documentaries or anthropological films, and it would be difficult to find common ground that would enable constructive dialogue with the legacy of documentary film or visual anthropology. The present state or role of audio-visual clips is very marginal. The author first summarised his experience and knowledge, gained in the pioneer period, when the Register of the Intangible Heritage of Slovenia was formed. At that time, practice certainly outstripped theory, but because of that the initial ideas were constantly supplemented and amend-
ed when they collided with unforeseen problems. The process of transformation has been more evolutionary, we could also say progressive, since with every reinterpretation it adapted more to the relevant conditions.

In his opinion we should strive for more open register in the area of movies related to UNESCO, as the video constitutes just one segment of the multimedia projection. The movies focus on visualising – they have chosen a simple describing style.

Nadja Valentincic Furlan, Museum Advisor and Curator for Ethnographic Film in the Slovene Ethnographic Museum in Ljubljana, Slovenia presented the paper *Strategy of the audio-visual documentation of the intangible cultural heritage for the Slovene ICH register*. She discussed how the visualisation of the ICH takes into account the recommendations and goals of UNESCO, the principles and ethical code of visual anthropology, and the experience and findings gained through structuring videos for museum exhibitions and web pages. She suggested the national web page and the UNESCO portal can be defined also as virtual exhibitions of ICH phenomena and their bearers (http://www.unesco.org/culture/ich/index.php?lg=en&pg=00559).

She also discussed the complementarity of various modes (texts, photos, videos) on ICH portals and presented the access to data on the web page of the Slovene Coordinator of ICH preservation and the UNESCO portal.

The participants in the closing discussion observed, there are still more questions open than answers given. Some points were agreed unanimously – the strong cooperation with the communities as the most important participant in the production of any kind of movies; further that different movies should be produced by different occasions and for different purposes (documentation, National Lists/Registers of ICH, various ICH UNESCO Lists, etc.). Another conclusion consists of the idea, filming working processes and ritual would need different approaches than filming other elements, so there should exist a more pluralistic approach.

ĽUBICA VOLANSKÁ,
*Institute of Ethnology of the SAS in Bratislava*
This book is the result of fieldwork undertaken by Czech cultural anthropologists Julie Hubeňáková and Martin Soukup in Papua New Guinea in 2009 and 2011. It is a richly illustrated, useful and clearly written reference work about life on the second largest island of the world. Hubeňáková and Soukup introduce the sociocultural system of Papua New Guinea and they also provide comprehensive information on the geography and economy, although the aim was to study visual representations of selected students at the local school. The research was accomplished among Nungon people living in the Uruwa Valley region. The authors analysed and interpreted visual representations in the form of children’s drawings. It is an interesting research technique, which also requires a certain degree of creative approach of the respondents. The aesthetic function was of course marginal in this case. As Soukup pointed out only a few anthropologists have used drawings to study culture itself. Key methods of fieldworks are usually interview and dialogue. Analysis of drawings can be seen as a special type of (intercultural) communication. It is a kind of “silent dialogue” between researcher and informant. Here drawing is a tool of communication. Maybe the anthropologists did not think about how useful a method they used when taking into account the effects of creative process. An artistic instinct allows us to express emotions through drawing. But first of all, anthropologists need to know the contents of the creator’s consciousness to decode his or her vision of the world. Nevertheless, trying to read what somebody drew could be quite difficult, especially when he/she draws something like culture. This is the main reason why we find these reflexive perspectives exciting. As Soukup pointed out, drawing is a good tool when we would like to prevent language barriers and collapses. However, in Lotmanian thought, to understand drawing could bring also the same barriers as to understand natural language. Therefore, in conclusion, drawing can pull down the shame but it is also a difficult communication tool. It is also interesting that anthropologists do not meet with the “problem” which some people have in our culture and it is the self-opinion that they cannot draw.

Drawings of Papuan students represent their own view of culture, family, future and village system. The authors provide a well-balanced view of the society from a male and female perspective and also try to capture the essence of the people in Papua New Guinea. The illustrations detail the aspects of way of life. There is a story behind every picture. The book presents a valuable reference for how everyday life looks like in this region. It is interesting that on drawings, which represent culture, there is no influence of western culture. Students are completely clear about what culture is and we are sure that they do not know the academic terms. They do not need them. The chapter about the student’s point of view of future, their dreams and wishes is also very interesting. Hubeňáková shows that they would prefer more “elements” of western civiliza-
tion. We suppose that it is important to differentiate how people think the world ought to be versus what people want for themselves. This chapter brings important data, which could be useful for other researches. Soukup and Hubeňáková accumulated and summarized an impressive volume of data. We suppose that analysing drawings can be a very useful research tool in cultures with non-literate tradition. The authors do not use autoethnography (in its true sense) as an auxiliary method in their research, but descriptions of drawers helped them to analyse the Papuan culture. Autoethnography can provide answers to some of the questions raised by other approaches.

Emic analysis refers to an anthropologist’s attempt to explain a foreign culture using insiders’ terms and concepts. In general, any picture has more possible interpretations because people from different cultures can concentrate on different things. There are multiple meanings for every social act, many right readings for every text, and many explanations of art. Virtually everything we see can be represented by a combination of lines and shapes. Culture is hidden also in interpretation. For sure, there is nothing like a final word in the topic of culture but rather voices in an ongoing dialogue between people of different cultures. We can conclude that this kind of anthropological study is in the Czecho-slovakian research field quite unique. This book can be an important contribution to our understanding of Papua New Guinean culture and good fundament to build an intercultural bridge between us and “the others”. If we can find a path between two cultures, we can obtain good things from both.

ZDENKA MECHUROVÁ, Department of cultural studies of UKF in Nitra (external cooperation)
day) for 35 years, and during her work she wrote a number of important studies on regional song styles, song genres (ballads, funeral laments, military songs, etc.), new songs (songs about collective farms and partisan songs), as well as robbers’ and workers’ songs. Besides the bibliography of Soňa Burlasová, readers can also learn about the context of her works from the introduction written by E. Kreková on the basis of an interview with Soňa Burlasová and an in-depth professional description of her work.


This publication edited by A. Bitušíková and D. Luther focuses on the processes of adaptation of individuals and groups of urban inhabitants in the period of social changes after 1989. The eight articles of this book written by different Slovak scholars present topics such as transformation of micro- and macro-worlds in post-socialism, changes in the working life, changes in food practices, the migration of new Vietnamese immigrants to Bratislava, traditional Indian medicine practised by Indian migrants in Slovakia, LGBTI movement, or coping with the past (reflection of the holocaust in Slovakia or adaptation of forcibly displaced families). The publication is bilingual; besides the papers in Slovak the publication also contains their shortened versions in English. The study of some of the topics of this monographic publication highlights not only the new kind of urban-ethnological research in terms of knowledge, but also the method-
In his newest publication, the ethnologist P. Salner deals with the present forms of Jewish funerals in Slovakia through an example of the Bratislava Jewish community and the cemeteries used by this community. The author describes in separate chapters of his publication not only the history of the Bratislava Jewish community, but also the eventful fate of the Jewish cemeteries in the city – the orthodox and the neological ones, and the Chatam Sofer Memorial. The author also analyses the traditional way of burying remains as part of the Jewish funeral, the work of Chevra kadisha organisations, and Jewish funeral ceremonies, as well as the new and yet unexplored phenomenon of cremation in a Jewish environment, which causes various conflicts of opinions and raises new questions. In addition to a large amount of interesting ethnographic facts and data, the book also contains many high-quality black-and-white photographs with great information value.

Blueprint is a remarkable chapter in the long and rich history of European textile. Since the 18th century until the 20th century blueprint textiles were so widespread and common in Slovakia that they did not draw
special attention. Interest in blueprint textiles increased when the production already declined. The present publication is based on previously discovered information about blueprint textiles that was published by other authors, but also presents the results of own research of its author Oľga Danglová and her insight into the various museum collections. This book contains the history of blueprint textile in Europe and especially on the territory of Slovakia, the depiction and visual illustrations of the production processes, blueprint motives and also “a glossary” of the blueprint patterns. Such representative “blue-book” is published both in Slovak and in English languages.

VANOVIČOVÁ, Z.: Autorita symbolu/The Authority of a Symbol

The author in the individual chapters of this book addresses a picture of prominent historical figures connected with the formation and existence of the Czechoslovak Republic; Milan Rastislav Štefánik, the first president Tomáš Garrigue Masaryk and his son Jan Masaryk in oral prosaic tradition. The real historical personalities of modern political and social life of the 20th century, reflected in ideas of diverse groups of rural and urban populations, connect the historical experience with myths, cult, local folklore as well as positive and negative influences of contemporary interpretations of history. The field investigation of the collective narratives shows that the main criteria for the selection of these personalities were their folk character, its moral credit and its status of victim and they were created as collective symbols. The relationship to such symbols in some way reflects the history of a nation or state and facilitates the continuity of the present with the past pointing at the same time to the future.
SLOVENSKÝ NÁRODOPIS
62 / 2014

EDITORIÁLY

KREKOVIČOVÁ, Eva: Editorial .................. 158
PACK, Sam: Editorial – From Visual Anthropology to the Anthropology of the Visual ........................................ 466
POPELKOVÁ, Katarína: Editoriál ............ 311
POTANČOK, Vladimír: Editoriál ............. 5

ŠTÚDIE

JANEČEK, Petr: Bloody Mary or Krvavá Máří? Globalization and Czech children’s folklore ................................................................. 221
JANTO, Juraj: Verejný priestor v procese kultúrnej akcelerácie ....................... 45
KROPEJ, Monika: Narrative Tradition of King Matthias in the Process of Transformation ...................................................... 244
MAUR, Norbert: Pragmatické a esencialistické identity v usudzovaní o sociálnych skupinách medzi vedcami .............. 7
NÁDASKÁ, Katarína: Mariánske náboženské púte ako jeden z významných pilierov ľudovej religiozity ......................... 335
PANÁKOVÁ, Jaroslava: The Grave Portraits and Ancestralization of the Dead (The Case of New Chaplino) .................... 505
PAVLICOVÁ, Martina: Folklore Traditions in Contemporary Everyday Life: Between Continuity and (Re)construction (based on two examples from the Czech Republic) ... 163
PEŠTANSKÁ, Zuzana: Židovstvo v asimilované nukleárnej rodine tretej poholokausťovej generácie ........................................ 30
POPELKOVA, Katarína: K otázke dynamiky sociálnych funkcí mestského sviatku: oberačkové slávnosti .................................. 313
SALVADOR-AMORES, Analyn: Marking Bodies, Tattooing Identities: Comparative Study on the Traditional Tattoos of the Kalinga, northern Luzon, Philippines and the Atayal of Taiwan .................................................. 473
ŠRIMPF, Katarina: Creating “the Other” through the narrative tradition in the Slovenian-Croatian border area of Upper Obsotelje .................................................... 197
UHLÍKOVÁ, Lucie: Folklore Traditions in Contemporary Everyday Life: Between Continuity and (Re)construction (based on two examples from the Czech Republic) ...................................................... 163
URBANCOVÁ, Hana: Laments and Farewell Hymns as Two Traditional Genres of Funeral Singing ......................................... 209

MATERIÁLY

BALUCHOVÁ, Božena: Ako slovenskej verejnosti mediálne podávať informácie z rozvojových krajín ................................................. 71
BELIŠOVÁ, Jana: Roma Lament Songs in the Past and today ........................................ 259
BENUŠKOVÁ, Zuzana: Stužková slávnosť v dynamike vývoja od 30. rokov 20. storočia ..................................................... 363
BLAHOVÁ, Natália: Nadácia Pontis, vznik a vývoj nadácie v kontexte formovania mimovládneho neziskového sektora na Slovensku .................................................. 88
BUMOVÁ, Ivica: Tajná správa o Slovensku. Dokument z prostredia českých štátne-bezpečnostných zložiek (1947) ................. 59
VRZGULOVÁ, Monika: Spomínanie na holokaust. Pamätný deň obetí holokaustu a rasového násilia (9. 9.) ...................... 382

DISKUSIE
ČECHOVSKÁ, Lucie: Etnická identita Romů v akademických konfrontáciach. Pole etnicity jako nejasný prostor pro vstup do debaty o etnické identitě Romů .......... 106
DOMOKOS, Marianne: Methodological Issues in Electronic Folklore .......................... 283
SOUKUP, Martin: Photography and Drawings in Anthropology .................................. 534

ESEJE
BEŇOVÁ, Kamila: Bourdieuov náčrt jednej auto-analýzy: recenzia, ktorá sa nepoda-rila ........................................................................ 119
PACK, Sam: K-popped: South Korean Media Exports in the Phillipines ......................... 522
SALNER, Peter: Kto zachránil ľudský život, zachránil celý svet? ........................................ 399

ROZHOVORY
BENUŠKOVÁ, Zuzana: Visions of Visual Ethnography (Interview with Prof. Dr. Naško Križnar, research advisor) ........... 547
JURISOVÁ, Daniela: Visions of Visual Ethnography (Interview with Prof. Dr. Naško Križnar, research advisor) ........... 547

ROZHLADY – SPRÁVY – GLOSYS
BENŽA, Mojmír: Tancovala by som, bosá som...: Z histórie ľudovej obuvi na Slovensku (Galéria ÚĽUV-u, Bratislava, 15. 5. – 13. 9. 2014) ................................................................. 431
BENUŠKOVÁ, Zuzana: Za Ing. arch. Igorom Thurzom (15. 8. 1933 – 17. 2. 2014) ..... 129
ELSCHEK, Oskár: Tibor Szabó (1936 – 2014) – fotograf a dokumentarista slovenskej ľudovej kultúry ................................. 413
FERKLOVÁ, Daša: Nová elektronická encyklopédia na internete – Ľudový odev na Slovensku ................................................. 433
GRAUZELOVÁ, Táňa: Konferencia Experimenty v teréne a etnografia: metodologické prístupy (16. – 17. jún 2014, Bratislava) .... 429
HLOŠKOVÁ, Hana: Prof. PhDr. Bohuslav Beneš, DrSc. nás opustil (* 20. 10. 1927 Brno, † 23. 7. 2014 Modrice) ....................... 412
HLOŠKOVÁ, Hana: K životnému jubileu PhDr. Zory Vanovičovej – nevšedného a vzácneho človeka ........................................ 422
JÁGEROVÁ, Margita: Pastierska a ovčiarska tematika v Obecnom múzeu v Nových Sadoch .................................................. 434
JANEČEK, Petr: „Perspectives on Contemporary Legend. The International Society for Contemporary Legend Research, 32nd International Conference“ (3rd of June – 8th of June, 2014, Faculty of Arts, Charles University in Prague, Czech Republic) ..... 298
KLEPÁČOVÁ, Nora: Stanislav Dúžek a jeho podiel na projekte Ludové tance slovenských regiónov (K 80-tinám PhDr. Stanislava Dúžeka, CSc.) .................................. 418
LUTHER, Daniel: Blahoželanie k šesťdesiatke Mgr. Dušana Raticu, CSc. .......................... 131
PANCZOVÁ, Zuzana: Visual Encounters with Other in Tartu (7th of May – 9th of May, 2014, Tartu, Estonia) ........................................... 300
PODOLINSKÁ, Táňa: K životnému jubileu PhDr. Zory Vanovičovej – nevšedného a vzácneho človeka ........................................ 422
POPELKOVÁ, Katarína: Juraj Zajonc slávi pätdesiatku! .............................................. 133
POTANČOK, Vladimír: Cena Romipen pre PhDr. Arneho Manna, CSc. .......................... 436
STOLIČNÁ, Rastislava: PhDr. Jan Souček (1946 – 2014) .............................................. 130
VOĽANSKÁ, Ľubica: International conference Video documenting of the intangible cultural heritage and short videos for ICH research (25th – 26th September 2014, Slovene ethnographic museum, Ljubljana) ..................... 567
VRZGULOVÁ, Monika: Workshop a konferencia Jews and Gentiles in East Central Europe/ Židia a nežidia vo východnej a strednej Európe (26. 5. – 30. 5. – workshop, 31. 5. – 1. 6. – konferencia, Praha) ..................... 427
ZAJONC, Juraj: PhDr. Juraj Zajonc, CSc., výberová personálna bibliografia 1987 – 2013 ...................................................... 135
ZAJONC, Juraj: NESAT XII (21. – 24. máj 2014, Hallstatt) ............................................. 424

RECEZIE / ANOTÁCIE

BAGÍN, Vojtech: Miloš Jesenský a kol.: Gorali. Veľká kniha o Goraloch Oravy, Liptova a Kysúc .......................................................... 149
BAGÍN, Vojtech: Janina Hajduk-Nijakowska (Ed.): Praktikowanie tradycji w społeczeństwach posttradicyjnych ............ 450
BENČAŤOVÁ, Denisa: Ivan Murín: Neverbálna komunikácia v ritualizovanom správaní .................................................. 151
BOCÁNOVÁ, Martina: Pavel Popelka, Walerian Bugel, Jana A. Nováková: Podoby víry (výstava a publikačia) ......................... 152
BOTÍK, Ján: Beskydy. Stavby a život v nich, Beskydy. Zdroj práce a obživy, Beskydy. Dny všední i sváteční ......................... 440
BOTÍKOVÁ, Marta: Narodenie a rané detstvo v kultúrne – historickej a etnologickej perspektíve; Zita Deáky: „Jó kisfiúk és leánykák“. A kisgyermekkor történeti néprajza Magyarországon .................... 445
DROPPOVÁ, Lubica: Eva Krekovicová, Vladimír Potančok (Ed.): Personálna bibliografia PhDr. Sone Burlasovej, DrSc. ... 302
MACKOVÁ, Veronika: Sak a Kolesárová: Sociologie stáťí a seniorů; Bútová a kol.: Štvrtý rozmer tretieho veku. Desať kapitol o aktívnom starnutí ........................................ 142
MECHUROVÁ, Zdenka: Julie Hubenáková, 579
Martin Soukup: Nungon People of Uruwa. Drawings of Papua New Guinea ........ 572
PANCZOVÁ, Zuzana: Ullrich Kockel, Máiréad Nic Craith, Jonas Frykman (Eds.): A Companion to the Anthropology of Europe .. 305
PEKAŘOVÁ, Katarína: Narodenie a rané detstvo v kultúrno – historickej a etnologickej perspektíve; Zita Deáky: „Jó kisfiúk és leánykák“. A kisgyermekkor történeti néprajza Magyarországon ................ 445
PEŠŤANSKÁ, Zuzana: Peter Salner: The Jewish Identity in Slovakia after the Shoah ..... 303
SEKERÁKOVÁ BÚRIKOVÁ, Zuzana: Miloslav Bahna: Migrácia zo Slovenska po vstupe do Európskej únie ......................... 458
SLAVKOVSKÝ, Peter: Encyklopédia Beliana, 7. zväzok ........................................... 437
THURZO, Igor: Pavol Mešťan: Jeruzalem – duchovná metropolia sveta, návrat na javisko dejín .............................................. 154
VARCHOLOVÁ, Nadežda: Orest Zilynskyj: Ukrajinské ľudové balady východného Slovenska ............................................. 442
VOLANSKÁ, Ľubica: Tomáš Berka, Ján M. Bahna: Vily nad Bratislavou ............... 147
TUŽINSKÁ, Helena: Michal Pavlásek, Jana Nosková (Eds.): Když výzkum, tak kvalitativní. Serpentinami bádaní v terénu .... 456
CONTENTS OF THE 62nd VOLUME

EDITORIALS

KREKOVIČOVÁ, Eva: Editorial .................. 158
PACK, Sam: Editorial – From Visual Anthropology to the Anthropology of the Visual ....................... 466
POPELKOVÁ, Katarína: Editoriál .............. 311
POTANČOK, Vladimír: Editoriál ............... 5

ARTICLES

JANEČEK, Petr: Bloody Mary or Krvavá Máří? Globalization and Czech children’s folklore ............................................. 221
JANTO, Juraj: Public Space in the Process of Cultural Acceleration ......................... 45
KROPEJ, Monika: Narrative Tradition of King Matthias in the Process of Transformation ......................... 244
MAUR, Norbert: Pragmatic and Essentialist Identities in the Reasoning about Social Groups among Scientists .................. 7
NÁDASKÁ, Katarína: Marian Religious Pilgrimages as an Important Pillar of Folk Religiousness ........................ 335
PANÁKOVÁ, Jaroslava: The Grave Portraits and Ancestralization of the Dead (The Case of New Chaplino) ................ 505
PAVLICOVÁ, Martina: Folklore Traditions in Contemporary Everyday Life: Between Continuity and (Re)construction (based on two examples from the Czech Republic) ... 163
PEŠŤANSKÁ, Zuzana: Jewishness in an Assimilated Nuclear Family of the Third Post-Holocaust Generation .................. 30
POPELKOVÁ, Katarína: On the Dynamics of the Social Functions of an Urban Feast: Grape Harvest Festival ..................... 313
SALVADOR-AMORES, Analyn: Marking Bodies, Tattooing Identities: Comparative Study on the Traditional Tattoos of the Kalinga, northern Luzon, Philippines and the Atayal of Taiwan ......................... 473
ŠRIMPF, Katarina: Creating “the Other” through the narrative tradition in the Slovenian-Croatian border area of Upper Obsotelje ........................................ 197
UHLÍKOVÁ, Lucie: Folklore Traditions in Contemporary Everyday Life: Between Continuity and (Re)construction (based on two examples from the Czech Republic) ... 209

RESEARCH REPORTS

BALUCHOVÁ, Boba: How to Present Information on Developing Countries to the Slovak Public through Media ................ 71
BELIŠOVÁ, Jana: Roma Lament Songs in the Past and Today ......................... 259
BENUŠKOVÁ, Zuzana: Graduation Ceremony in the Dynamics of Development since the 1930s ..................... 363
BLAHOVÁ, Natália: The Establishment and the Development of the Pontis Foundation in the Context of the Formation of the Non-Governmental Non-Profit Sector in Slovakia ......................... 88
VRZGULOVÁ, Monika: Remembering the Holocaust. Holocaust Memorial Day in Slovakia (9. 9.) ................... 382

DISCUSSION

ČECHOVSKÁ, Lucie: Ethnic Identity of the Roma in Academic Confrontations. The Ethnicity Field as an Unclear Space for En-
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ESSAYS</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BEŇOVÁ, Kamila:</td>
<td>Bourdie’s Sketch for an Self-Analysis: a Failed Review ...................................... 119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PACK, Sam:</td>
<td>K-popped: South Korean Media Exports in the Phillipines ........................................ 522</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SALNER, Peter:</td>
<td>Did the One Who Saved a Life Save the Entire World? ............................................. 399</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INTERVIEWS</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BEŇUŠKOVÁ, Zuzana:</td>
<td>Visions of Visual Ethnography (Interview with Prof. Dr. Naško Križnar, research advisor) ........ 547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JURISOVÁ, Daniela:</td>
<td>Visions of Visual Ethnography (Interview with Prof. Dr. Naško Križnar, research advisor) ........ 547</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NEWS/OVERVIEWS</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BENŽA, Mojmír:</td>
<td>Tancovala by som, bosá som...: From the History of Folk Footwear in Slovakia (15 May – 13 September 2014, ÚĽUV Gallery, Bratislava) ..................................... 431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEŇUŠKOVÁ, Zuzana:</td>
<td>Remembering Ing. arch. Igor Thurzo (15 August 1933 – 17 February 2014) ................................... 129</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RESEARCH</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DOMOKOS, Marianne:</td>
<td>Methodological Issues in Electronic Folklore ......................................................... 283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOUKUP, Martin:</td>
<td>Photography and Drawings in Anthropology .............................................................. 534</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TANDEM PUBLISHING</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FERKLOVÁ, Daša:</td>
<td>The New Electronic Encyclopaedia on the Internet – Folk Costumes in Slovakia .................. 433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRAUZELOVÁ, Táňa:</td>
<td>Conference Field Experiments and Ethnography: Methodological Approaches (16 – 17 June 2014, Bratislava) ........................................... 429</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HLOŠKOVÁ, Hana:</td>
<td>Prof. PhDr. Bohuslav Beneš, DrSc. Has Left Us (* 20. 10. 1927 Brno, † 23. 7. 2014 Modřice) ............ 412</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCES</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ELSCHEK, Oskár: Tibor Szabó (1936–2014) – Photographer and Documentarian of Slovak Folk Culture .................. 413</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KLEPÁČOVÁ, Nora: Stanislav Dúžek and His Participation in the Project The Folk Dances of Slovak Regions (on the occasion of the 80th birthday of PhDr. Stanislav Dúžek, CSc.) .......................... 418</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MEMORIALS</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HLÔŠKOVÁ, Hana:</td>
<td>On the Jubilee of PhDr. Zora Vanovičová – an Exceptional and Precious Person ................. 422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JÁGEROVÁ, Margita:</td>
<td>Shepherd topics in the Municipal Museum in Nové Sady .............................................. 434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JANEČEK, Petr:</td>
<td>„Perspectives on Contemporary Legend. The International Society for Contemporary Legend Research, 32nd International Conference“ (3rd of June – 8th of June, 2014, Faculty of Arts, Charles University in Prague, Czech Republic) ........... 298</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OTHER EVENTS</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>POPELKOVÁ, Katarína:</td>
<td>Juraj Zajonc celebrating his 50th birthday! .................. 133</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INTERNATIONAL SOCIETIES</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>POPELKOVÁ, Katarína:</td>
<td>Juraj Zajonc celebrating his 50th birthday! .................. 133</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ANNOUNCEMENTS</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>POTANČOK, Vladimír:</td>
<td>Romipen Prize for PhDr. Arne Mann, CSc. ........................................ 435</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
STOLIČNÁ, Rastislava: PhDr. Jan Souček (1946 – 2014) .................................. 130
VOĽANSKÁ, Ľubica: International conference Video documenting of the intangible cultural heritage and short videos for ICH research (25th – 26th September 2014, Slovene ethnographic museum, Ljubljana) ... 456
ZAJONC, Juraj: PhDr. Juraj Zajonc, CSc., A selection of his personal bibliography 1987 – 2013 ........................................... 135
ZAJONC, Juraj: NESAT XII (21 – 24 May 2014, Hallstatt) .................................. 424

BOOK REVIEWS/REVIEW ESSAYS

BAGÍN, Vojtech: Miloš Jesenský a kol.: Gorali. Veľká kniha o Goraloch Oravy, Liptova a Kysúc .................................................. 149
BAGÍN, Vojtech: Janina Hajduk-Nijakowska (Ed.): Praktykowanie tradycji w społeczeństwach posttradycyjnych ............. 450
BENČAŤOVÁ, Denisa: Ivan Murín: Neverbálna komunikácia v ritualizovanom správaní ...................................................... 151
BOCÁNOVÁ, Martina: Pavel Popelka, Walerian Bugel, Jana A. Nováková: Podoby víry (výstava a publikácia) .................... 152
BOTÍK, Ján: Beskydy. Stavby a život v nich, Beskydy. Zdroj práce a obživy, Beskydy. Dny všední i sváteční ...................... 440
BOTÍKOVÁ, Marta: Birth and Early Childhood from a Cultural, Historic and Ethnological Perspective; Zita Deáky: „Jó kisfiúk és leánykák“. A kisgyermekkor történeti néprajza Magyarországon ............ 445
DROPOVÁ, Lubica: Eva Krekovičová, Vladimír Potančok (Ed.): Personálna bibliografia PhDr. Sone Burlasovej, DrSc. .... 302
DŮŽEK, Stanislav: Martina Pavlicová: Cesta mi lidového tance. Zdenka Jelínková a česká etnochoreologie ..................... 145
MACKOVÁ, Veronika: Sak a Kolesárová: Socioologie stáří a seniorů; Bútorová a kol.: Štvrtý rozmer tretieho veku. Desať kapitol o aktívnom starnutí. .................... 142
MECHUROVÁ, Zdenka: Martin Soukup, Julie Hubeňáková: Nungon People of Uruwa. Drawings of Papua New Guinea ........ 572
PANCZOVÁ, Zuzana: Ulrich Kockel, Máiread Nic Craith, Jonas Frykman (Eds.): A Companion to the Anthropology of Europe ... 305
PEKAŘOVÁ, Katarína: Birth and Early Childhood from a Cultural, Historic and Ethnological Perspective; Zita Deáky: „Jó kisfiúk és leánykák“. A kisgyermekkor történeti néprajza Magyarországon ............ 445
PEŠŤANSKÁ, Zuzana: Peter Salner: The Jewish Identity in Slovakia after the Shoah ..... 303
SEKERÁKOVÁ BÚRIKOVÁ, Zuzana: Miloslav Bahna: Migrácia zo Slovenska po vstupe do Európskej únie ............................. 458
SLAVKOVSKÝ, Peter: Encyklopédia Beliana, 7. zväzok ........................................ 437
THURZO, Igor: Pavol Mešťan: Jeruzalem – duchovná metropola sveta, návrat na javisko dejín ...................... 154
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VARCHOLOVÁ, Nadežda</td>
<td>Orest Zilinskyj: Ukrajinské ľudové balady východného Slovenska</td>
<td>442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VOĽANSKÁ, Ľubica</td>
<td>Tomáš Berka, Ján M. Bahna: Vily nad Bratislavou</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VOĽANSKÁ, Ľubica, Jana Nosková, Jana Čermáková (Eds.)</td>
<td>„Měla jsem moc krásné dětství“. Vzpomínky německých obyvatel Brna na dětství a mládí ve 20. – 40. letech 20. století / „Ich hatte eine sehr schöne Kindheit.“ Erinnerungen von Brünner Deutschen an ihre Kindheit und Jugend in den 1920er – 1940er Jahren</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TUŽINSKÁ, Helena</td>
<td>Michal Pavlásek, Jana Nosková (Eds.): Když výzkum, tak kvalitativní. Serpentinami bádaní v terénu</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>